

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MEETING MINUTES FOR  
THE BOARD OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY  
OF  
LOUISIANA ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT  
HELD AT  
LASALLE BUILDING  
617 NORTH 3RD STREET  
LABELLE ROOM  
BATON ROUGE, LOUISIANA  
ON THE 28TH DAY OF FEBRUARY, 2018  
COMMENCING AT 9:34 A.M.

REPORTED BY: ELICIA H. WOODWORTH, CCR

THE BOARD OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY

1     **Appearances of Board Members Present:**

2     Robert Adley  
3     Millie Atkins  
4     Robert Barham  
5     Mayor Glenn Brasseaux  
6     Representative Thomas Carmody  
7     Major Coleman  
8     Manuel "Manny" Fajardo  
9     Jerald Jones  
10    Heather Malone  
11    Senator Ronnie Johns for Danny Martiny  
12    Charles R. "Robby" Miller  
13    Jan K. Moller  
14    Secretary Don Pierson  
15    Ronnie Slone  
16    Bobby Williams, Jr.  
17    Steve Windham  
18    Dr. Woodrow Wilson, Jr.

19    **Staff members present:**

20    Tam Bourgeois  
21    Eric Burton  
22    Kristen Cheng  
23    Danielle Clapinski  
24    Frank Favaloro  
25    Brenda Guess  
26    Richard House  
27    Becky Lambert  
28    Mandi Mitchell  
29    Joyce Metoyer  
30    Melissa Sorrell  
31    Hud Usie  
32    Anne Villa



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

I'd like to call this meeting to order.  
So the meeting of the Board of Commerce and Industry for  
February 28th is called to order at 9:35 a.m.

I believe our first order of business  
will be rollcall by Ms. Sorrell.

MS. SORRELL:

Robert Adley.

MR. WINDHAM:

Here.

MS. SORRELL:

Robert Barham.

MR. BARHAM:

Here.

MS. SORRELL:

Representative Devillier for  
Representative Abramson.

(No response.)

MS. SORRELL:

Millie Atkins.

MS. ATKINS:

Here.

MS. SORRELL:

Mayor Brasseaux.

MAYOR BRASSEAU:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Here.

MS. SORRELL:

Representative Carmody.

SECRETARY PIERSON:

Let the record reflect Representative Carmody has contacted us and asked us to recuse his absence today as he is serving in the legislator.

MS. SORRELL:

Yvette Cola.

(No response.)

MS. SORRELL:

Major Coleman.

(No response.)

MS. SORRELL:

Rickey Fabra.

(No response.)

MS. SORRELL:

Manny Fajardo.

MR. FAJARDO:

Here.

MS. SORRELL:

Jerald Jones.

MR. JONES:

Here.

MS. SORRELL:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                                   Heather Malone.  
2                                   MS. MALONE:  
3                                   Here.  
4                                   MS. SORRELL:  
5                                   Senator Ronnie Johns for Senator  
6 Martiny.  
7                                   MR. JOHNS:  
8                                   Here.  
9                                   MS. SORRELL:  
10                                  Robby Miller.  
11                                  MR. MILLER:  
12                                  Here.  
13                                  MS. SORREL:  
14                                  Jan Moller.  
15                                  MR. MOLLER:  
16                                  Here.  
17                                  MS. SORRELL:  
18                                  Senator Chabert.  
19                                  (No response.)  
20                                  MS. SORRELL:  
21                                  Secretary Pierson.  
22                                  SECRETARY PIERSON:  
23                                  Present.  
24                                  MS. SORRELL:  
25                                  Scott Richard.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 (No response.)  
2 MS. SORRELL:  
3 Darrel Saizan.  
4 (No response.)  
5 MS. SORRELL:  
6 Daniel Shexnayder.  
7 (No response.)  
8 MS. SORRELL:  
9 Ronnie Slone.  
10 MR. SLONE:  
11 Here.  
12 MS. SORRELL:  
13 Bobby Williams.  
14 MR. WILLIAMS:  
15 Here.  
16 MS. SORRELL:  
17 Steve Windham.  
18 MR. WINDHAM:  
19 Here.  
20 MS. SORRELL:  
21 Dr. Wilson.  
22 DR. WILSON:  
23 Here.  
24 MS. SORRELL:  
25 We have a quorum.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

All right. Thank you, Ms. Sorrell.

I do need to point out, because we're back in this building, we are live streaming. We have a gentleman over here taking care of that piece of it, but we need to make sure that when we speak, if we have any questions or comments or observations, that we need to pull the microphones down in front of us.

With that said, I will move on to ask if anyone would like to move for the approval of the minutes from last meeting?

MR. SLONE:

I move.

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion by Mr. Slone; second by Dr. Wilson.

Any questions, comments, observations?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

(Several members respond "aye.")

MR. WINDHAM:

All opposed with a "nay."

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Motion carries.

2 Next we have Mr. Eric Burton with the  
3 Quality Jobs Program. Mr. Burton.

4 MR. BURTON:

5 Good morning. I have six new  
6 applications for Quality Jobs. 20161677, A.S.A.P.  
7 Industries Manufacturing, LLC; 20160741, BBQ Guys  
8 Manufacturing, LLC; 20170253, CellXion, LLC, dba Sabre  
9 Industries Building Systems by CellXion; 20161821,  
10 LeMoyen Mill & Timber, LLC; 20170398, Lotte Chemical  
11 Louisiana, LLC; and 20151049, TCI Packaging, LLC.

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 Thank you, Mr. Burton.

14 Are there any questions from any of the  
15 Board members concerning of any the applications?

16 (No response.)

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Are there any questions or comments from  
19 the public concerning any of these applications?

20 (No response.)

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Is there a motion to approve?

23 Motion made by Mayor Broussard; seconded  
24 by Mr. Fajardo. I never get his name right.

25 MR. FAJARDO:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Fajardo.

MR. WINDHAM:

Manny. Fajardo. I'm getting closer.

All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

(Several members respond "aye.")

MR. WINDHAM:

All opposed with a "nay."

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion carries.

MR. BURTON:

Next item up is going to be Quality Jobs  
Renewals. We have two renewals. 20121249, America's  
Auto Auction Baton Rouge, Inc., East Baton Rouge Parish;  
20120245, BASF Corporation in Ascension Parish.

This concludes the renewals.

MR. WINDHAM:

Are there any questions for those  
renewals of any of the Board members?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Comments from any members of the  
audience?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Is there a motion to approve?  
2                   Made by Mr. Slone; seconded by Dr.  
3 Wilson.

4                   All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
5 (Several members respond "aye.")

6 MR. WINDHAM:  
7                   All opposed with a "nay."  
8 (No response.)

9 MR. WINDHAM:  
10                  Motion carries.

11 MR. BURTON:  
12                  I have two specials on the agenda. A  
13 request in change of name only for the following  
14 contract: 20100919, from Great Southern Galvanizing,  
15 Inc. dba Great States Galvanizing to Great Southern  
16 Galvanizing, LLC dba Great States Galvanizing in East  
17 Baton Rouge Parish.

18                  I also have a request in change of  
19 ownership only for the following contract: Contract  
20 20121249, from ABC Baton Rouge, LLC to America's Auto  
21 Auction Baton Rouge, Inc. in East Baton Rouge Parish.

22 MR. WINDHAM:  
23                  Thank you, Mr. Burton.

24                  Are there any questions or comments from  
25 the Board members concerning the name change or the



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 request in ownership change?

2 (No response.)

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 Any comments from the public?

5 (No response.)

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 Is there a motion to approve?

8 Made by Representative Johns; seconded  
9 by Mr. Jones.

10 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

11 (Several members respond "aye.")

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 All opposed with a "nay."

14 (No response.)

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Motion carries.

17 MR. BURTON:

18 This concludes Quality Jobs.

19 MR. WINDHAM:

20 Thank you, Mr. Burton.

21 Next on deck we have Ms. Becky Lambert  
22 to do the Restoration Tax Abatement Program.

23 MS. LAMBERT:

24 Good morning.

25 MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Good morning.

2 MS. LAMBERT:

3 We have five new applications for  
4 Restoration Tax Abatement, for which all have met the  
5 local requirements prior to receiving approval to be  
6 placed on the agenda. We have received local  
7 resolutions approving all.

8 The first one is 201615828, 801 Magazine  
9 Street in New Orleans; 20141099, Bradshaw Family, LLC in  
10 Orleans; 20170233, Brentwood Acquisition - Shreveport,  
11 Inc., Caddo; 20170018, Georgia Tucker, LLC, Ouachita;  
12 20170016, Monroe Development, LLC, Ouachita, for a total  
13 investment of \$19,933,758.

14 This concludes the applications.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Are there any questions from any of the  
17 Board members concerning the applications for  
18 Restoration Tax Abatement?

19 (No response.)

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 Any comments from the public?

22 (No response.)

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 Do I have a motion to approve?

25 Made by Dr. Wilson; seconded by Ms.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Heather.

2 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
3 (Several members respond "aye.")

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 All opposed with a "nay."  
6 (No response.)

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 Motion carries.

9 MS. LAMBERT:

10 We have one special request to correct  
11 the construction ending date on a contract that has  
12 already been approved by the Board on October 25th,  
13 2017.

14 RTA 20161637, Market Street Shreveport,  
15 LLC. This contract was approved with an estimated  
16 construction ending date of October 17th, 2017. The  
17 correct estimated construction date is actually for  
18 2018, October 15th, 2018. The company recognized the  
19 error after the contract was fully executed and notified  
20 LED staff to request a correction. It is required that  
21 any changes to an approved contract be approved by the  
22 Board. So with Board approval, the contract will be  
23 reissued with the revised estimated construction date to  
24 reflect the company's correct date of October 15th,  
25 2018.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. WINDHAM:

2 And this has been reviewed by legal  
3 staff, no problems or anything with it?

4 MS. LAMBERT:

5 There are no issues with the -- and it's  
6 really -- it's relatively -- it was basically a  
7 typographical error on the company's part, and they  
8 recognized it when they were signing the documents.

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 All right. Are there any other  
11 questions?

12 Motion's made by Mr. Jones to approve;  
13 second by Secretary Barham.

14 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
15 (Several members respond "aye.")

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 All opposed with a "nay."  
18 (No response.)

19 MR. WINDHAM:

20 Motion carries.

21 MS. LAMBERT:

22 All right. This concludes the RTA  
23 requests for this meeting.

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 Thank you, Ms. Lambert.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Ms. Metoyer, the Enterprise Zone Program  
2 presented by Ms. Joyce Metoyer.

3 MS. METOYER:

4 Good morning.

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 Good morning.

7 MS. METOYER:

8 I have 10 new applications.

9 First one is 20161499, CDG Energy, LLC  
10 in Rapides Parish; 20150157, Metairie Hotel Ventures,  
11 LLC, Orleans Parish; 20150863, New Hotel Monteleone, LLC  
12 dba Hotel Monteleone, Orleans Parish; 20150864,  
13 Palmisano Contractors, LLC, Orleans Parish; 20150193,  
14 Providence Classical Academy, Incorporated, Bossier  
15 Parish; 20151375, Sai Ram Lodging, LLC, Ouachita Parish;  
16 20141318, Shree Madhav, LLC, East Baton Rouge Parish;  
17 20150949, The Kroger, Company, Calcasieu Parish;  
18 20131435, University Medical Center Management, Corp.,  
19 Orleans Parish; and 20131330, Vantage Health Plan,  
20 Incorporated, Ouachita Parish.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Thank you, Ms. Metoyer.

23 Are there any questions of any of the  
24 Board members for the Enterprise Zone applications?

25 (No response.)



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

Any comments from the public for the  
Enterprise Zone applications?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Is there a motion?

Motion's made by Mr. Slone to approve;  
seconded by President Miller.

All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

(Several members respond "aye.")

MR. WINDHAM:

Any opposed with a "nay."

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion carries.

MS. METOYER:

I have five termination requests.  
20131101, Summit Credits, LLC, Livingston Parish. Their  
existing contract period is 8/23/2013 to 8/22 of 2018.  
The requested term date is 8/22 of 2015. The program  
requirements have been met. No additional jobs are  
anticipated; 20120206, Associated Grocers, Incorporated,  
East Baton Rouge Parish. Existing contract period  
1/28/2013 to 1/27 of 2018. The requested term date is  
7/28 of 2015. The program requirements have been met.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 No additional jobs are anticipated; 20071374, Stirling  
2 Properties, LLC, St. Tammany Parish. The existing  
3 period is 7/1 of 2013 to 6/30 of 2018. The requested  
4 term date is 12/31 of 2016. Program requirements have  
5 been met. No additional jobs are anticipated; 20110863,  
6 Royal Orleans Hotel Partners, LLC, Orleans Parish.  
7 8/1/2012 to 7/31 of 2017 is the existing contract. The  
8 requested term date is January 31 of 2015. The program  
9 requirements have been met and no additional jobs are  
10 anticipated; and 20131123, Carondelet Partners, LLC,  
11 Orleans Parish. The existing contract period is 1/1  
12 2013 to 12/31 of 2019, and the requested term date is  
13 September 30, 2017. All requirements have been met. No  
14 additional jobs are anticipated.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Thank you, Ms. Metoyer.

17 Are there any questions or comments  
18 concerning the termination requests from the Board  
19 members?

20 (No response.)

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Any comments from the public concerning  
23 termination requests for Enterprise Zone contracts from  
24 the Board members?

25 (No response.)



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. WINDHAM:  
2 Is there a motion?  
3 Made by Mr. Williams; seconded by Ms.  
4 Atkins.

5 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
6 (Several members respond "aye.")

7 MR. WINDHAM:  
8 All opposed with a "nay."  
9 (No response.)

10 MR. WINDHAM:  
11 Motion carries.

12 MS. METOYER:  
13 I have one special request to delete an  
14 owner for from an existing contract. It's 20151855,  
15 Performance Contractors, Incorporated, East Baton Rouge  
16 Parish, and the owner that needs to be deleted is Brent  
17 Boe.

18 MR. WINDHAM:  
19 Can you give us an overview of what that  
20 effect has?

21 MS. METOYER:  
22 He sold his interest. He is no longer  
23 an owner.

24 MR. WINDHAM:  
25 All right. So he wouldn't receive any



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 future benefits?

2 MS. METOYER:

3 No.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 He may have received past benefits,  
6 though?

7 MS. METOYER:

8 It's possible, yes.

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 Possible.

11 Any questions from any of the Board  
12 members?

13 (No response.)

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 Any comments from the public?

16 (No response.)

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Is there a motion to approve?

19 Made by Mr. Slone; second by

20 Mr. Fajardo.

21 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

22 (Several members respond "aye.")

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 All opposed with a "nay."

25 (No response.)



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion carries.

MS. METOYER:

That concludes Enterprise Zone.

MR. WINDHAM:

Thank you, Ms. Metoyer.

MS. METOYER:

Thank you.

MR. WINDHAM:

Next up we have Ms. Cheng to do the Industrial Tax Exemption Program. Ms. Kristin Cheng.

MS. CHENG:

Good morning.

MR. WINDHAM:

Good morning.

MS. CHENG:

I have 28 new applications with advances prior to the Executive Order on June 24th of 2016.

MR. WINDHAM:

Okay. Mr. Adley would like to make a suggestion.

MR. ADLEY:

I want to make a suggestion to the committee. Much to your surprise, I think we can probably get out of here pretty quickly today. At least



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 the Governor's office met with LED, unless all of you  
2 have questions, I doubt that you probably do, but if you  
3 do, we certainly welcome them, but we only have a couple  
4 of questions. I think we resolved all of the issues we  
5 had on the -- I think there's 28 of them, and if we  
6 could get those two questions clarified, we might be  
7 able to take these in globo.

8 MS. CHENG:

9 I have two I'd like to defer before you  
10 get to those questions.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 That will be fine. Please indicate  
13 which ones.

14 MS. CHENG:

15 The companies requested that 20161523,  
16 Kennedy Rice Dryers, LLC in Morehouse Parish be  
17 deferred, and 20150086, Monsanto Company in St. Charles  
18 Parish be deferred.

19 MR. WINDHAM:

20 Can you repeat the first one?

21 MS. CHENG:

22 20161523, Kennedy Rice Dryers, LLC in  
23 Morehouse Parish.

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 All right. So We have Kennedy Rice



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Dryers and Monsanto requesting deferral.

2 Any objections from anyone?

3 (No response.)

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 All right. Please proceed with your  
6 questions, Mr. Adley.

7 MR. ADLEY:

8 In the group there were two that didn't  
9 appear to give a clear description of what they were  
10 doing.

11 MS. CHENG:

12 Okay.

13 MR. ADLEY:

14 They simply list an addition. They  
15 described the manufacturing what they did, but not what  
16 they were adding. So if I could just ask, is Delta  
17 Terminal Services and DOW Chemical...

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 Do we have a representative from Delta  
20 Terminal Services with us today?

21 Please step forward. And, DOW, please  
22 be on deck.

23 Please identify yourself.

24 MR. LEONARD:

25 Hello. My name is Jimmy Leonard. I'm



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 with Advantous Consulting here on behalf of Delta  
2 Terminal Services.

3 MR. ADLEY:

4 The issue was pretty simple. You have a  
5 very good description of the process and what you were  
6 manufacturing, but you just simply said it was an  
7 addition, and we'd like to know what it was that you --  
8 what you added.

9 MR. LEONARD:

10 Yes, sir. The addition was process  
11 piping in order to move the finished product from the  
12 facility to the docking area.

13 MR. ADLEY:

14 Just piping?

15 MR. LEONARD:

16 Yes, sir, just piping.

17 MR. ADLEY:

18 Okay. Thank you.

19 MR. LEONARD:

20 Okay.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Any other questions for Delta?

23 MR. ADLEY:

24 No. And I ask these two questions, we'd  
25 ask our staff that when they send those applications, if



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 they don't have something telling us, it would be good  
2 if y'all go ahead and just ask them. They need to put  
3 them on the application. We don't even have to ask  
4 these questions, but there were only two.

5 The other one was DOW Chemical.

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 Thank you, Mr. Leonard.

8 MR. ADLEY:

9 They, too, had an addition, and I'm just  
10 curious what it was what they added.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Please identify yourself and who you  
13 represent.

14 MS. MYLES:

15 Lakeisha Myles with DOW Chemical.

16 MR. ADLEY:

17 Yes, ma'am. Can you just -- it was a  
18 good description, again, of the plant and what it does,  
19 but I didn't see a description of what the addition was.

20 MS. MYLES:

21 The addition is to add downstream  
22 derivative for the ethylene oxide at the Glycol II  
23 plant.

24 MR. ADLEY:

25 And so the equipment that was put in for



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 that would have been?

2 MS. MYLES:

3 For the downstream, the downstream part  
4 of the operations.

5 MR. ADLEY:

6 I got you. Do you have any idea what it  
7 was, the equipment that went in to do that?

8 MR. WINDHAM:

9 So when you say "downstream," is what  
10 you're saying -- is what you're describing the producer  
11 of the raw material within the facility or is it  
12 downstream and away from the operations altogether?

13 MS. MYLES:

14 No. It's within -- it's the downstream,  
15 the production, the operations within the facility.

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 So is it a unit?

18 MS. MYLES:

19 It looks like it's several. The  
20 request, it looks like it's several units that were  
21 placed in to add to the value preservation of the Glycol  
22 II plant.

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 And those units take the raw material  
25 that may either be imported or brought into the facility



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 or produced at another location within the facility and  
2 then they process that into another product?

3 MS. MYLES:

4 Yes, that's correct.

5 MR. ADLEY:

6 I still don't know what was added.

7 MR. MILLER:

8 I think Mr. Adley's question is what  
9 actual equipment. Like the previous one was piping.  
10 Was it pumps, piping, heat exchangers? I mean, what is  
11 it?

12 MR. ADLEY:

13 Does the staff know? I mean, do y'all  
14 have anything in file just...

15 I mean, knowing DOW, as we all do, I'm  
16 sure they added a lot of equipment, but when you put in  
17 these applications and give them to us and you don't  
18 tell us what it is, at some point, you have to give us  
19 an idea of what you're tax exempting, what is the piece  
20 of equipment that's being tax exempt.

21 MS. CHENG:

22 It looks like pressure temperature  
23 sensors, valves, steel, things that would make up a unit  
24 to -- riders, cables, something that would make up the  
25 unit to -- at the Glycol II facility.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. ADLEY:

So this is all one large piece of equipment, is that what this is?

MS. CHENG:

Yes.

MR. ADLEY:

Okay.

MS. CHENG:

It all makes up one (indicating).

MR. ADLEY:

Okay. All right. Thank you. That's the only question that we had of these, but it would really help us in the future, most of these applications, all of them have a description of what they added, but these two just, they didn't say anything. They just said an addition, and you need to know what the equipment is and what it is that's being tax exempt, that would help.

Thank you, ma'am.

MR. WINDHAM:

Thank you, ma'am.

I don't know if Melissa got Mr. Coleman, Major Coleman, his...

Okay. Make sure you get registered.

Are there any other questions on any of



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 the applications by any of the Board members?

2 MR. MOLLER:

3 Yes.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 Yes, please, Mr. Moller.

6 MR. MOLLER:

7 I have a question. We got some  
8 information right before this meeting, and I apologize,  
9 I haven't had the chance to go through it, but  
10 concerning the timing of some of the these applications.  
11 The rules that we adopted talk about these have to be  
12 filed no later than 90 days after the beginning of  
13 operations or the end of construction, and it seems like  
14 several of these were filed, you know, outside of that  
15 time. And, again, I haven't gone back and double  
16 checked that, but it seems like the one for Cameron LNG  
17 was 314 days after the project end date, CB&I Walker,  
18 144 days.

19 MS. CHENG:

20 In the rules, Section 523, it allows for  
21 an extension to the application due date.

22 MR. MOLLER:

23 So they have all received application  
24 extensions?

25 MS. CHENG:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Yes.

2 MR. MOLLER:

3 Okay.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 Are there any other questions by any of  
6 the Board members?

7 MR. MILLER:

8 One quick one. About the extensions,  
9 those are just done through LED?

10 MS. CHENG:

11 Yes.

12 MR. MILLER:

13 Great. Thank you.

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 So that's a staff extension, and it's  
16 perfectly within the guidelines.

17 Any other questions from any of the  
18 Board members?

19 MR. MOLLER:

20 Is there a limit on how many extensions  
21 of time they can get?

22 MS. CHENG:

23 No. If it goes past a certain -- if it  
24 goes past six months, we like to get a statement from  
25 the assessor saying that the assets haven't been taxed



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 because assets that have been taxed aren't eligible, but  
2 that's all.

3 MR. MOLLER:

4 And do they have to provide a reason, or  
5 is it just kind of --

6 MS. CHENG:

7 Sometimes they can't get their costs  
8 together in time or, you know, it varies from  
9 application to application.

10 MR. MOLLER:

11 Okay.

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 Are there any other questions by any of  
14 the Board members?

15 (No response.)

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 I believe we have a comment from the  
18 public concerning this.

19 Please step forward and identify  
20 yourself.

21 MR. BAGERT:

22 Broderick Bagert with Together  
23 Louisiana.

24 And it does go to the question of  
25 timing, but from the rule's perspective or a broader



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 perspective, what we are saying right now in this  
2 meeting is in order for an investment that was completed  
3 in December of 2016 to take place, it needs a public  
4 subsidy that won't be approved until 314 days after it  
5 has already taken place. This retroactive granting of  
6 subsidies that are still being called incentives is not  
7 practiced in other places. It's not the norm, and it  
8 breaks not just the rules of normal economic  
9 development, but the rules of causality, chronology and  
10 cause and effect, that these were completed so long ago  
11 is on one way the standard practice for how the program  
12 has operated. We think that is a serious concern and  
13 needs to be addressed more narrowly within the rules.

14 We wanted to know, did these, in fact,  
15 receive a specific request from each company before the  
16 filing deadline? Because there are some limits to  
17 extensions that are not automatically granted. They  
18 have to receive a specific request, according to 523,  
19 before the filing deadline has taken place. And did  
20 that take place so that is done the way that's in  
21 accordance with the rules?

22 MR. ADLEY:

23 But you don't -- if I heard you  
24 correctly, I didn't see a violation of the rule.

25 MR. BAGERT:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1           If the companies provided a request for  
2   an extension prior to the 90-day deadline, so that is to  
3   say if before 90 days has elapsed since project  
4   completion and they provide a request for an extension  
5   prior to those 90 days, then that's abiding by the rules  
6   if that extension is granted. If they don't request  
7   that extension within those 90 days, then they are in  
8   violation of the rules, and they're in violation of the  
9   rules as these applications go. So it wasn't clear, and  
10  that's just a question for the staff. We don't receive  
11  those extensions.

12           Did they, in fact, file an extension  
13  requesting -- or a request for an extension prior to the  
14  90-day deadline elapsing since the construct project had  
15  taken place?

16           MR. WINDHAM:

17           Ms. Cheng?

18           MS. CHENG:

19           If you can give me -- I don't even know  
20  which ones you're referring to. If you could give me a  
21  list, I can go back and check for you.

22           MR. BAGERT:

23           Right there.

24           MR. WINDHAM:

25           All right. So I don't think we are



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 going to able to do that at this meeting.

2 MR. ADLEY:

3 And then when she goes and checks and we  
4 find that, in accordance with the rule, that the rule  
5 was not followed, your view is it should not be  
6 approved, but if the rule was followed, clearly, I mean,  
7 it should be.

8 I guess I'm asking the staff or LED,  
9 somebody to give us some direction here. If there's  
10 question about whether or not they actually complied  
11 with the rule, if we approve them subject to  
12 verification that they did, is that plausible to do?

13 Richard, I guess you're the best guy to  
14 ask. I mean, it's pretty clear to me that she doesn't  
15 know here.

16 MS. CHENG:

17 Late applications can be considered  
18 with -- just like the late renewals, they can be  
19 considered with a penalty.

20 MR. ADLEY:

21 I understand, but we deal with the late  
22 application differently than we have with everybody  
23 else. If they complied with the rule and met all of the  
24 extension requirements, then I don't have a problem with  
25 what they're doing. If somebody didn't, then you've got



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 a different situation.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 All right. Before you say anything,  
4 Mr. Leonard, I believe Mr. Adley has a question for LED.

5 SECRETARY PIERSON:

6 I'll respond for LED.

7 If there's a request for a specific set  
8 of documents to verify that the rule was followed, we'll  
9 be happy to provide that, and we would ask that you  
10 submit that request and do it succinctly so that we can  
11 identify the specific contract numbers that you are  
12 requesting to see documentation on.

13 MR. ADLEY:

14 I guess the question is, I guess what  
15 he's -- I'm not speaking for him, but I guess the  
16 question is, let's say they made the request, and then  
17 when they made the request, the Board has already  
18 approved it and the documentation came back that it  
19 didn't follow the rules, what happens?

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 Mr. House or Ms. Clapinski, can you  
22 describe what happens when somebody breaches these  
23 contracts? And I mean, breaching by if you don't follow  
24 the rules, then the contract was never valid, I would  
25 think.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. HOUSE:

2 Well, I think we'd have to take a look  
3 at that in the entirety of the circumstances and what  
4 action would then be appropriate by the Board at that  
5 time. I'm not going to fly on the basis of Mr. Bagert's  
6 or anybody else's interpretation of the rules. We'll  
7 take a look at, number one, take a look at whether or  
8 not there is compliance either under the terms of the  
9 rules or his terms, or if they're the same, that's fine,  
10 too. But, secondly, we would also, at that point in  
11 time, if there's a problem, we'd assess the situation  
12 and provide you with an opinion on that.

13 MR. WINDHAM:

14 Thank you.

15 Mr. Adley, do you have another question?

16 MR. HOUSE:

17 I also would add, on the question  
18 whether or not you could provisionally approve something  
19 today, I think you could if you come up with the right  
20 words in the motion, but, again, that could be made  
21 subject to further review and the recommendation of  
22 counsel, if necessary.

23 MR. ADLEY:

24 Mr. Chairman, it appears that some of  
25 the people who have applications are trying to get to



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 that table. Maybe they can clarify it for us, and if --  
2 we just -- I think what we need here, we just need to  
3 clarify when we say we don't know, that makes it  
4 difficult.

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 Please identify yourself.

7 MR. LEONARD:

8 Yes, sir, Mr. Chairman. Jimmy Leonard  
9 with Advantous Consulting. I just want to make two  
10 comments for the record.

11 First comment is the Cameron LNG  
12 application was actually formally approved. The project  
13 was approved in 2013 for a \$9-billion-plus investment in  
14 the State of Louisiana. The assets in question are just  
15 pieces of equipment that went into service before the  
16 project was complete, and we've been working with LED  
17 for a number of months to properly document that  
18 activity and make sure that these assets only receive  
19 the 10-year term exemption that are due. So the project  
20 is still under construction, and it is not, as a  
21 project, formally complete.

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 Does that clear everything up for all of  
24 the Board members?

25 MR. LEONARD:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Yeah. So there is a contract that's  
2    been pre-approved for the project and --

3                   MR. WINDHAM:

4                   Because of the monetary volume of the  
5    contract, I remember a number of years back.

6                   MR. LEONARD:

7                   Because of the size of the investment  
8    and the timing and the construction timeline is what is  
9    causing this to come before us today.

10                  MR. WINDHAM:

11                  Certainly.

12                  And let me indicate to Ms. Sorrell that  
13    Representative Carmody is in the audience now.

14                  MR. CARMODY:

15                  Good morning. Thank you, sir.

16                  MR. WINDHAM:

17                  Any other questions from the Board  
18    members related to that concept from Mr. Leonard?

19                  (No response.)

20                  MR. WINDHAM:

21                  Second, I have someone else from the  
22    public that would like to address the scenario.

23                  Wow, Doug, you've got a new beard.

24                  MR. LEBLEU:

25                  Mr. Chairman, members of the Board, I



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 have a copy of an e-mail that I received from Ms. Cheng  
2 approving the extension of our application. Our request  
3 was made March 14th of 2017, and her response to our  
4 request was, "Doug, the extension to June 15th, 2017 has  
5 been granted for Advance Number 20151342, which is the  
6 application in question." I'd be happy to read our  
7 request. It's quite lengthy and detailed as to why  
8 we're asking for the extension. Would you like me to  
9 read it?

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 No.

12 MR. LEBLEU:

13 Good.

14 MR. JONES:

15 Who was the client?

16 MR. LEBLEU:

17 I'm sorry?

18 MR. JONES:

19 Who was your client?

20 MR. LEBLEU:

21 CB&I Walker. I'm sorry.

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 Are there questions from the Board  
24 members concerning Mr. LeBleu and his client, CB&I?

25 (No response.)



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

All right. Thank you, Mr. LeBleu.

MR. LEBLEU:

Thank you.

MR. WINDHAM:

Any other comments?

Yes. Please step forward and identify yourself again.

MR. BAGERT:

Once again, my name is Broderick Bagert. I'm with Together Louisiana. We withdraw the concern from CB&I. They clearly had the -- or it appears they had the request for an extension in a timely fashion.

On Cameron LNG, it's a bit of a different scenario. They've got this huge investment, one of the largest in the history of this country, but there are discreet projects for which they submit discreet applications with separate part numbers, and each of those has a project end date that's submitted in the application. The project end date indicated here is for the discreet part of the overall investment, and it's, at least by the company's own likes, their end of construction date.

So the fact that the project itself in the totality investment is ongoing and will be for many



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 years doesn't affect the part of it for which an  
2 exemptions being sought in this meeting.

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 All right. Thank you.

5 Are there any questions by any of the  
6 Board members for Mr. Broderick concerning this?

7 Please identify yourself.

8 MR. LEONARD:

9 Jimmy Leonard, Advantous Consulting.

10 Just for the record, this is not a  
11 discreet project. This is not an additional project.  
12 We are fitting facts and circumstances onto the  
13 documentation that LED provides us so that we can  
14 properly document the exemption. So this was not a  
15 separate project. This was not a smaller, discreet  
16 project inside of a bigger one. This just happened to  
17 be a number of items, it was a building and it was other  
18 pieces of equipment that went into service, and,  
19 therefore, should go on the tax rolls as exempt the year  
20 following it going into service.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 If I remember correctly from my days of  
23 being there, if a project has a -- the construction  
24 project has an extended period of time, this was one of  
25 the things to make sure that these projects don't



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 have -- and a unit goes online during the interment  
2 before the big picture project is completed, this was  
3 done to eliminate the possibility of extensions beyond  
4 10 years. Because if it's a two-year project and year  
5 one it gets started and you wait until the end, then  
6 that entity, that unit, would get an 11-year exemption.

7 MR. LEONARD:

8 That is absolutely correct. And with  
9 the application, there is an additional commentary that  
10 says, "Cameron LNG is constructing a  
11 multi-billion-dollar liquefaction manufacturing facility  
12 addition to their existing facility. The application is  
13 not for a separate or new project. This application is  
14 being filed for the sole purpose of properly assigning  
15 an exemption term to assets that went into service prior  
16 to completion of the project." This is information that  
17 was submitted with the application.

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 And it is part of the public records,  
20 which you should -- I mean, you have the ability to go  
21 and look at it; right, Mr. Broderick?

22 MR. BAGERT:

23 Yeah. And I think my meaning wasn't  
24 clear. I wasn't speaking to the nature of it. It is  
25 discreet enough to go into operation separately and have



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 its own application, which we entirely endorse because  
2 that does allow it to become taxable at a time when it's  
3 providing value and benefit to the company. But if it  
4 goes into operations in December of 2016, then you have  
5 90 days from that point to submit an application, and  
6 these were submitted 314 days after that.

7 That's the -- whether it's discreet or a  
8 part of it, that it has its own application and went  
9 into operations sets the date when the clock starts.

10 That's the --

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 I think I do need to point out that this  
13 application was submitted and approved on the front end  
14 because of the size of the investment.

15 MR. BAGERT:

16 Right.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 So an application has already been  
19 submitted. So when you say one needs to be submitted,  
20 it was when they started the \$9-billion investment from  
21 the ground up. Yeah. So it's been submitted.

22 MR. BAGERT:

23 You have our concerns around it. I  
24 mean, that if a separate application is submitted, which  
25 we think it ought to be, it ought to comply with all of



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 the existing rules that limit when an application ought  
2 to be provided once a piece of equipment goes into  
3 operations. If not, you have this very -- and let me  
4 say this for the record, we are not interested in  
5 nit-picking the rules, and we have ignored lots of small  
6 rules that we don't think have any substantive value or  
7 contribution to the discussion. We are raising this for  
8 very specific reasons. The timing with which these  
9 exemptions have been granted in the past is against all  
10 precedent in other places because it is so retroactive,  
11 and a retroactive incentive is pretty close to a  
12 contradiction in terms. If something's approved or  
13 doesn't get approved until the thing happened, it can't  
14 have affected it. That needs to change going forward is  
15 something that we're concerned about, that the status of  
16 assets and properties that are in operations but are not  
17 being reported to an assessor for a full calendar year,  
18 that is a gray area that ought to be corrected as we go  
19 forward.

20 So I want to make clear this is not  
21 about trying to nit-pick this company or that. It's to  
22 try to establish some concerns we have so that they are  
23 fixed in the future and we don't have property not on  
24 the roles that doesn't have an exemption and we try to  
25 move away from approving an incentive after a project is



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 already complete where it can't affect this behavior  
2 anymore. Thank you.

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 Thank you.

5 MR. JONES:

6 Mr. Chairman, can we move on?

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 Yes, Mr. Jones.

9 Are there any other questions?

10 MS. CHENG:

11 Can I make a comment?

12 These applications do all have advances  
13 filed, so the company did notify the state that they  
14 were going to be, in fact, completing a project in the  
15 future, so it's not really after the fact. We were  
16 already put on notice that a project was going to be  
17 occurring.

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 All right. Thank you.

20 I believe Mr. Adley has made the motion  
21 to -- since he got his answers, to approve all of these  
22 applications in globo.

23 Is that correct?

24 MR. ADLEY:

25 Yes.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

Is there a second?

MR. JOHNS:

I second.

MR. WINDHAM:

Seconded by Mr. Johns. Or  
Representative Johns. I'm sorry.

All in favor --

MR. JOHNS:

Senator.

MR. WINDHAM:

Senator. I am really sorry now.

MR. JOHNS:

I've been called worse.

MR. WINDHAM:

I knew you a long time ago when you  
weren't.

Are there any other questions by the  
Board members?

MR. ADLEY:

I would only point out so that Together  
Louisiana would know that the Governor's office  
appreciates very much all of the work that you do. We  
do. And we recognize it's an ongoing process dealing  
with these rules to make it clearer all of the time, but



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 I believe, based upon what we've heard here today, we  
2 should go ahead and move these projects. That doesn't  
3 mean we won't move forward in dealing with some of the  
4 rules here in the next month or two, but I think where  
5 we are today, we should approve them.

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 All right. Motion is on the table by  
8 Mr. Adley and second by Senator Johns.

9 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

10 (Several members respond "aye.")

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 All opposed with a "nay."

13 (No response.)

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 Motion carries.

16 All right. The next item on the agenda  
17 is renewals.

18 MS. CHENG:

19 No. We have three more new applications  
20 that have advances that were filed after the Executive  
21 Order --

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 I'm sorry.

24 MS. CHENG:

25 -- on June 24th of 2016.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. WINDHAM:

2 Please proceed.

3 MS. CHENG:

4 I do want to make a note that the salary  
5 for Barriere Construction on the summary sheet says  
6 45,000, but in their CEA with LED and the state, it's  
7 actually 53,000.

8 MR. WINDHAM:

9 All right. Can you read those?

10 MS. CHENG:

11 I can.

12 20171647, Barriere Construction Company,  
13 LLC in St. Charles Parish; 20161576, Louisiana Sugar  
14 Refining, LLC in St. James Parish; and 20161674, Tin  
15 Roof Brewing Company, Inc. in East Baton Rouge Parish.

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 Are there any questions from any of the  
18 Board members concerning the post-EOs?

19 MR. MOLLER:

20 Yes.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 I believe -- first let me say, I believe  
23 we received, subject to our original agenda, a package  
24 that had 103 pages of exhibit information in them. I  
25 hope everyone got a chance to review that.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Are there any questions on the exhibits?

2                   (No response.)

3                   MR. WINDHAM:

4                   All right. Mr. Moller.

5                   MR. MOLLER:

6                   I haven't read all of the 102 pages, but  
7 do they include the return on investments statement that  
8 is supposed to be part of these according to the rules?

9                   MR. HOUSE:

10                  Yes. Page 1.

11                  MR. MOLLER:

12                  Where? Because I looked through -- I  
13 mean, I did look through the first one, Barriere  
14 Construction, and I could not find it.

15                  MR. WINDHAM:

16                  Ms. Cheng?

17                  SECRETARY PIERSON:

18                  You review the total packet, which is  
19 maybe not provided to you in globo, but all of these  
20 will include a certification of return on investment.

21                  MR. ADLEY:

22                  But I think the question is, and what  
23 I'm trying to find out is, is the ROI, is that part of  
24 the application so that it's just easily accessible by  
25 the public or is that an in-house document? What do we



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 have there?

2 SECRETARY PIERSON:

3 Well, it's essentially both, but the  
4 document that's released as part of the application is a  
5 certification that I render.

6 MR. MOLLER:

7 Does that include an Exhibit A or B or  
8 is that in the backup?

9 SECRETARY PIERSON:

10 No. Exhibit A is the agreement as to  
11 what the company will provide. Exhibit B is the local  
12 governments all attesting to their support of tax  
13 abatement.

14 MR. MOLLER:

15 Okay. And the ROI statement is included  
16 in our backup?

17 SECRETARY PIERSON:

18 Correct.

19 MR. MOLLER:

20 How is that calculated?

21 SECRETARY PIERSON:

22 It's calculated differently for each  
23 deal because each deal is different. Largely, we follow  
24 IMPLAN models using codes established by a national  
25 organization, the National Industrial Codes, which help



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 us in this analysis because they provide the specific  
2 job multipliers, the indirect jobs that are created with  
3 each application. Each application will have different  
4 wage scenarios, different investment scenarios, may  
5 cover a broad range of different industrial  
6 opportunities, certainly, not in retail or service, but  
7 in manufacturing. And so all of these elements are  
8 considered, along with construction jobs, sales tax  
9 revenues generated and the term that we'd anticipate  
10 that this proposed asset would remain on the tax rolls,  
11 which is typically a period of time far in excess of  
12 either the eight or the 10-year -- in the past, 10  
13 years, now, today, eight-year -- abatement period that  
14 they would enjoy.

15 So it's actually a complex amount of  
16 effort that would go into that, and certainly we would  
17 want to assure the Board that these investments serve  
18 those communities with long-term, positive return on  
19 investment.

20 MR. MOLLER:

21 But so you use the same method to  
22 calculate ROI that other economic development agencies  
23 in other states, or, say, BRAC or somebody like that  
24 would use when they're evaluating a project?

25 SECRETARY PIERSON:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   In a general sense, the IMPLAN model,  
2                   yes. If parties choose to abbreviate the term of the  
3                   analysis, if you said you're doing an eight-year ROI  
4                   from the day the plant opened and you excluded all of  
5                   the construction jobs and all of the sales tax generated  
6                   by that, you can arrive at different figures. So what  
7                   we do is determine what our view of the value of the  
8                   investment is to the community, and we consider all of  
9                   the associated elements with construction as to  
10                  contributing to a positive return on investment.

11                  MR. MOLLER:

12                  Okay.

13                  MR. WINDHAM:

14                  Mr. Slone.

15                  MR. SLONE:

16                  So we can presume that when the  
17                  documents come to you, you have an ROI as required, you  
18                  have that information before you bring that  
19                  information -- before it actually comes to us?

20                  MS. CHENG:

21                  The project managers do, yes.

22                  MR. SLONE:

23                  Thank you.

24                  MR. WINDHAM:

25                  Thank you, Mr. Slone.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Any other questions by any other Board  
2 members concerning these three post-Executive Order  
3 applications?

4 (No response.)

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 Any comments from the public concerning  
7 these three post-Executive Order applications?

8 Please identify yourself.

9 MR. BAGERT:

10 Broderick Bagert, Together Louisiana.

11 We have not been able to find the ROIs.  
12 We did a public records request after the nine that were  
13 approved in December for Exhibit A, Exhibit B and the  
14 return on investment statement. Lots of documents were  
15 provided. There was a lot of useful information. That  
16 was not included.

17 We followed up with Mr. Thibodeaux and  
18 said, "Can you send us the return on investment that  
19 wasn't included there?" And the response was, "No  
20 documents were found responsive to your request."

21 This is the center of the entire  
22 discussion, what is the return on investment. These are  
23 public resources, what is the public benefit. That  
24 ought to be much more transparent, much more easily  
25 accessible, evaluated by the members of this Board,



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 evaluated by the local communities and determining  
2 whether a specific return on investment is worth it, not  
3 just a generic statement that, "Yes, it's good."

4           There are also different ways to  
5 determine return on investment. From the ones that  
6 we've seen not conducted by LED for the new ITEPs,  
7 because we don't -- we have not been able to see those,  
8 we would have a couple questions. One is, does the  
9 return on investment analysis assume that 100 percent of  
10 the benefits of the investment are attributable to the  
11 exemption? That's not an assumption that's  
12 characteristic of ordinary best practices. And what I  
13 mean by that is, under that scenario, we've allowed all  
14 the capital expenditure of manufacturers to be submitted  
15 for public a subsidy, or very, very close to it. The  
16 assumption is that without an exemption, manufacturers  
17 would make no capital investments in their facility. So  
18 how is that question dealt with?

19           Second, a return on investment analysis  
20 would need to compare the benefits that accrue from the  
21 private investment to the benefits that would accrue if  
22 the taxes went to the public sector, and the difference  
23 between those two is the benefit; right? None of those  
24 thing can be evaluated because we can't get our hands on  
25 them.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. WINDHAM:

2 Let me ask one question on that. Can  
3 you give me or this Board a model that does that?

4 MR. BAGERT:

5 We've engaged an economist to do just  
6 that.

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 But can you give us the model?

9 MR. BAGERT:

10 Yes. I mean, he can. I can't, but he  
11 can. We'll be back to you in and the public within a  
12 couple weeks on that.

13 MR. JONES:

14 But one does not exist today?

15 MR. BAGERT:

16 A model for doing return on investment  
17 absolutely exists.

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 No, no. For what you said. For what  
20 you said, is there is a model?

21 MR. BAGERT:

22 Yes.

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 That I can go to?

25 MR. BAGERT:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Yes, there is a model.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 Okay. Where is it? Where is it?

4 MR. BAGERT:

5 I think it's called the REMI. It's a  
6 piece of software that revenue estimating committees  
7 use.

8 MR. WINDHAM:

9 I'm very familiar with the REMI, and it  
10 doesn't do what you said.

11 MR. JONES:

12 Two different things.

13 MR. WINDHAM:

14 It's not doing what you said, what you  
15 just described.

16 MR. BAGERT:

17 Which part?

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 REMI II is not doing what you said.

20 MR. BAGERT:

21 Which part does it not do so I can make  
22 sure --

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 It's not taking the difference between  
25 your public sector and your private sector investment



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 and telling me what the return would have been had that  
2 not occurred.

3 MR. BAGERT:

4 Well, you run it in both scenarios and  
5 subtract; right? You run it for the private investment  
6 and determine the benefit, and then run it for the  
7 public investment and determine the benefit and then  
8 take the one from the other with some assumption about  
9 how much the public investment caused the private  
10 investment.

11 According to this economist, the  
12 academic literature says it's about 9 to 11 percent of  
13 manufacturing capital with an ad valorem exemption can  
14 be attributable to the subsidy. So you adjust for that,  
15 but --

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 Can you supply that to me, to me,  
18 specifically his recommendations, his analysis of what  
19 is or isn't occurring?

20 MR. BAGERT:

21 That's precisely why we've engaged  
22 somebody to do that, but it also would be helpful --

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 But not today, though? It doesn't  
25 exist. You don't have it today. You can't just send me



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 an e-mail where he's already given you this information?

2 MR. BAGERT:

3 For these specific projects or in  
4 general?

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 No. In general.

7 MR. JONES:

8 The model. Does the model exist?

9 MR. BAGERT:

10 Mr. Windham, I'm not trying to be  
11 obtuse. I don't know what the complexity around the  
12 model is. You run it for either side and then subtract  
13 one from the other. That's the way that you determine  
14 that benefit.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Mr. Jones.

17 MR. JONES:

18 The problem I'm having with what you  
19 described is both have inherently subjective  
20 assumptions, incredibly inherent subjective assumptions,  
21 and I'm going to be hard-pressed to see a model that can  
22 objectify subjective assumptions. That's what's going  
23 to be very difficult, one that can apply in every single  
24 situation, and that's why I'm very eager to see the  
25 model, the assumptions that go into it, because -- and



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 if it doesn't exist already, if it's being developed,  
2 which is what I'm hearing, it's being developed for you,  
3 I'm going to be very interested to see how he does that.

4 MR. BAGERT:

5 To be clear, the model is not being  
6 developed. The model is used every day. The analysis  
7 when you run the model has not been completed yet for  
8 specific context in Louisiana.

9 The fact that there are subjective  
10 assumptions that can be made is precisely why we think  
11 it's so important to look at the assumptions that are  
12 made in the current and future return on investment  
13 analysis. Assuming that 100 percent of the benefits of  
14 the investment are attributable to a subsidy when the  
15 investment preceded the subsidy is itself an assumption.  
16 Not running any comparative analysis to the benefits  
17 that would accrue if the tax revenue went to public  
18 entities as though it would have no impact at all is  
19 itself a subjective assessment, and we think -- or  
20 assumption and one that has some problems.

21 But you're right about that, but that  
22 doesn't mean you take the most extreme version of one  
23 side of assumptions and run with that. And we're not  
24 even saying that's what you're doing. We don't know  
25 what this department does because we have not been able



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 to see the return on investment analyses that have been  
2 conducted on projects that have gone to date.

3 So seeing those, understanding those so  
4 that local entities, the public at large and this Board  
5 can have some reasonable judgments about it, including a  
6 discussion about what assumptions are made, and arriving  
7 at something that y'all feel is reasonable that we  
8 understand better than we do, we think is our goal for  
9 testifying today.

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 Mr. Secretary.

12 SECRETARY PIERSON:

13 Everyone is entitled to their opinion.  
14 We respect that. We'll look forward to receiving your  
15 documents, and when we do receive your documents, we'll  
16 evaluate them.

17 For the knowledge of the Board, every  
18 project that comes before you seeking this, I think what  
19 Mr. Bagert calls a subsidy, which is a direct monetary  
20 aid furnished by a government to a private industrial  
21 undertaking, I prefer incentive because it acknowledges  
22 what Ms. Kristin Cheng talked about, which is there is  
23 an advanced notification, an agreement that makes this  
24 an incentive, that they're going to move forward based  
25 on what will be allowed by the government at some point,



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 which is their anticipation.

2 But to the point, each one of these  
3 documents contains this statement, that, "Whereas the  
4 economic benefit to the state resulting from this  
5 project is projected to exceed the value of the  
6 obligations of the state undertaken herein considering a  
7 multitude of factors, including, but not limited to the  
8 following: Capital expenditure, direct payroll tax  
9 revenue, indirect payroll tax revenue and additional  
10 indirect tax revenue streams, such as property tax,  
11 sales tax and other payroll tax, and other local taxes  
12 associated with the jobs supporting the project."

13 And so with this and attesting that it  
14 has a public purpose, and that is to grow the economy of  
15 our state, to provide for jobs and investment, the  
16 purpose of our meeting here today. So please know that  
17 that is included in the formal application for each one  
18 that you ratify.

19 MR. MOLLER:

20 It's not in our backup.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Thank you, Mr. Secretary.

23 MR. MOLLER:

24 Just to be clear, so it's not in our  
25 backup; it's in the application that they submit or --



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 because I --

2 SECRETARY PIERSON:

3 It's in the documentation supporting the  
4 contract.

5 MR. ADLEY:

6 What he's asking, does he get that?

7 SECRETARY PIERSON:

8 If he would like to see those, I'm  
9 certain that we can provide those as another document  
10 that you would request.

11 I think, as you see today's Board  
12 packet, it might have been 127 pages, but if it's their  
13 desire to see these attested statements, we could  
14 include those.

15 MR. MOLLER:

16 But so it's a statement of attestation;  
17 it doesn't show the math --

18 SECRETARY PIERSON:

19 That's correct.

20 MR. MOLLER:

21 -- of what we expect to get?

22 SECRETARY PIERSON:

23 That's correct.

24 MR. MOLLER:

25 Is that math available somewhere, the



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 results of this IMPLAN model that you do?

2 SECRETARY PIERSON:

3 It's done on the majority of projects.

4 MR. MOLLER:

5 Yeah, but not all projects?

6 SECRETARY PIERSON:

7 Correct.

8 MR. MOLLER:

9 Okay. And is that available? I mean,  
10 is there a way for us to find out what the public  
11 expects to receive in tax revenue for the incentive that  
12 we grant?

13 SECRETARY PIERSON:

14 Certainly.

15 MR. MOLLER:

16 Okay.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Mr. Slone.

19 MR. SLONE:

20 We're having this discussion, these are  
21 post-Executive Order. Many times, our Chairman, during  
22 the rules committee, talked about deferring to the  
23 locals. So we have had local approval exhibits here;  
24 correct? And the locals had to have considered the  
25 return on investment, otherwise we wouldn't have their



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 exhibits approving this.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 That is correct. That is correct.

4 MR. SLONE:

5 Thank you.

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 It's required.

8 President Miller. Point made?

9 MR. MILLER:

10 My comment was about the local support.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Are there any other --

13 SECRETARY PIERSON:

14 In fact, the Constitution protects the  
15 public bodies. We have to demonstrate that there's a  
16 value that they receive in order to participate in these  
17 programs.

18 MR. BAGERT:

19 Secretary Pierson, can we see that  
20 demonstration? Not the attestation or the statement or  
21 a conclusion, but the demonstration of it, because if  
22 the assumption made is that 100 percent of the  
23 investment is causally attributed to the incentive and  
24 it's not compared to what would accrue if the tax  
25 dollars went to the public sector, it is mathematically



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 impossible for that model to produce anything but a  
2 positive return on investment. There's no way to get a  
3 negative return if you leave out the negative side of  
4 the equation. We're not saying that that is what is  
5 happening. We're saying in order to evaluate it, that  
6 has been done in the past, is that still taking place in  
7 this new day, to know what the assumptions behind the  
8 model are. The public, the local entities, everybody  
9 needs to see them. So that would be the request is,  
10 we've asked for them with the proven information. We've  
11 asked for them today. Can we see those so that we can  
12 all contribute to making this better in the future?

13 Thank you.

14 MR. ADLEY:

15 I guess, Don, is there any reason why we  
16 couldn't do a demonstration of some sort to resolve this  
17 and get it behind us?

18 SECRETARY PIERSON:

19 We'd be happy to conduct a seminar of  
20 Economic Development 101, which would include a cost  
21 analysis model so that there would be a greater  
22 understanding of the factors that go into the decision  
23 that's made to verify that there's an ROI.

24 MR. JONES:

25 Mr. Chairman?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 MR. WINDHAM:

2 Yes, Mr. Jones.

3 MR. JONES:

4 I'd like to make a request.

5 Mr. Broderick, when you put the model  
6 together, I think we're all pretty familiar how ROI is  
7 determined from projects, I'm going to be very  
8 interested in seeing how you determine the benefit that  
9 comes from tax dollars going into the general  
10 government. I'll be real -- I'm going to be more  
11 interested in how that is objectified, because there can  
12 be a lot of discussion, and I think that's what the  
13 legislature does every year is trying to make that  
14 determination. So if economists have figured out a way  
15 to objectify that, I'll be extremely interested in  
16 reading that. So please provide it.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Please step forward, sir, and identify  
19 yourself and who you represent.

20 MR. CHAMPLIN:

21 Justin Champlin, I'm the Chief Deputy  
22 Assessor for Ascension Parish, and I was holding off  
23 comments till later, but I'll go ahead and speed up the  
24 timeframe.

25 MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Certainly.

2                   MR. CHAMPLIN:

3                   First of all, I would like to -- you  
4 know, Assessor Mert Smiley and I would like to thank the  
5 Governor, the Board here, the Secretary Pierson and, of  
6 course, the staff at LED.

7                   The changes with the program have been  
8 positive. You know, this is a good, positive role  
9 having the local input, and the things that have been  
10 done are moving in the right direction, I should say.

11                  I was saving most of my comments today  
12 because, you know, there has been the ongoing process  
13 where, you know, the assessor has to be fully involved  
14 in this process from start to finish because we're  
15 obligated to make sure that these things are timely and  
16 accounted for and on the roll. And how can we improve  
17 that? And that's where the discussion lately has been  
18 with LED, and ongoing discussions of how we can improve  
19 what already exists.

20                  Now, as discussion of ROI and those  
21 things, I can tell you, for somebody that personally  
22 here, I have been, you know, personally involved with  
23 all our local entities, involved in these processes for  
24 the last few that have gone through Ascension Parish on  
25 how they impact them, you know, from a property tax



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 standpoint, you know, from the impact from that. You  
2 know, there's been -- our economic development has been  
3 heavily involved with those decisionmaking processes.  
4 So as you're saying that, you know, do the local  
5 entities need to know, let me tell you, our people in  
6 Ascension know what they're looking at, you know, and  
7 they're going make that decision what they believe is  
8 best upon the information that is there. And, you know,  
9 we're very --

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 So let me ask this real quick. Is it  
12 fair to say that you're doing your own ROI?

13 MR. CHAMPLIN:

14 Correct.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 And your ROI ultimate answer could  
17 differ from what the state's ultimate answer is?

18 MR. CHAMPLIN:

19 Yes.

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 Because of what?

22 MR. CHAMPLIN:

23 Well, we're just looking at straight,  
24 you know, using current information to say, "Okay, what  
25 would the potential tax revenue be for property tax



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 based upon here's the current depreciation tables.

2 Here's what you're" --

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 Based upon your assumptions, they can be  
5 different from the state's, and the state could be  
6 different from Together Louisiana's?

7 MR. CHAMPLIN:

8 Correct.

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 So are we ever going to come to a single  
11 point of agreement?

12 MR. CHAMPLIN:

13 You will never. Ever.

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 Thank you.

16 MR. CHAMPLIN:

17 Ever. It's all on the local level to  
18 make those decisions based upon the information we have.  
19 It's hard numbers based upon if you're going to invest  
20 "X," if you deprecate it as of today -- the depreciation  
21 tables change every year -- you know, this is projected,  
22 this is what you should expect.

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 And I believe that was the intent of the  
25 Executive Order that we all -- I mean, we all have



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 bought into, is that we want to locals to be the  
2 deciders.

3 MR. CHAMPLIN:

4 It's working is what I'm trying to say.  
5 We are looking at, from the assessor's perspective, how  
6 can we improve it, and we're asking for your help to  
7 help us continue to improve that process and be involved  
8 in the improvement of it because from one that has  
9 personally invested a lot of time and resource in the  
10 past year, not only because of the change in the new  
11 rule, but also because of the new GASB 77, which  
12 requires us to provide every single taxing body a full  
13 list of their tax abated, you know, for the future, and  
14 so that takes a lot of time.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 All right.

17 MR. CHAMPLIN:

18 And so the things that you're doing are  
19 right. We're doing it for our standpoint because we  
20 want to know, the local bodies want to know what they're  
21 faced with from a personal perspective, but from the  
22 state, I mean, you have other, you know, aspects to look  
23 at. I mean, you know, as far as, yes, we may get five  
24 jobs with \$80,000 in payroll, you know, per person and  
25 benefits; okay, that's great, but, you know, that



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 affects state from income tax, you know, but it doesn't  
2 affect local income tax. But how does that new person  
3 now go eat at a restaurant and go pay sales tax, you  
4 know, go shop at Tanger Outlet, you know, go shop at  
5 local grocery stores. Those are impacts that you're  
6 talking of as return on investment, and that's part of  
7 the economic side of this project and that's where the  
8 economic development people to present to us, you know,  
9 and that's part of the puzzle. It's only one part of --  
10 it's one part of the puzzle, and if you put it all  
11 together, it ends up coming down to what is a good deal,  
12 what is a good, fair handshake between both to say,  
13 "Hey, we have a long-term investment here." But at the  
14 same time, too, you know, we want to continue a  
15 long-term, you know, partnership for both in a way that  
16 makes sense for both parties.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Absolutely. Thank you for your  
19 comments.

20 Are there any questions for the  
21 gentleman from the Board?

22 (No response.)

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 Are there any other comments related to  
25 the post-Executive Order applications?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Any other comments from the public?

MR. JONES:

Move to approve.

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion has been made by Mr. Jones;  
seconded by President Miller.

All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

(Several members respond "aye.")

MR. WINDHAM:

All opposed with a "nay."

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion carries.

Ms. Cheng, please proceed.

MS. CHENG:

I have Hud Usie here. He is now  
administrating the Industrial Tax Exemption Program with  
me, and he is going to be presenting the renewals to  
you-all.

MR. WINDHAM:

Welcome aboard.

MR. USIE:

Thank you.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   We have 148 timely renewals.

2                   MR. ADLEY:

3                   Yes, and --

4                   MR. USIE:

5                   We also have a deferral.

6                   MR. WINDHAM:

7                   We have one deferral?

8                   MR. USIE:

9                   Yes, from Phillips 66.

10                  MR. WINDHAM:

11                  Can you identify that one by number?

12                  MR. USIE:

13                  We have 14 of them.

14                  MR. WINDHAM:

15                  Fourteen numbers?

16                  MR. USIE:

17                  Fourteen numbers.

18                  MR. WINDHAM:

19                  All right. I'll take the latitude to  
20 say all of the Phillips 66 have requested deferral.

21                  Is there any objections to deferral?

22                  (No response.)

23                  MR. WINDHAM:

24                  No objection noted. Those are deferred.

25                  Mr. Adley, do you have questions for a



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 few of these?

2 MR. ADLEY:

3 Yeah. Obviously we'll move to approve  
4 these in globo in agreement with what the Governor has  
5 said he would do before, but there was one issue. Was  
6 the WestRock applications inside this 148? Is WestRock  
7 in that?

8 MR. USIE:

9 They are.

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 Is there a representative from WestRock?

12 MR. ADLEY:

13 I really don't need them. I want to  
14 point something out that I think the Board ought to see  
15 if they have hadn't got a copy of it.

16 How many applications are in there for  
17 WestRock?

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 Looks like 25 or so.

20 MR. ADLEY:

21 Yeah, it's 25 or so, and it's a great  
22 example --

23 MR. USIE:

24 Thirty-four.

25 MR. ADLEY:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Thirty-four. It's a great example of  
2 what we used to do when we had the MCAs where we allowed  
3 people just to separate out projects without having to  
4 go through the pre-application process. Now they're  
5 obviously up for renewal and will be renewed as they  
6 came under prior to this Executive Order. But it's  
7 really good example for people to see where a company  
8 took 34 applications all rolled into one, all up for  
9 renewal at the same time. Clearly not a whole lot of  
10 separate projects that were going on.

11                   But just for the record, it is probably  
12 the best example I have seen as we've gone through all  
13 of these renewals thus far because it was 34 of them.  
14 It clearly caught your eye with that.

15                   With that, we don't have any other  
16 questions.

17                   MR. WINDHAM:

18                   Anyone else have any questions of any of  
19 the renewals?

20                   Mr. Adley has made the motion that we  
21 approve the renewals in globo; seconded by  
22 Representative Carmody.

23                   Any comments from the public concerning  
24 the renewals?

25                   (No response.)



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
(Several members respond "aye.")

MR. WINDHAM:

All opposed with a "nay."  
(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion carries.  
Please proceed.

MR. USIE:

Next we have 20 late renewals. The first one is 20130480, Advanced Products & Systems, Inc., Lafayette Parish. Initial contract expiration date 12/31/17, late request date is February 1st, 2018.

MR. WINDHAM:

Is there a representative from Advanced Products & Systems?

Please step forward and identify yourself.

MS. HUNT:

Hi. Priscilla Hunt with Advanced Products.

MR. WINDHAM:

All right. Can you pull the mic a little bit closer to you, please?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Can you tell us why you were late?

2                   MS. HUNT:

3                   We actually had that FedEx'd for January  
4 31st, so I'm not sure why it had the date of February  
5 the 1st, but, also, we thought that it was already taken  
6 care of because we received corres- -- or I received  
7 correspondence in November for approval on the renewal,  
8 and it wasn't until I was working on current ITE  
9 projects in January that I realized it said that it was  
10 not received.

11                  MR. WINDHAM:

12                  And do we have any precedence for mail  
13 date versus received date?

14                  MS. CHENG:

15                  It still would have been needed to have  
16 been received December 31st of 2017.

17                  MR. WINDHAM:

18                  Oh, okay.

19                  MR. ADLEY:

20                  Ma'am -- if I can.

21                  MR. WINDHAM:

22                  Please. Please.

23                  MR. ADLEY:

24                  I know particularly with Senator Johns  
25 here, hasn't been with us before, when these late



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 applications come in, we only have three choices,  
2 totally reject it, reduce it to some degree or approve  
3 it. In the past, with every late application, because  
4 it's to your benefit to get it there, this Board has  
5 decided to reduce all late applications by basically 20  
6 percent. In other words, going from five years to four.  
7 I'm going to suggest and ask the Board to seriously  
8 consider following that same guideline as we go through  
9 these late examples. I mean, that's the only way to be  
10 fair about it. Everybody's got a reason, but that is  
11 what we have done, and I would -- I would move that we  
12 do it not only with this one, but with -- at least with  
13 this one, and I think there's some other questions on  
14 some of the others that go actually deeper than that.

15 But for what it's worth, ma'am, that's,  
16 what we determined was, that it's to the company's  
17 advantage to get it done.

18 MS. HUNT:

19 Sorry. Like I said, I thought that it  
20 was already filed. When we realized that that was the  
21 one that was submitted in 2016 that was received in  
22 November.

23 MR. ADLEY:

24 Well, the Board only has three choices  
25 is what they explained to us I know when we came here,



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 you can reject it altogether, you approve it or you find  
2 some middle ground. And in the past, that's what the  
3 Board has done, and I would hope the Board would do the  
4 same here.

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 Are there any other questions for the  
7 lady?

8 (No response.)

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 So I take that as a motion to approve in  
11 globo? I'm going to give a chance for questions and for  
12 other things, but I take that as a motion, Mr. Adley, to  
13 approve, after all questions have been answered related  
14 to these, in globo with a one-year reduction?

15 MR. ADLEY:

16 Well, I think there's -- let me suggest  
17 that you approve the first one, two, three, four, five  
18 down to Cos-Mar and handle Cos-Mar separately, simply  
19 because, unlike you, ma'am, being late 24 hours or  
20 whatever, they were late 13 and 14 months, and I think  
21 there's some questions about that. And so I would move  
22 that you at least do the first everything but Cos-Mar,  
23 however you say that, with the 20 percent reduction of  
24 one year.

25 MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 All right. Is there a second to that?

2 MR. MILLER:

3 Well, what about --

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 Seconded by Dr. Wilson. I'm sorry.

6 Please.

7 MR. MOLLER:

8 I understand Cos-Mar, but also Graham

9 Packaging, Hunt Forest Products?

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 Well, we're doing the first five.

12 MR. MOLLER:

13 Okay.

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 The first five, and we'll give everyone

16 a chance to ask questions on them, and from the public's

17 perspective, to come up and speak on them if Mr....

18 MR. USIE:

19 Usie.

20 MR. WINDHAM.

21 ...Usie will read them off.

22 MR. USIE:

23 Okay. The first five?

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 Please.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. USIE:

20130480, Advanced Products & Systems, Inc., Lafayette Parish. Initial expiration date 12/31/17, renewal receive date February 1st, 2018; 20110079, Bradken, Inc., Tangipahoa Parish, 12/31/17, renewal received February 1st, 2018; 20120506, Bradken, Inc., Tangipahoa Parish. Initial expiration date 12/31 of 2016, renewal received February 1st, 2018; 20130707, CertainTeed Corporation, Calcasieu Parish. Expiration date 12/31/2016, renewal received 1/4/2018; 20130708, CertainTeed Corporation Roofing Products Group, Caddo Parish. Initial expiration date 12/31/2016, renewal received January 4th, 2018.

Those are the first five.

MR. WINDHAM:

All right. Are there any questions on these?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Are there any comments from the public concerning the ones that were just read?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

(Several members respond "aye.")



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

All opposed with a "nay."

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion carries.

All right. The next ones we're going to speak specifically to, is there a representative from Cos-Mar in the audience?

Please step forward and identify yourself. We have some questions.

MR. HARRIS:

Morning, Mr. Chairman.

MR. WINDHAM:

Bring your mic in a little closer, please.

MR. HARRIS:

Shawn Harris with Ryan, LLC representing Cos-Mar as well as TOTAL Petrochemicals, which will be the final item on late renewals.

MR. WINDHAM:

All right. Mr. Adley.

MR. ADLEY:

I guess the question is, what makes it stand out is that these were 14 to 26 months late. Can someone explain to us how that actually happens, and if



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 they were 14 to 26 months, what happened? Did your  
2 property go on the tax roll during that period? I mean,  
3 what happened? We hadn't seen any that was 14 to 26  
4 months.

5 MR. HARRIS:

6 To the -- Ryan became engaged with  
7 Cos-Mar Company and TOTAL Petrochemical in 2017. We  
8 discovered that there was lapse with the IT renewals, so  
9 once that was discovered, we wanted to bring forth our  
10 good faith action and try to comply with those.

11 As to why those were not renewed in the  
12 past, that information is trying to be gathered.  
13 However, because of turnover at the plant itself, we're  
14 not able to exactly see why those were not renewed.

15 MR. ADLEY:

16 Let me ask the staff, if it's one to two  
17 years late and we gave approval similar to what we did  
18 with the others, where we reduced it to 20 percent and  
19 you got down to four remaining years, you've already  
20 passed two years in some of it, so what happens? Is it  
21 four years forward or is it two more years from here?

22 MS. CHENG:

23 Two more from here.

24 MR. ADLEY:

25 And what role does the assessor play



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 when that happens? Does he get notified or what  
2 happens? If it's been a year or two, does somebody  
3 notify him and say, you know, they're not exempt  
4 anymore? How does that work?

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 Mr. Adley, maybe I can get the Assistant  
7 Assessor to come up and speak just from an assessor's  
8 perspective in general, you know, how you guys might  
9 handle it, how it's supposed to be handled or how it's  
10 required to be handled.

11 MR. CHAMPLIN:

12 Normally we would -- if we do receive a  
13 late notification, then we add it to, you know, the  
14 parcel listing for that company to add it to the tax  
15 roll. One of the issues that why I was here today and  
16 continue to work with LED is the speed of receiving the  
17 notification of late filing or, you know, if something's  
18 not done fast enough. You know, in other words, you may  
19 rule -- I'd have to sit here and watch every single  
20 Board of Commerce and Industry meeting to find out if it  
21 happened, but by the time our office actually receives a  
22 copy of it, it may be two, three -- you know, it may be  
23 too late for the year is what I'm trying to say.

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 For that single year, though?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. CHAMPLIN:

2 For the single year. Well --

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 So it goes onto the roll and --

5 MR. CHAMPLIN:

6 Well, it depends on what it is. I mean,  
7 just, you know, sometimes they're sooner, sometimes  
8 they're faster, but an item that happened, you know,  
9 just trying to speed up is just when do these things  
10 expire, when do they come off, when do these things  
11 change. The speed of actually receiving the copies of  
12 these documents and things that occur, that's what we're  
13 looking for in order to effectively and properly, you  
14 know, assess property.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Okay. So when it goes under your roll  
17 and you send out the bill, does --

18 MR. CHAMPLIN:

19 It's added.

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 If the company pays it, or do they have  
22 the ability to say, "We're not going to pay on this item  
23 because it's currently in limbo," or --

24 MR. CHAMPLIN:

25 I will say that I normally -- you know,



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 we have a conversation with that tax rep.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 You would have that conversation?

4 MR. CHAMPLIN:

5 Yes.

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 For some reason, they're not --

8 MR. CHAMPLIN:

9 I'd say probably, you know, anything  
10 that's a late file or anything that's out of ordinary,  
11 there is usually a phone call and e-mail, you know,  
12 involved.

13 MR. WINDHAM:

14 So in this case, it's, what, 16 months  
15 late, it's probable that you could have spoken with them  
16 at some point during that time? Not this gentleman  
17 because it's not your area.

18 MR. CHAMPLIN:

19 But, I mean, if I had a tax rep in my  
20 area, you know, that represented one of these industrial  
21 plants, and normally if there's some special  
22 circumstance or something happens, I'm getting a phone  
23 call. That's par for the course.

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 All right. Are there any questions for



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 the Assistant Assessor?

2 Mr. Jones.

3 MR. JONES:

4 What month are the assessments normally  
5 finalized?

6 MR. CHAMPLIN:

7 We have to produce a preliminary roll  
8 typically in between August 15th through September 15th,  
9 in that 15-day time period for the public disclosure  
10 period. Generally, you know, by the end of July,  
11 everything's shut down.

12 MR. JONES:

13 So if we grant the renewal at a December  
14 meeting, what happens then?

15 MR. CHAMPLIN:

16 I have to look at the timeframe. I go  
17 straight on contract end, you know, dates, you know, and  
18 at that point --

19 MR. JONES:

20 My point is, if we granted a renewal in  
21 December, obviously it can't affect the tax rolls that  
22 have happened in that year; is that --

23 MR. CHAMPLIN:

24 Right. The assets were as of January  
25 1st.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. JONES:

2 So if it's a late renewal there, I mean,  
3 nothing can be done at that point; is that accurate?

4 MR. CHAMPLIN:

5 Right. We would have the information,  
6 we would produce -- I mean we've been trying to keep up  
7 with the, you know, pull the reports, you know, keep up  
8 with everything, but every time you pull it, then you  
9 have to go through and sort all of the data all over  
10 again.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Now, if they had paid under protest,  
13 though, then you could do something? If they  
14 informingly paid under protest.

15 MR. CHAMPLIN:

16 If they paid under protest, but the  
17 issues related to anything that's at a state level,  
18 Board today level, we defer to the Board, your decision,  
19 to how we handle it.

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 So you hold that money; you don't really  
22 count it as being paid on that asset, so --

23 MR. CHAMPLIN:

24 We haven't had that situation yet, so...

25 MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Okay. Good. But I know it can happen.

2                   MR. CHAMPLIN:

3                   It's possible.

4                   MR. WINDHAM:

5                   All right. Any other questions for the  
6 Assistant Assessor for Ascension Parish?

7                   Not related to this specific company,  
8 though.

9                   MR. CHAMPLIN:

10                   No.

11                   MR. WINDHAM:

12                   All right. Thank you very much for your  
13 input.

14                   MR. JONES:

15                   I have a question for Cos-Mar, though.

16                   MR. WINDHAM:

17                   Mr. Jones.

18                   MR. JONES:

19                   And, I'm sorry, I didn't get your name.

20                   MR. HARRIS:

21                   Shawn Harris.

22                   MR. JONES:

23                   Mr. Harris. I apologize.

24                   So it's my understanding that your group  
25 was hired to come in and clean up an issue; is that



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 accurate?

2 MR. HARRIS:

3 No. Just a general engagement, and  
4 while we are working with the client, it came to our  
5 knowledge that there has been a lapse in the IT  
6 application.

7 MR. JONES:

8 So you just discovered the issue once  
9 you came in?

10 MR. HARRIS:

11 Yes.

12 MR. JONES:

13 Okay. And the company was unaware of it  
14 at that time?

15 MR. HARRIS:

16 No.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Mr. Adley.

19 MR. ADLEY:

20 Is the company still in business?

21 MR. HARRIS:

22 Yes.

23 MR. ADLEY:

24 Okay. I'd like to move that we apply  
25 the same penalty here, but we make it very clear that



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 it's going forward. In other words, you only have two  
2 years left. If you're 24 months left, you only have two  
3 years left. You don't have four going forward.

4 MR. JONES:

5 Second.

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 Are there any other questions from any  
8 of the Board members concerning Cos-Mar?

9 MR. MOLLER:

10 Wait. So how much -- we're reducing  
11 them by two years?

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 No. By one. Still by 20 percent, I  
14 believe.

15 Is that correct, Mr. Adley?

16 MR. ADLEY:

17 Yeah, applying the same 20 percent that  
18 we've applied to everybody else. It's a five-year  
19 extension. If you're late, you lose a year.

20 What I was trying to clarify is is that  
21 because he's got one here that's actually two years  
22 late. He's already had two years of the remaining four.  
23 I just want to make it clear, he's not going to get  
24 anymore then two more from here because then he hits the  
25 20 percent penalty, which takes him to four years.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. MOLLER:

Okay.

MR. WINDHAM:

And are we also applying that motion and second to TOTAL Petrochem since he also represents them?

MR. ADLEY:

And they ought to pay you a bonus.

MR. WINDHAM:

So Mr. Safed (sic)?

MS. CHENG:

Usie. Hud Usie.

MR. WINDHAM:

Usie. I'm sorry. Can you read that last one for us, the last one that this gentleman, Mr. Harris, represents, TOTAL?

MR. USIE:

TOTAL. Okay.

20120433, TOTAL Petrochemicals USA, Inc., Iberville Parish. Initial contract expiration date 12/31/2016, late renewal request date January 9th, 2018.

MR. WINDHAM:

And does your motion apply to that, Mr. Adley?

MR. ADLEY:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Yes, same thing.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 Seconded by Mr. Jones.

4 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

5 (Several members respond "aye.")

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 All opposed with a "nay."

8 (No response.)

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 Motion carries.

11 Sir, is it related to these?

12 MR. JACKSON:

13 Yes, sir. I'm sorry. I thought prior  
14 to taking a vote, you were supposed to receive public  
15 comments.

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 Oh, I'm sorry. I thought we had --  
18 we're in the middle of that. Please --

19 MR. JACKSON:

20 I thought prior to taking a vote, you  
21 were supposed to receive public comments; am I correct?

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 That is correct.

24 MR. JACKSON:

25 Okay.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. JONES:

Move to let the gentleman make a public comment.

MR. WINDHAM:

Move for the public comment by the gentleman; seconded by Mr. Slone.

Any objection?

(No response.)

MR. JACKSON:

I would also request then that that vote you just --

MR. WINDHAM:

Please step forward and identify yourself and speak clearly into the mic for us.

MR. JACKSON:

My name is Isaac Jackson. I'm speaking on behalf of my family. Private citizen of Iberville Parish.

And, again, I thought that prior to the taking of any vote, so I would believe that that vote would probably need to be rescinded. Prior to the taking of any vote, we were supposed to have received this public comment; am I right?

MR. ADLEY:

Sir, I'm going to suggest to you, in



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 fairness, once you make your statement, the Board can  
2 always reconsider its action if it chooses to do that.  
3 It would be helpful if you would give us your statement.

4 MR. JACKSON:

5 Okay. Thank you.

6 I want to say that I was very, very  
7 impressed by everything that's going on here today, and  
8 I definitely especially appreciate the comments and  
9 information given by the Assistant Assessor for  
10 Ascension Parish. I am in Iberville Parish.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Please speak closer to the mic for us.  
13 This is being broadcast over the web, live streamed.

14 MR. JACKSON:

15 Absolutely.

16 Again, I am in Iberville Parish, and I'm  
17 going to be honest with you, my officials, I don't  
18 believe, have a clue. Okay? I really believe they  
19 don't have a clue as to their responsibility and what  
20 should be done in this.

21 I don't think we need to rush this until  
22 we can actually visit with our people in Iberville  
23 Parish. These people went and got somebody from out of  
24 town to come here and explain and look at their books  
25 and y'all granted it. That's great. And you reduced it



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 by a certain percentage, and that's great with respect  
2 to this company. But if I look at it, I didn't see that  
3 this company produced any jobs. I don't see that this  
4 company did anything that would really qualify, mainly,  
5 for, you know, what they are seeking.

6 Now, I don't know what's going on here,  
7 but I would request that you delay at least one month so  
8 that private citizens can look at it, visit with the  
9 taxing authorities in Iberville just to get a little  
10 input, and then maybe they'll be here next month and we  
11 might want to ask them questions or maybe give an  
12 explanation as to what actually occurred here. If it's  
13 two years late, one month won't hold up anything, would  
14 it?

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 All right. Are there any questions by  
17 any of the Board members for the gentleman?

18 (No response.)

19 MR. ADLEY:

20 I think it's fair to make this at least  
21 a statement to you, sir, so you understand where we find  
22 ourselves. When the Board changed under the new  
23 administration, we found that there were many renewals  
24 coming to us that where the State of Louisiana had made  
25 a commitment. The Governor made a decision that it was



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 more important to make sure that the state reputation  
2 for honoring its commitments was met.

3 The department made it very clear to us  
4 that they felt that commitments had been made to these  
5 companies for these five-year renewals. The Governor  
6 had intended to do something otherwise, but felt that  
7 keeping your word, from a state's perspective, was more  
8 important, and so we have moved forward pretty much in  
9 globo with most of these things that happened long  
10 before we got here.

11 To my knowledge, this is at least the  
12 first time anybody's even been penalized for being late.  
13 So something positive has already happened, so that you  
14 know that. The miscellaneous applications that used to  
15 come to this Board, many, many of them, that's no longer  
16 allowed. Some pretty dramatic changes have been made.

17 I think I would personally agree with  
18 you, it's difficult at the local level, but sooner or  
19 later, the locals are going to have to take it upon  
20 themselves to be part of this process, because every  
21 state in America does it that way but ours, and we've  
22 changed that. So I just wanted you to know there's a  
23 lot of positive things that have happened.

24 We can delay this a month, but the truth  
25 is, once we delay it a month as a renewal that came



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 prior to the Governor's Executive Order, it's probably  
2 going to move in the exact same fashion that it moves  
3 now, probably with the exact same penalty because that's  
4 what's been -- we've applied to everybody else. So I  
5 just think you need to know there's a lot that has gone  
6 on prior to this point.

7 Appreciate you being here. Appreciate  
8 you taking the time, but I think the motion the Board  
9 made is probably consistent with what the Governor has  
10 said he is willing to honor, and it's my job to make  
11 sure that, you know, at least his wishes are met.

12 MR. JACKSON:

13 So I won't have an opportunity to visit  
14 with my taxing authorities to just --

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Oh, absolutely. You can visit with your  
17 taxing authority at any time. We're not going to stop  
18 you.

19 MR. JACKSON:

20 I was talking about with respect to  
21 these items if your decision is has already passed.

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 Well, I was going to see if there's some  
24 other public comments. I believe the lady and gentleman  
25 might also have some comments. So that all of the



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 public's comments can be taken into consideration before  
2 a decision is made to reopen the vote.

3 MR. JACKSON:

4 Thank you.

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 Any other questions for the gentleman?

7 (No response.)

8 MR. WINDHAM:

9 Thank you, sir.

10 Please identify yourself and who you  
11 represent.

12 MS. JOHNSON:

13 Thank you very much. My name is Linda  
14 Johnson. I'm a citizen of Iberville Parish, and I'm  
15 representing myself. I'm here and thank you-all for  
16 allowing me to speak.

17 I personally thought that you were going  
18 to follow the terms of the renewal contract, which says  
19 that it will be reduced one year for each calendar month  
20 until I heard Mr. Adley say that typically you've done a  
21 20 percent. So I don't have a real problem with the 20  
22 percent if that's what you've done in the past because I  
23 really don't want you to change. However, I would like  
24 for you to consider those that were in 2015 maybe having  
25 an additional 20 percent, and the ones in 2016 having



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 the percent that you've already established.

2 Now, my reason for doing this I'm a firm  
3 believer in quality education. Education is my passion.  
4 And I became concerned because I thought what the  
5 Governor's Executive Order did was to allow all of those  
6 things that were already in existence to just move  
7 forward and that I would not to have to see anything  
8 like this. That's what I thought. So I was concerned  
9 about it.

10 Then I saw Cos-Mar, and Cos-Mar is in my  
11 parish. And let me say something else. I want the  
12 chemical industry in Iberville Parish. I do not want it  
13 in some other parish, nor do I want it in some other  
14 state. That's not what why I'm here. But I believe  
15 that they could have met the terms that are in here by  
16 applying in a timely fashion. They delayed. I have not  
17 heard -- and I heard the young man come to the table. I  
18 have not heard a concrete reason for the delay. Now,  
19 there may be a concrete reason, but I did not hear it in  
20 what he said.

21 I told you earlier my passion is  
22 education. Last night in my parish I was told that our  
23 school board could give a \$500 bonus to its employees if  
24 it had money. So I'm here to try to get \$1.8-million,  
25 which I know I'm not going to get because of the way



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 that you do this, but that's how much this money would  
2 add up to if we got it. But I can go back and I guess  
3 you can say that I could be the hero for education  
4 because I tell them to give the teachers a raise. They  
5 are asking for moneys in the MFP this year, and I know  
6 they're aren't going to get it because I watch the  
7 budget. So any way that we can help educators, and  
8 that's my goal, to get some additional funds, I'm all  
9 for it.

10 So what I'm requesting is that you look  
11 at what you're currently doing with the 20 percent, but  
12 then you look at those at 2015 and you make an  
13 additional 20 percent for them.

14 And thank you-all for allowing me to  
15 speak.

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 Are there any questions for the lady?

18 MR. ADLEY:

19 Yes.

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 Mr. Adley.

22 MR. ADLEY:

23 I don't have a question for you. I will  
24 tell you, you make perfectly good sense.

25 MS. JOHNSON:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Put it in a motion.

2 MR. ADLEY:

3 We've penalized people 20 percent  
4 because they're two days late.

5 MS. JOHNSON:

6 Right, but the top of your information  
7 says that "We may reduce by one year for each calendar  
8 month." And so, you know, I was looking at, wow, that's  
9 about \$1.8-million that could come back to Iberville  
10 Parish for our teachers.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 I think we came to the conclusion,  
13 because it's a five-year extension, if you dropped off  
14 the year, that was equivalent to the 20 percent.

15 I would move for the Board to reconsider  
16 its action on this application to increase the penalty,  
17 because it is two years, and then leave it totally up to  
18 the Board what the Board would like to do.

19 MS. JOHNSON:

20 Thank you.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 All right. There's a motion to  
23 reopen --

24 MR. MOLLER:

25 There may be another.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

-- this vote. Yes. So before I move forward, I want to see if there's anymore public comments.

Thank you, Ms. Johnson.

Oh, I'm sorry. President Miller, you've got a question.

Ms. Johnson.

MR. MILLER:

Well, actually, it's not Ms. Johnson. It's more -- I'm sorry. I don't remember your name, the Deputy Assessor for Ascension.

What would happen if the application renewal, the renewal -- or any of the Industrial Tax reps could probably answer this -- never comes, we never get it? If this consultant hadn't gone and found that these were late by two years, if he found it was late five years and it was never put on the tax rolls, how do you back up and get it?

MR. CHAMPLIN:

There is a way to submit a supplemental tax roll for past years, but it can only go back for three years.

MR. WINDHAM:

Because of the prescriptive laws in



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Louisiana.

2 MR. CHAMPLIN:

3 Correct. And that follows the Louisiana  
4 Tax Commission Rules and Regulations, and, you know,  
5 state law that applies.

6 I will say that from our proactive  
7 standpoint and our sincere requests to improve, you  
8 know, the ability to communicate between our office and  
9 LED and the Board here, will greatly, you know,  
10 eliminate any lag in time or the lack of information  
11 that may occur to make sure it is appropriately done. I  
12 will say that we've always deferred to the state, you  
13 know, LED, you know, through this process, to let -- you  
14 know, if there's any questions or issues, you know, let  
15 it get resolved. They're applying the rules. You know,  
16 follow the rules.

17 Look, I am an attorney as well. You  
18 know, I practiced in the title industry as a title  
19 attorney for seven years before I became the Chief  
20 Deputy Assessor in Ascension Parish. I practiced law,  
21 you know, then; I filed lawsuits. If you didn't file  
22 something timely, the judge could kick it out of court.  
23 It's the same situation. You play by the rules. You  
24 have rules in place. Follow the rules. And it's the  
25 same principal we are going to apply for anybody. There



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 is penalty for not following the rules properly. That's  
2 what we teach our kids, you know, to do what you're  
3 supposed to do correctly. And if you don't follow the  
4 rules properly, then there should be a penalty and you  
5 should assess a penalty according to the rules that are  
6 in place. And that's what you -- those are there, and  
7 that's what you're doing today.

8 The question that you posed is that,  
9 okay, when do we know and then when do we actually  
10 receive notification, and I will say this has been an  
11 issue that I've, you know, found out, you know, a year  
12 later, they never received notification timely enough to  
13 put it on soon enough. You know, and it was just -- it  
14 was one late filing, you know, but that's -- you put it  
15 on, you deal with it and you move forward and you talk  
16 to them. You know, say, "Hey," you know, and then you  
17 try to figure out how to improve that process.

18 You know, we are proactive in trying to  
19 improve it, but it is a situation where we hope that the  
20 efforts being made by LED right now, you know, with the  
21 steps they're taking, they've asked, you know, for that,  
22 even I personally would help, you know, maybe look at  
23 some of the things that they're doing and see what we  
24 can come to a resolve to make sure that it is proper.

25 I will tell you that, you know, like I



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 said earlier, if there is an issue with any of these  
2 things that comes up, I mean, sure, I mean, there's not  
3 a tax rep that I know in Ascension Parish that won't  
4 give me a phone call, you know, and put it to our  
5 attention as well. And you have to look at it for what  
6 it is. But at the same time, too, what's the rules, did  
7 you abide by the rules, you know, and whatever penalties  
8 is proper. You know, we take it for what it is and we  
9 move forward. It is what it is, as they say, is the  
10 cliché. And that's what you should do.

11 MR. MILLER:

12 Thank you.

13 MR. WINDHAM:

14 Thank you, sir.

15 I believe we have more comments from the  
16 public.

17 Please step forward, identify yourself  
18 and who you represent.

19 MR. CAGE:

20 My name is Edgar Cage, and I'm with  
21 Together Louisiana.

22 I love rules that help us to be  
23 civilized and know what to expect. And, Senator Adley,  
24 I appreciate the Governor honoring commitments, but I  
25 think corporations and manufacturers have commitments to



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 this state and the people of Louisiana to do what they  
2 supposed to do, too.

3 This should be denied, in my opinion,  
4 and I'm not an attorney like the Assistant Assessor.  
5 I'm just an average Joe citizen concerned about trying  
6 to make this state a better place for everybody,  
7 businesses and the average man.

8 If this property had been reported as it  
9 should have been required by law on the LAT 5 form,  
10 would it not then be placed on the tax rolls? That's a  
11 question, if somebody can answer that for me.

12 MR. ADLEY:

13 It would have been placed on tax rolls,  
14 and it would not -- it could not apply for this  
15 exemption.

16 MR. CAGE:

17 That's it. Bingo. That's exactly the  
18 point I'm getting to. The process and commitment from  
19 the company was not honored. The governor gave a  
20 commitment, but the company did not do their part. So  
21 why should we reward someone for violating the rules  
22 that we have in place already? So I'm for an actual  
23 denial because it should be contiguous. If we're  
24 granting these exemptions and the renewal, it should be  
25 contiguous, not any separation by 24 months, 36 months



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 or even six months really. We should play by the rules  
2 across the board. The rules of Commerce and Industry  
3 are not in conflict with the rules that require LAT 5  
4 and the assessors who put this property on the rolls.

5 So I appreciate you going on your motion  
6 to reconsider, but let an option be to deny this  
7 exemption because they did not live up to their  
8 commitment by placing this property on LAT 5 denying the  
9 people of Iberville Parish getting that ad valorem tax  
10 that they should have.

11 Thank you.

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 Are there any questions for Mr. Cage?

14 (No response.)

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Thank you, Mr. Cage.

17 Is there a motion to reconsider the  
18 previous action?

19 MR. ADLEY:

20 I would make that motion that we would  
21 reconsider. And if you reconsider, obviously then the  
22 Board can decide whatever action it wants to take,  
23 whether penalty or reject, whatever, but if you  
24 reconsider, I think we can take that action.

25 MR. JONES:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Second the motion.

2                   MR. WINDHAM:

3                   There's a motion to reconsider and a  
4 second.

5                   All in favor -- I'm sorry.

6                   Any comments from the public?

7                   (No response.)

8                   MR. WINDHAM:

9                   Any questions or comments from the Board  
10 concerning the vote to reconsider the previous action?

11                   (No response.)

12                   MR. WINDHAM:

13                   All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

14                   (Several members respond "aye.")

15                   MR. WINDHAM:

16                   All opposed with a "nay."

17                   (No response.)

18                   MR. WINDHAM:

19                   Motion to reconsider passes.

20                   MR. ADLEY:

21                   Mr. Chairman, I would, if I can, just  
22 start off this discussion by saying that this is the  
23 heart of the matter. The state makes the commitment,  
24 the company makes a commitment, and then how we decide  
25 to deal with that is now up to this Board. I, for one,



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 do not believe that the normal 20 percent penalty that  
2 we have imposed certainly does not apply here.

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 And what is your motion?

5 MR. ADLEY:

6 That a very good argument was made that  
7 it should have been on the tax rolls already and that it  
8 should be just totally rejected.

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 Please state your motion.

11 MR. ADLEY:

12 I just really in hell sitting here don't  
13 know what the hell I think I ought to do.

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 I have heard two. I heard one for two  
16 years and one for rejection. So I believe Mr. Adley --

17 MR. ADLEY:

18 I think that Robby's making a suggestion  
19 that probably fits, and those applications that went out  
20 there, as far as two-year period, if I can, I'll just  
21 relinquish this microphone to him.

22 And, Robby, you make your suggestion,  
23 but let's try to find some way to deal with this.

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 Mr. Miller, specifically they were



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 talking about Cos-Mar and TOTAL Petrochemical. That's  
2 the one that we're reconsidering.

3 MR. MILLER:

4 I understand that, and I'm looking -- I  
5 understand. I'm looking at if we do reconsider those,  
6 then we have to reconsider Hunt and Nalco, because  
7 they're in the '15s also.

8 MR. JONES:

9 We haven't acted on Hunt yet.

10 MR. MILLER:

11 Oh, we haven't got there. Okay.

12 The ones that are '15, if we're going  
13 to --

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 The only ones we've done --

16 MR. MILLER:

17 It may not be an exemption, but it gets  
18 us better that we go the 20 percent per year, which  
19 would then -- on those '15s, it would be a two-year  
20 reduction. After all, like we said, we hit them for a  
21 full year if they're a few days late up to a full year  
22 late. If they're over a -- pushing two years late, then  
23 maybe we ought to go 20 percent or one year for each  
24 year they're late. How about that? Then it makes it  
25 the same.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. WINDHAM:

2 So within the Cos-Mar ones, we have  
3 multiple differing years. We have '15s and '16s of the  
4 expiration dates. They were all done in a all-renewal  
5 request, I believe is the proper phrase, were done in  
6 '18. So you want to parse out the ones that were  
7 supposed to be in expiration dates of '15, separate  
8 those from expiration dates of '16?

9 MR. MILLER:

10 Yes, sir.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Okay. So you can make the motion.

13 MR. MILLER:

14 I will, if that's -- I've got to say it  
15 now, huh?

16 All right. So the ones that are for  
17 Cos-Mar -- and who's the other one?

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 TOTAL Petrochemical.

20 MR. MILLER:

21 Okay.

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 -- USA.

24 MR. MILLER:

25 Oh, okay.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

And it was a '16 year one, so it was a one-year.

MR. MILLER:

The one with the expiration date of 2016 would receive the one-year penalty, and the ones with the expiration date of 2015 should receive a two-year penalty.

I don't like punishing my kids either, but it happens sometimes.

MR. WINDHAM:

So that is the motion. I see counsel at the table.

MS. BOURGEOIS:

Yes.

MR. WINDHAM:

Please identify yourself.

MS. BOURGEOIS:

Tam Bourgeois from LED.

I just wanted to make sure that we were considering the 2015 versus 2016 since it was an in globo motion that we're reconsidering.

MR. WINDHAM:

All right. Thank you.

All right. I need a second.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. ADLEY:

I'll second that.

MR. WINDHAM:

Second has been -- motion has been made to for the 2015 -- we're talking about the 2015 ones right now; correct? 2015 ones, Robby.

MR. JONES:

They need to be handled separately, I think.

MR. MILLER:

However y'all need to do it.

MR. WINDHAM:

The 2015s need to be read out, Us...

MS. CHENG:

Usie.

MR. WINDHAM:

Usie.

MR. USIE:

I'm reading all of the 2015 ones only?

MR. WINDHAM:

Only for Cos-Mar because the TOTAL Petrochemical is a '16, so you don't have to read it.

MR. USIE:

20080162, Cos-Mar Company, Iberville Parish. Initial expiration date 12/31/15, late renewal



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 request date 1/9 of 2018; 20080941, Cos-Mar Company,  
2 Iberville Parish. Contract expiration date 12/31/2015,  
3 received 1/9 of 2018; 20110331, Cos-Mar Company,  
4 Iberville Parish. Expiration date of 12/31/15, received  
5 1/9/2018; 20110332, Cos-Mar Company, Iberville Parish.  
6 12/31/2015, received 1/9/2018.

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 So we have four of those. The motion is  
9 to restrict them by 40 percent or by two years. There's  
10 a motion and a second.

11 Is there any further comments or  
12 questions from the Board?

13 (No response.)

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 Comments from the public?

16 Mr. Cage, please step forward, identify  
17 yourself.

18 MR. CAGE:

19 Yes, Edgar Cage with Together Louisiana.

20 I just want to, where we can be sort of  
21 clear, and offer a suggestion. And I like your analogy  
22 about punishing your kids, and, you know, depending on  
23 what they did, we don't punish them in the same way.

24 So you've already adjusted Advanced  
25 Products a 20 percent penalty because they were a few



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 months and we'll say less than a year. So we agree with  
2 that. We think it should be less than a year, 20  
3 percent, over a year, but less than two, 40 percent,  
4 over two years, 60 percent. That way you got...

5 MR. ADLEY:

6 Isn't that what you did?

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 Are there any questions for Mr. Cage?

9 (No response.)

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 Thank you for your suggestions.

12 MR. ADLEY:

13 Yeah. I think to clarify what Robby's  
14 saying, because he's trying to run the two together, the  
15 simplest approach would be 20 percent per year you're  
16 late. That would probably be the best approach. Most  
17 of these we get, they come in and they may be a few  
18 days, they may be few weeks, a couple of months, but  
19 we've never run into it where they were years late.

20 I think if I understood his motion  
21 correctly, it would be 20 percent each year you're late.  
22 So if you were late with one application by two years,  
23 it would be 40 percent. If you were one year, it would  
24 be 20 percent. If you were three years, it would be 60  
25 percent.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. CAGE:

2 Good. That's...

3 MR. ADLEY:

4 And you have to go backwards in time and  
5 pick up the two years that applies because they can't  
6 pay this property tax now. It's not on the rolls. So  
7 those two years, if he's down to three years, you pick  
8 up those two, he's only got a year left. That's what  
9 that means.

10 MR. CAGE:

11 Okay. Good.

12 MR. JONES:

13 Mr. Chairman?

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 Mr. Jones.

16 MR. JONES:

17 Two points. Number one, this is one of  
18 those times, Mr. Harris, you may tell your client they  
19 should be glad they're coming under this Board rather  
20 than the previous Board, because under the previous  
21 Board, you would have been denied altogether.

22 Number two, and this isn't -- I'm not  
23 criticizing you, Mr. Harris, or necessarily your client,  
24 but we've made the point several times in this Board  
25 than when -- especially on these late renewals, when the



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 client doesn't see fit to come and explain to us why  
2 they're late, that doesn't strike well with me. If it's  
3 important enough for them to file for the renewal, it's  
4 important enough for them to come explain to this Board  
5 why they're late personally, because obviously you have  
6 no way of knowing because you weren't there at the time.

7 So for all of the people who represent  
8 clients out there, I would strongly suggest that you  
9 recommend to your clients that they be at these Board  
10 meetings, especially when they're asking for special  
11 dispensation.

12 That's all.

13 MR. WINDHAM:

14 Thank you, Mr. Jones.

15 Any other comments from the public?

16 MR. ADLEY:

17 We can do a substitute.

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 Any other comments from the public?

20 (No response.)

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Questions from the Board?

23 (No response.)

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 All in favor of a two-year for these



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 ones that were just read out, a two-year reduction in  
2 exemption length renewal, indicate with an "aye."

3 (Several members respond "aye.")

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 All opposed with a "nay."

6 (No response.)

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 Motion carries.

9 MR. CAGE:

10 Which one we just gave the two-year to,  
11 may I ask?

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 '15. The ones that were due December  
14 31st of 14.

15 MR. JONES:

16 There's four of them, Mr. Harris --  
17 excuse me -- Mr. Cage.

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 Mr. Usef (sic).

20 MR. USIE:

21 Usie.

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 Usie, please read the ones that expire  
24 in '16.

25 MR. USIE:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   061914, Cos-Mar Company, Iberville  
2 Parish. Expiration 12/31 of '16, renewal received 1/9  
3 of 2018; 2008-0162A, Cos-Mar Company, Iberville Parish.  
4 Expiration 12/31 of '16, received 1/9/2018; 20080941A,  
5 Cos-Mar Company, Iberville Parish, 12/31/16, initial  
6 expiration date, received 1/9 of 2018; 20090678, Cos-Mar  
7 Company, Iberville Parish, expiration 12/31/2018,  
8 received 1/9 of 2018; 20120205, Cos-Mar Company,  
9 Iberville Parish, expiration 12/31/2016, received 1/9 of  
10 2018.

11                   MR. WINDHAM:

12                   And the TOTAL Petrochemicals.

13                   MR. USIE:

14                   20120433, TOTAL Petrochemicals USA,  
15 Inc., Iberville Parish, contract expiration 12/31/2016,  
16 renewal request January 9th, 2018.

17                   MR. WINDHAM:

18                   All right. There's motion on the floor  
19 to -- I believe those are the ones -- by Mr. Miller to  
20 restrict those by one year for their renewal; seconded  
21 by Mr. Slone.

22                   Any questions from the Board?

23                   (No response.)

24                   MR. WINDHAM:

25                   Comments from the public?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Please identify yourself.

2 MR. BAGERT:

3 Broderick Bagert with Together  
4 Louisiana.

5 When you set the precedent, you only  
6 want to get it right, and that's the only reason I rise  
7 that right now, someone who was supposed to have  
8 submitted it by December 31st, 2017 and was a month and  
9 a day late is being treated the same as someone who was  
10 supposed to have submitted by December 31st, 2016. And  
11 I think that, Mr. Miller, that was your intent to have  
12 the different radiations, and just in terms of how the  
13 motion was worded, we didn't do that. We gave the 2015  
14 a two-year, which would give the 2016 a one-year, and we  
15 already gave the 2017 a one-year. So if they're going  
16 to be a consistent standard, it ought to be under a  
17 year, 20 percent, a year to two years -- and since this  
18 looks like it may be something that is carried forward  
19 in the future, we would propose amending that to have it  
20 being consistent across the board.

21 MR. MILLER:

22 I do understand I did that, and I took  
23 it under consideration. I guess I'm just a lenient  
24 parent on the first time you mess up.

25 MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 Any other questions or comments from the  
2 public?

3 (No response.)

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

6 (Several members respond "aye.")

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 All opposed with a "nay."

9 (No response.)

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 Motion carries.

12 Usie, please proceed.

13 MR. USIE:

14 The next one, 20130816, Graham

15 Packaging, LLC, Tangipahoa Parish. Initial expiration

16 12/31/2015, late renewal received 1/25 of 2017.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 All right. Is there any anyone here for

19 Graham Packaging, LLC? Gentleman rising in the back, I

20 believe may be him. No. All right. We have no

21 representative from Graham Packing.

22 MR. JONES:

23 Motion to deny.

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 Motion has been made by Mr. Jones to



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 deny; seconded by Dr. Wilson.

2 Any other questions from the Board?

3 (No response.)

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 Comments from the public?

6 (No response.)

7 MR. WINDHAM:

8 All in favor of denying this

9 application, indicate with an "aye."

10 (Several members respond "aye.")

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 All opposed with a "nay."

13 (No response.)

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 Motion carries.

16 MR. USIE:

17 Next we have 20130874, Hunt Forest

18 Products, Inc., La Salle Parish. Initial expiration

19 12/31 of '15, renewal request date 1/3 of 2018. We also

20 have 20130873, Hunt Forest Products, LLC, Grant Parish.

21 Initial expiration 12/31 of 2015, renewal received

22 January 3rd of 2018.

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 Do we have a representative from Hunt

25 Forest Products?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Please step forward and identify  
2 yourself.

3                   MS. BOATNER:

4                   Rhonda Boatner with Didier Consultants.

5                   I'm waiting to get the PCR from my  
6 client, but looking at this advance number or this  
7 application number, unless it was filed late, I can't  
8 imagine that a 2013 advance would have expired in 2015.

9                   You think it was filed late, so they  
10 lost on the -- okay. Well, I'm waiting on the PCR from  
11 my client, which is a project completion report, to show  
12 the dates that this contract covered, but if it were  
13 filed late, then that would explain why the 2015  
14 expiration date rather than 2017 expiration date.

15                  MR. WINDHAM:

16                  Are you saying it was filed late on the  
17 front end, so the first five-year period was shortened?

18                  MS. BOATNER:

19                  Was shortened, correct. Correct.

20                  MR. WINDHAM:

21                  Therefore, it came up for renewal before  
22 2018, which would have been the normal expectation?

23                  MS. BOATNER:

24                  Correct. Correct. And so I'm waiting  
25 for the client to send me the PCR.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   We just got engaged with them in January  
2 of this year, and so -- but Kristin is saying that she  
3 thinks that this application -- original application was  
4 filed late.

5                   MR. WINDHAM:

6                   All right. So --

7                   MS. BOATNER:

8                   So could we defer this to have further  
9 review at the next meeting, we could have a better  
10 information for this?

11                  MR. JONES:

12                  Ms. Boatner, would that be for both Hunt  
13 Forest Products?

14                  MS. BOATNER:

15                  Correct, correct.

16                  MR. JONES:

17                  So move.

18                  MR. WINDHAM:

19                  All right. Motion's been made; seconded  
20 by -- I'm sorry. Motion has been made by Mr. Jones;  
21 seconded by Mr. Slone -- I'm sorry -- by Major Coleman  
22 to defer this application.

23                  Any objection?

24                  (No response.)

25                  MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Seeing none, these are deferred till the  
2 next meeting.

3                   MS. BOATNER:

4                   Thank you.

5                   MR. WINDHAM:

6                   Thank you.

7                   Usie, please proceed.

8                   MR. USIE:

9                   Next we have 20110439, Nalco Company,  
10 West Baton Rouge Parish. Initial expiration 12/31 of  
11 '15, renewal request date 12/28/2017; 20110442, Nalco  
12 Company, Lafayette Parish. Initial expiration date  
13 12/31 of '15, renewal request date 12/28/2017.

14                  MR. WINDHAM:

15                  Welcome. Please identify yourself.

16                  MR. FATHEREE:

17                  Thank you. My name is Bruce Fatherree.  
18 I work for the DuCharme McMillen. I represent Nalco.

19                  MR. WINDHAM:

20                  All right. And why were your  
21 applications late?

22                  MR. FATHEREE:

23                  Our circumstance is very similar to  
24 Cos-Mar's. While preparing the 2017 renewals this year,  
25 we noticed that the 2015s had not been done. And



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 looking back through it, the paperwork had been done,  
2 but the clerk at the company, whose job it was to  
3 prepare the check and get the final signatures,  
4 apparently had fell through the cracks on that end. And  
5 that's it.

6 MR. WINDHAM:

7 All right. Mr. Miller.

8 MR. MILLER:

9 I make a motion we reduce the renewal by  
10 two years.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Is there a second?

13 Second by Mr. Fajardo.

14 Any questions or comments from the Board  
15 members?

16 (No response.)

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Any comments from the public?

19 (No response.)

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 All in favor of a two-year reduction for  
22 these applications, please indicate with an "aye."

23 (Several members respond "aye.")

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 All opposed with a "nay."



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 (No response.)

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 Motion carries.

4 MR. FATHEREE:

5 Thank you.

6 MR. USIE:

7 That concludes the late renewals, and  
8 Kristin will take back over for the specials.

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 It wasn't that painful, was it?

11 MR. USIE:

12 No.

13 MR. JONES:

14 When you got his name right.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 That's always a challenge for me.

17 MS. CHENG:

18 I have two change in name contract  
19 amendment requests. Entergy New Orleans, Inc. - AB  
20 Patterson Solar Plant, Contract 20151305 in Orleans  
21 Parish is changing to Entergy New Orleans, LLC - AB  
22 Patterson Solar Plant. And we have Westlake  
23 Petrochemical, LLC, Contract 20130803 in Calcasieu  
24 Parish changing to Westlake Chemical OPCO LP.

25 MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 All right. Is there a motion for the  
2 name changes only?

3 Made by Secretary Barham; seconded by  
4 Mr. Slone.

5 Any questions or comments from the  
6 Board?

7 (No response.)

8 MR. WINDHAM:

9 Comments from the public concerning the  
10 name change?

11 (No response.)

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
14 (Several members respond "aye.")

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 All opposed with a "nay."

17 (No response.)

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 Motion carries.

20 MS. CHENG:

21 I have one change in location only  
22 request, and it's from Air Products and Chemicals, Inc.,  
23 Contract 20170493. I think this was just an address  
24 change from the post office. They're not actually  
25 moving their site, but the previous address was on the



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 contract as 9156 Highway 75, Geismar, Louisiana 70734 in  
2 Ascension Parish, and their new address is 9190 Highway  
3 75, Geismar, Louisiana 70734 in Ascension Parish.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 Is there a motion to accept the change  
6 in location?

7 Made by Dr. Wilson; seconded by  
8 Representative Carmody.

9 Any comments from the public?

10 (No response.)

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Questions from the Board members?

13 (No response.)

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

16 (Several members respond "aye.")

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 All opposed with a "nay."

19 (No response.)

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 Motion carries.

22 MS. CHENG:

23 I have eight Tax Exemption contract  
24 transfers. Georgia-Pacific Wood Products South, LLC in  
25 Beauregard Parish, Contracts 20090733, 20100582,



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 20110341, 20120368, 20130719, 20140920, 20150719,  
2 20140920, 20150703 and 20161077. They are requesting a  
3 transfer to Georgia-Pacific Wood Products, LLC.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 Is there a motion to approve the  
6 transfer of these contracts to the new name?

7 Motion by made Mr. Williams; seconded by  
8 Mr. Slone.

9 Any comments from the public?

10 (No response.)

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Questions from the Board members?

13 (No response.)

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

16 (Several members respond "aye.")

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 All opposed with a "nay."

19 (No response.)

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 Motion carries.

22 MS. CHENG:

23 I have seven partial contract transfers  
24 for Hexion, Inc., Contract 20090375 in St. Charles  
25 Parish will be retaining \$2,077,435 in assets and Shell



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Chemical, LP will be receiving \$993,455 in assets;  
2 Hexion, Inc., Contract 20100539 in St. Charles Parish  
3 will be retaining \$3,909,958 in assets in St. Charles  
4 Parish and Shell Chemical will be receiving \$856,872 in  
5 assets in St. Charles Parish; Hexion, Inc., Contract  
6 20110167 will be retaining \$1,794,987 in assets in St.  
7 Charles. Shell Chemical, LP will be receiving  
8 \$2,481,247 in assets in St. Charles Parish; Hexion,  
9 Inc., Contract 20120228 in St. Charles Parish will be  
10 retaining \$2,513,919 in assets and Shell Chemical, LP  
11 will be receiving \$1,075,740 in St. Charles Parish;  
12 Hexion, Inc., 20130603, Hexion will be retaining  
13 \$1,067,311 in ST. Charles Parish, Shell Chemical, LP  
14 will be receiving \$1,215,614 in St. Charles Parish;  
15 Hexion, Contract 20140607 will be retaining \$1,454,407  
16 in St. Charles Parish, Shell Chemical will be receiving  
17 \$1,335,202 in St. Charles Parish; Hexion, Contract  
18 20150448 will be retaining \$2,296,942 in assets in St.  
19 Charles and Shell Chemical, LP will be receiving  
20 \$2,690,493 in St. Charles Parish.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Is there a motion to approve the partial  
23 transfers?

24 REPRESENTATIVE CARMODY:

25 So moved.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. WINDHAM:

Made by Representative Carmody; seconded  
by Ms. Atkins.

Any questions from Board members?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Comments from the public?

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

(Several members respond "aye.")

MR. WINDHAM:

All opposed with a "nay."

(No response.)

MR. WINDHAM:

Motion carries.

MS. CHENG:

I have 30 contract cancelations. Dolese Bros. Co., Inc. in Ascension Parish, Contracts 20100335 and 20140470 requests location has been closed. Company requests cancelation; Dolese Bros. Company, Inc. in East Baton Rouge Parish, Contracts 20080373, 20090921, 20090922, 20100323, 20100333, 20120437, 20130446, 20130447, 2015-218 and 20161160, location has been closed. Company requests cancelation; Dolese Bros.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Company, Inc. in East Feliciana Parish, Contracts  
2 20120436 and 20130449, location has been closed.  
3 Company requests cancelation; and Dolese Bros. Company,  
4 Inc. in Iberville Parish, Contract 20130451, location  
5 has been closed. Company requests cancelation.

6 Hexion, Inc. in St. Charles Parish,  
7 Contracts 20090375, 20100539, 20110167, 20120228,  
8 20130603, 20140607, 20150448 and 20150449, LED was  
9 notified by the assessor that the manufacturing facility  
10 has been closed. Company has been notified. Staff  
11 requests cancelation.

12 And Intralox, LLC in Tangipahoa Parish,  
13 Contracts 070758, 20100431, 20101093A, 20130440,  
14 20140547, 20150471 and 20161163, Intralox entered into a  
15 PILOT with Tangipahoa Parish. Company requests  
16 cancelation.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 I have two -- I have one question  
19 actually. So when we cancel these contracts, LED,  
20 unless it's initiated by the assessor, notifies the  
21 assessors that we have canceled these contacts?

22 MS. CHENG:

23 Correct. Yes, sir.

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 Thank you.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Is there a motion to approve the  
2                   cancelations?

3                   Made by Dr. Wilson; seconded by Ms.  
4                   Heather.

5                   All in favor -- I'm sorry. Any  
6                   questions or comments by the public?

7                   (No response.)

8                   MR. WINDHAM:

9                   Questions -- yes, Heather.

10                  MS. MALONE:

11                  So the contracts that are being canceled  
12                  by Hexion, will it just be their portion that they  
13                  retained?

14                  MS. CHENG:

15                  Yes.

16                  MS. MALONE:

17                  Okay. So Shell will keep their portion?

18                  MS. CHENG:

19                  Correct.

20                  MS. MALONE:

21                  Okay.

22                  MR. WINDHAM:

23                  Hence the need for the transfer first  
24                  before you do the cancelation.

25                  Any other questions?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 (No response.)

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 Comments from the public?

4 (No response.)

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

7 (Several members respond "aye.")

8 MR. WINDHAM.

9 All opposed with a "nay."

10 (No response.)

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Motion carries.

13 Now, I believe we are to the appeals.

14 MS. CHENG:

15 CARBO Ceramics has requested that we  
16 defer their appeal to the April Board meeting.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 All right. Can you remind all of the  
19 Board members what these appeals are related to, just  
20 the high-level.

21 MS. CHENG:

22 These appeals are related to the motion  
23 that the Board passed in December allowing applicants  
24 that filed applications after the Executive Order, but  
25 without an advance, but had their project complete prior



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 to the Executive Order to come to y'all for  
2 consideration. These were denied previously.

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 And there were 16 of them, I believe,  
5 that were still outstanding; is that right?

6 MS. CHENG:

7 There were -- I think there were about  
8 16, but a few of the companies declined to go through  
9 this process.

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 Go through the process?

12 MS. CHENG:

13 Yes.

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 And they're noted on here?

16 MS. CHENG:

17 The ones that declined, no.

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 No. Okay.

20 Mr. House, do you have observations or  
21 comments?

22 MR. HOUSE:

23 Okay. On this request for deferral,  
24 what you need to be aware of is that the motion that was  
25 passed -- offered by Mr. Miller and passed unanimously



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 by the Board requires that all of these --

2 MS. CHENG:

3 Oh, that's a different appeal. CARBO's  
4 not related to --

5 MR. HOUSE:

6 I'm sorry. I apologize.

7 MS. CHENG:

8 It's okay.

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 We spoke -- I spoke with staff related  
11 to this CARBO and asked for some evidentiary information  
12 to show that they had, in fact, operational before we  
13 took an action, and they didn't -- they're gathering it.  
14 So they asked for a deferral until they can gather it.

15 So motion for the deferral of the CARBO  
16 ones?

17 Made by Dr. Wilson; seconded by Jan  
18 Moller.

19 All opposed to deferral?

20 (No response.)

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 Approved. Deferral is approved.

23 Please proceed.

24 MS. CHENG:

25 We have two applications where we



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 received all of the documents that y'all requested, the  
2 local approvals for Hunt Forest Products, Inc.  
3 Application 20170137 in Grant Parish and Shield Pack,  
4 LLC, Application 20170083 in Ouachita Parish.

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 All of these have been reviewed and  
7 verified by staff and --

8 MR. CHENG:

9 I have reviewed those local approvals.

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 All right. If everyone will remember,  
12 they were originally denied, and we were able, with  
13 Mr. Miller's motion, to open them back up for  
14 consideration, and that's where they are today. We  
15 asked them to bring forth letters of no opposition or  
16 letters of support or just document -- you know, for the  
17 locals to show they were in support of the project  
18 before we would take any action to the contrary. So I  
19 don't know if I need to reopen or reconsider the  
20 approval that was done before.

21 MR. HOUSE:

22 I'd recommend that you grant the appeal,  
23 and then once the appeal has been granted, you can, at  
24 that point in time, reconsider, by a motion, the  
25 exemption, but you need to do both things today under



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 the terms of the prior motion.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 All right. Absolutely.

4 Is there a motion to grant the appeal?

5 Motion is made by President Miller;

6 seconded by Mr. Jones.

7 Any questions or comment from the Board?

8 (No response.)

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 Comments from the public?

11 (No response.)

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

14 (Several members respond "aye.")

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Motion carries.

17 Now we have to reconsider or consider

18 the request being made. These companies have, in fact,

19 provided all of the documents that we asked for,

20 Mr. Miller. So since it was your ball before, I'm going

21 give it back to you.

22 MR. MILLER:

23 I do have a question. Were they denied

24 only because they were considered MCAs? Did we look at

25 what they manufacturer and all of that? All of that's



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1     been clarified and verified?

2                   MS. CHENG:

3                   Yes, sir.

4                   MR. MILLER:

5                   Okay. I make the motion that we grant  
6 the first five year -- is this a renewal or new?

7                   MS. CHENG:

8                   It's new.

9                   MR. MILLER:

10                   -- the first five-year exemption.

11                   MR. WINDHAM:

12                   For both Hunt Products --

13                   MR. MILLER:

14                   For both, yes, sir.

15                   MR. WINDHAM:

16                   -- and Shield Pack, LLC?

17                   MR. MILLER:

18                   That's correct.

19                   MR. WINDHAM:

20                   So specifically it's Hunt Forest  
21 Products, Application 20170137 in Grant Parish and  
22 Shield Pack, LLC, Application 20170083 in Ouachita  
23 Parish.

24                   Is there a second?

25                   Second is made by Major Coleman.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Are there any questions from the Board  
2 members?

3                   (No response.)

4                   MR. WINDHAM:

5                   Are there any comments from the public?

6                   (No response.)

7                   MR. WINDHAM:

8                   All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

9                   (Several members respond "aye.")

10                  MR. WINDHAM:

11                  All opposed with a "nay."

12                  (No response.)

13                  MR. WINDHAM:

14                  Motion carries.

15                  MR. JONES:

16                  Good save.

17                  MS. CHENG:

18                  The following companies requested to  
19 have an appeal, but I have not received any of the local  
20 resolution approvals. That would be Cactus Wellhead,  
21 LLC, Application 20170165 in Bossier Parish; Calumet  
22 Lubricants Company, LP, Application 20170189 in Bossier  
23 Parish; and Calumet Shreveport Lubricants & Waxes, LLC,  
24 Applications 20170190 and 20170191 and 20170192 in Caddo  
25 Parish.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. WINDHAM:

2 And, Ms. Cheng, can you verify that we,  
3 me specifically, have had conversations with the staff,  
4 and I directed you guys to reach out to all of the  
5 companies, send them an e-mail and go the distance to  
6 give them an opportunity to gather the documents, make  
7 the calls, have someone show up here, anything that we  
8 could do to extend the hand to them and help them to  
9 move this forward?

10 MS. CHENG:

11 Correct.

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 We did all of that?

14 MS. CHENG:

15 We did.

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 Mr. House, as I understand the motion  
18 and from your statement earlier, action has to be taken  
19 today as per the previous motion?

20 MR. HOUSE:

21 Correct.

22 MR. JONES:

23 MR. Chairman?

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 Please, Mr. Jones.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. JONES:

2 Ms. Cheng, do we know that -- have their  
3 applications been denied by the local government or have  
4 they not gone through the -- taken the steps to get the  
5 approval?

6 MS. CHENG:

7 I just haven't gotten an approval and  
8 never gotten a denial, no.

9 DR. WILSON:

10 I can answer that question for you.

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 Dr. Wilson. Please speak into the mic.

13 DR. WILSON:

14 Yes, sir. We have received the local  
15 application from Calumet, and it should be coming before  
16 our board next month sometime. So we've gotten the  
17 applications I think last Thursday. They updated the  
18 applications. We have a local ITEP review committee.  
19 They're going to convene, which is the school board, the  
20 City of Shreveport, the sheriff department as well as  
21 Caddo commission.

22 Once that committee convenes, they make  
23 a recommendation to the governing authorities, then we  
24 will act on it, but right now, it's in the process of  
25 being renewed.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. WINDHAM:

2 Mr. House, can you help me out on that?

3 MR. HOUSE:

4 I don't believe that's with respect to  
5 those, sir. I think that's a new application for  
6 something else. It's not with respect to this  
7 application as far as we know. They have not -- I think  
8 that's a new application that they have with --

9 DR. WILSON:

10 That's what it says at the bottom of the  
11 footnote that they have not received support from the  
12 local governing authority on the request.

13 MR. WINDHAM:

14 Well, Dr. Wilson, I believe maybe I can  
15 help a little bit. We have -- these were projects that  
16 were completed before the Executive Order placed into  
17 service, and the argument's made that they didn't file  
18 subject to the Executive Order. And I believe  
19 Mr. Miller's compromise, motion, worked that out where  
20 those could move forward because these don't have to  
21 have a resolution. They just have to have support.  
22 That could have been someone coming and saying, "We  
23 support the project."

24 DR. WILSON:

25 From local government?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 MR. ADLEY:

2 I think Mr. Miller may ought to address  
3 that. I thought he required the local approval even  
4 with his compromise. I believe that's what we did.

5 MR. MILLER:

6 I'd have to read the motion to make  
7 sure, but I'm pretty sure.

8 MS. CHENG:

9 I think Dr. Wilson is referring to other  
10 applications that Calumet has in with advances from  
11 after the Executive Order. These fall into a completely  
12 different bucket.

13 MR. ADLEY:

14 Okay. But is this the list, is this the  
15 list that was a group of them that --

16 MS. CHENG:

17 Yes, sir.

18 MR. ADLEY:

19 This is that list. And that motion was  
20 made as a compromise so we can file the -- I remember it  
21 was a very small company that started all of this and,  
22 Robby, you fought the battle and put it together for  
23 everybody, but he required -- I think in that motion, I  
24 think he clearly required that you had to get that local  
25 approval.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. HOUSE:

2 Yes.

3 MR. ADLEY:

4 And I think that would apply to these.

5 MR. WINDHAM:

6 The only thing that I was pointing out,  
7 Mr. Adley, is that local approval wasn't a formal  
8 resolution. It was more of, you know, "We'll come" --  
9 because I've told them they could come to the table and  
10 say that they supported it and this Board would probably  
11 accept that. It didn't have to be a formalized  
12 resolution, a formalized letter.

13 MR. ADLEY:

14 I don't want to correct you, but local  
15 government doesn't operate in a unformalized manner.

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 Okay.

18 MR. ADLEY:

19 They have to pass resolutions and do  
20 things. I mean, that's -- you can't have somebody from  
21 a local government show up and say, "Oh, I'm for that."

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 Okay.

24 MR. ADLEY:

25 They have to take action. I think he's



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 correct. I think they're going to have to do that.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 All right. All right. So those that  
4 did not comply with the wishes that have to have this in  
5 today, I don't think anything needs to be done because  
6 they've already been denied.

7 MR. JONES:

8 I think we have to act. They've asked  
9 for an appeal, so we have to consider their appeal.

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 Oh, we have to consider their appeal.  
12 Okay.

13 Is there a motion --

14 MR. MILLER:

15 I have a question first. In my motion,  
16 which, of course, I don't remember every detail of it,  
17 is there a deadline that they have to have everything in  
18 and filed so we can move forward or did we give them a  
19 timeframe?

20 MS. BOURGEOIS:

21 There wasn't a date in your motion to  
22 have the information in. However, we did issue a letter  
23 to all of the companies issuing internal deadlines, and  
24 the key for consideration today is that for  
25 consideration, these applications must occur today, by



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 today, and they can't occur after this date. So we  
2 can't postpone. And, yes, those companies are in  
3 violation of the LED internally set deadlines for  
4 providing us the required documentation.

5 MR. MILLER:

6 With that being an internal deadline,  
7 though, the Board has the ability to extend this or not?

8 MS. BOURGEOIS:

9 At this point, you don't have -- you  
10 can't extend the consideration; therefore, you can't  
11 extend any of the deadlines.

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 So in that motion, there was a deadline  
14 for consideration?

15 MS. BOURGEOIS:

16 Yes, sir.

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 And I asked you guys to tell them to  
19 send this stuff in by a certain date because I was  
20 really trying to push them to sign, just tell us one way  
21 or the other. So within your motion, it had to be  
22 considered at this Board meeting. I don't know if that  
23 was date specific or not.

24 MR. HOUSE:

25 It is date specific.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MS. BOURGEOIS:

2 February 28th.

3 MR. MILLER:

4 We did tell them. Okay. And these  
5 were -- not necessarily these specific. These five were  
6 the only ones out of 16 that even attempted to begin the  
7 process?

8 MS. BOURGEOIS:

9 Yes.

10 MS. CHENG:

11 And the two that you just approved.

12 MR. MILLER:

13 Right. Yeah, I counted those. So --  
14 all right.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 These five companies have had more than  
17 five applications, just to point that out.

18 MR. MILLER:

19 Yes.

20 MR. WINDHAM:

21 So is there a motion concerning the  
22 request for the appeal?

23 MR. MILLER:

24 I did all I could do to help them. I  
25 make the motion that these contracts, Wellhead, Calumet



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 and Calumet Shreveport, that they're denied.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 So the motion to deny the appeal  
4 request -- deny to the hear the appeal has been made.

5 Is there a second?

6 Seconded by Mr. Jones.

7 Any other questions from the Board?

8 (No response.)

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 Comments from the public?

11 Please step forward, identify yourself.

12 MS. SADLER:

13 Jennifer Sadler for Calumet.

14 We did send the information over to  
15 Caddo and Bossier requesting them to look at this and  
16 give us the resolution that you guys requested at the  
17 December meeting. We also have the Northern Economic --  
18 (inaudible) -- with us, and she also sent the  
19 information over. So it wasn't that we weren't trying.  
20 We just don't have an answer yet.

21 MR. JONES:

22 Excuse me. Mr. Chairman?

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 Mr. Jones.

25 MR. JONES:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   When did you request the information of  
2 Caddo Parish?

3                   MS SADLER:

4                   In January, the first time, when Zell  
5 sent it over, Zell Dudley. And then also we sent it at  
6 the beginning of February.

7                   MR. JONES:

8                   I'm trying to understand the timeline.  
9 It looks like, to me, the first time this was decided  
10 was by the Board in December, and so you asked for it in  
11 January and just did not get action at all?

12                  MS. SADLER:

13                  Nope.

14                  MR. JONES:

15                  Did any of the -- anybody from --

16                  MS. SADLER:

17                  I know they're working on it because  
18 Erica Bryant contacted us.

19                  MR. JONES:

20                  And is this Caddo and Bossier?

21                  MS. SADLER:

22                  That's Caddo. And then we also heard  
23 from Joe Buffington, I think is his name, from Bossier.  
24 So I know they're looking at it.

25                  DR. WILSON:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Mr. Jones, could I answer that?

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 Yes, Dr. Wilson.

4 DR. WILSON:

5 Yes, sir. We did consider that  
6 initially in January, and for some reason, the  
7 application didn't meet all of the matrix and we asked  
8 them if they want to consider putting that in or putting  
9 in a compelling reason why they should go beyond the not  
10 listing of jobs. And they did send us another revision  
11 of that application in February that we have yet to act  
12 on.

13 MR. WINDHAM:

14 Thank you.

15 Any other questions?

16 (No response.)

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Any other comments from the lady?

19 Mr. Miller.

20 MR. MILLER:

21 I have a question. With the new  
22 information, because we have the motion to deny, if we  
23 vote yes to deny, I understand what that does. If we  
24 vote no, what does -- how does that change the result of  
25 their application?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 MR. JONES:  
2 Can I come at it from a different  
3 direction?

4 MR. WINDHAM:  
5 Please. Go ahead, Mr. Jones.

6 MR. JONES:  
7 If you're sympathetic to their plight,  
8 you want to deny your -- we want to turn down your  
9 motion denying their appeal and grant the appeal, and  
10 I'm not sure what happens at that point, Mr. House. If  
11 we have to act by this meeting.

12 MR. MILLER:  
13 Can I remove --

14 MR. JONES:  
15 Wait. Before we -- because we have to  
16 act by this meeting. Can we defer the appeal -- once we  
17 grant the appeal, can we defer acting on the appeal?  
18 I'm just trying -- what it sounds to me is that Calumet  
19 has done what we asked them to do. They've simply not  
20 gotten responses from the government agencies yet  
21 through no fault -- I'm assuming through no fault of  
22 their own.

23 MR. MILLER:  
24 And I understand with -- with our  
25 council, you have to --



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 MR. JONES:

2 It takes time.

3 MR. MILLER:

4 -- on the agenda and all of the things  
5 that have to happen to get it done. It just might have  
6 not fallen within the right dates.

7 MR. HOUSE:

8 Not advocating for one thing or the  
9 other. The only thing I'm advocating is that this thing  
10 come to an end, you know, one of these days. And you do  
11 have two people, who between December and now, two  
12 companies that you approved the appeal and approved the  
13 exemption for that complied with what needed to be done  
14 during this timeframe.

15 It's in the discretion -- you know, your  
16 motion can be amended. It could be amended to keep it  
17 open for everybody for a while. It can be amended, I  
18 guess, to keep it open for this company that's come here  
19 and explained its circumstances. So it's -- and I'm  
20 just relying on Robert's rules of order here, and the  
21 Chairman and Mr. Adley know more about it than I do. So  
22 my view is that you can do that. Whether you should do  
23 that, again, that's up to the Board's discretion.

24 MR. MILLER:

25 I think, just to add, if Dr. Wilson



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 wasn't here and wasn't intimately knowledgeable about  
2 the process, and he's part of the process, I would  
3 probably be a little more harsher or stubborn about it,  
4 but we know what the process is happening and we know  
5 where they are.

6 DR. WILSON:

7 May I offer a substitute motion to  
8 defer --

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 Yes, to defer.

11 DR. WILSON:

12 -- until the next meeting and we can  
13 complete our work at the government level at the time.

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 I don't think that's the appropriate  
16 motion.

17 MR. JONES:

18 If I may suggest -- and, Richard, I need  
19 your help on this, but it seems to me, what I'm inclined  
20 to do in order to accomplish what Dr. Wilson is asking  
21 for, I think, on behalf of Calumet, is what we need to  
22 do is to deny the motion, turn down the motion that's on  
23 the floor right now, which is to deny the appeal,  
24 substitute -- and then come back to move to grant the  
25 appeal for Calumet and then defer any action on the



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 appeal until the next meeting.

2 MR. HOUSE:

3 And you can either do that -- I'd  
4 recommend you do that solely for this company.

5 MR. JONES:

6 Yes. Yes.

7 MR. MILLER:

8 Is that both Calumet Lubricant and  
9 Shreveport?

10 MR. JONES:

11 The two Calumet entities.

12 MR. ADLEY:

13 And the reason for solely this company,  
14 all of the others had the same opportunity already. We  
15 just want to make sure the door is not open one more  
16 time, so we can get into this, "Oh, you let so and so do  
17 something, you've got to let me do something."

18 MR. HOUSE:

19 This company is still in process with  
20 Shreveport authorities, though, so that would be the  
21 reason for the exception if you grant it.

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 Can I ask one quick question? When I  
24 spoke with you, Ms. Cheng, y'all sent them an e-mail  
25 asking them what they were doing?



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. CHENG:

Uh-huh.

MR. WINDHAM:

Did they tell you?

MS. CHENG:

What do you mean?

MR. WINDHAM:

Did Calumet respond to your e-mailing asking for an update?

MS. CHENG:

Yes.

MR. WINDHAM:

Okay.

MS. CHENG:

They just said they were working on it and they didn't have them yet.

MR. WINDHAM:

Okay. All right.

DR. WILSON:

Can we include the Cactus Wellhead in that discussion as well?

MR. WINDHAM:

Closer to the mic, please.

DR. WILSON:

Can we include Cactus Wellhead in that



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 discussion as well? I think probably the same issues  
2 taken place in Bossier.

3 MR. WINDHAM:

4 Have they also come to your meeting?

5 DR. WILSON:

6 No, sir, not Bossier Parish. I think  
7 the same thing is going on in Bossier as well.

8 MR. JONES:

9 Is anybody here representing Cactus?

10 (No response.)

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 I know what that shake means.

13 MR. JONES:

14 I'm going tell you, of all of the people  
15 in this room not getting paid, I'm one of them.

16 DR. WILSON:

17 I'm speaking for the Parish of Caddo.

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 All right. So there's a motion on the  
20 floor to deny the appeals. The proper vote, if we want  
21 to move forward with this, is to reject that motion.

22 MR. HOUSE:

23 I think you could do a substitute motion  
24 that would take Calumet out of that motion. Strike  
25 Calumet from the motion, and then proceed with the



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 motion to deny the appeal.

2 DR. WILSON:

3 So move. I'd like to make that motion.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 So moved by Dr. Wilson; seconded by  
6 Mr. Miller.

7 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
8 (Several members respond "aye.")

9 MR. HOUSE:

10 Now the motion you have is to deny the  
11 appeal of the other company.

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 All right. So now -- I'm sorry.

14 All opposed?

15 (No response.)

16 MR. WINDHAM:

17 Motion carries.

18 Now, is there a motion to deny the  
19 appeal of the other company, Cactus Wellhead, LLC?

20 Motion has been made by Mr. Jones;  
21 seconded by Dr. Wilson.

22 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
23 (Several members respond "aye.")

24 MR. WINDHAM:

25 All opposed with a "nay."



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 (No response.)

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 Motion carries.

4 Next up is to --

5 MR. JONES:

6 I would then move that we defer any  
7 action on the appeal of the two Calumet entities until  
8 the next meeting.

9 MR. WINDHAM:

10 All right. Motion has been made to  
11 defer; seconded by --

12 MR. JONES:

13 Wait. Mr. House, I want to make sure.

14 MR. HOUSE:

15 And if that -- I just want to say, if  
16 that motion passes, then you need to amend Mr. Miller's  
17 motion back in December, written motion, doesn't need to  
18 be in writing at this time, but amend that motion so as  
19 to allow the time period to stay open until the next  
20 meeting for the two Calumets.

21 MR. JONES:

22 For Calumet.

23 MR. WINDHAM:

24 Is the next meeting enough?

25 MR. MILLER:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1                   Is that the deadline?

2                   MR. HOUSE:

3                   I think --

4                   MR. WINDHAM:

5                   I keep looking at these deadlines, and  
6 this process has been going on since the Executive Order  
7 was out. So it's impossible, in my eyes, to say the  
8 people that were in this boat didn't know that this  
9 might be coming and could have been preparing their oars  
10 to paddle, but for whatever reason, they didn't.

11                  MR. HOUSE:

12                  And that's worthy of consideration in  
13 the motion now before you.

14                  MR. ADLEY:

15                  I think it's a matter of you passed one  
16 motion, you've got it before you. You've denied some.  
17 You've got one you're granting an extension to. I think  
18 we're overcomplicating this. I do. It's limited to  
19 only those companies that's already happened, and now  
20 you're down to this one you want to grant an extension  
21 of time to.

22                  MR. WINDHAM:

23                  All right. So the motion has been made  
24 to extend the period by Mr. Jones; seconded by Dr.  
25 Wilson.



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 Any further discussion on that motion?

2 MR. JONES:

3 Well, one thing I think's important to  
4 consider is that local government, through Dr. Wilson,  
5 has expressed a desire on this issue, and I think that  
6 is significant. And it's not just the company asking  
7 for the extension. The local government is agreeing  
8 with it. So I think that is -- as we think about this  
9 moving forward, if we're ever faced with something like  
10 this again, people, tell your clients to bring local  
11 government if you want extensions. That sure helps.

12 MR. WINDHAM:

13 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
14 (Several members respond "aye.")

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 All opposed with a "nay."  
17 (No response.)

18 MR. WINDHAM:

19 Motion for the extension carries.

20 Ms. Heather.

21 MS. MALONE:

22 I just wanted to ask one thing. In the  
23 rules, with the regular application, don't we give the  
24 local governments a timeframe to reply within?

25 MR. WINDHAM:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 I believe we do. 120 days.

2 MS. MALONE:

3 Okay.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 All right. Now, Mr. Miller, I believe  
6 you need to open your previous motion to extend it by  
7 one board meeting to a certain date.

8 MR. MILLER:

9 Okay. The motion that opened these  
10 small projects, as I've tried to argue, small projects  
11 without advanced notification, should be completed by  
12 April meeting.

13 MR. HOUSE:

14 By the April Board meeting.

15 MR. MILLER:

16 By the April Board meeting.

17 MR. HOUSE:

18 Only for...

19 MR. MILLER:

20 Only for Calumet, the contracts that  
21 Calumet has here.

22 MR. WINDHAM:

23 I think it's four applications.

24 MR. MILLER:

25 I think it's one, two, three, four



1 applications.

2 MR. WINDHAM:

3 Is there a second?

4 Dr. Wilson.

5 Any further questions from the Board  
6 members?

7 (No response.)

8 MR. WINDHAM:

9 Comments from the public?

10 (No response.)

11 MR. WINDHAM:

12 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."

13 (Several members respond "aye.")

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 All opposed with a "nay."

16 (No response.)

17 MR. WINDHAM:

18 Motion carries.

19 All right. The last thing we have is  
20 election of officers, but before that, I want to take a  
21 moment of personal privilege and ask Ms. Clapinski to  
22 step to the table. Ms. Clapinski to step to the table.

23 Ms. Clapinski is leaving Economic

24 Development to return to her home or -- I guess you call  
25 it home, Louisiana Department of Revenue and Taxation,



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 so I wanted to personally thank her for all of the years  
2 that I've been around on this Board for the service and  
3 assistance that she has provided to previous Board  
4 members, existing Board members, thoughts, advice and  
5 everything, and I wanted to publicly recognize her and  
6 say thank you.

7 It's been fun.

8 MR. JONES:

9 A true professional.

10 MR. WINDHAM:

11 All right. Are y'all telling me there's  
12 one more thing on here?

13 SECRETARY PIERSON:

14 There's at least two.

15 MR. WINDHAM:

16 Post-CEO/CEA application summary. That  
17 is not on my agenda. I did Number 9. I mean, I did  
18 Number 8. That was the appeals; right?

19 MR. JONES:

20 Yes. You're down to Number 9.

21 MR. WINDHAM:

22 We're on election of officers, which is  
23 Number 9, which is why I wanted to do before -- that  
24 was the summary of the pages we dealt with a second ago.

25 All right. So we have election of



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 officers. Secretary Pierson.

2 SECRETARY PIERSON:

3 In accordance with our enabling  
4 legislation, Revised Statute 51:926, our officers serve  
5 for a period of one year. So, therefore, our process  
6 requires an annual election of a chairman and vice  
7 chairman. There's no prohibition against officers  
8 succeeding themselves. All members serve with no  
9 compensation.

10 So I'll now open the floor for  
11 nominations for chairman.

12 MR. MILLER:

13 I nominate we stay with all of the same  
14 officers for another term.

15 DR. WILSON:

16 Second.

17 SECRETARY PIERSON:

18 Motion has been made and seconded to  
19 retain the current chairman and vice chairman of the  
20 Board of Commerce and Industry.

21 With no others submitted, that will move  
22 forward by --

23 DR. WILSON:

24 Close.

25 SECRETARY PIERSON:



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1                   Okay. Nominations are closed as a  
2 motion by Dr. Wilson.

3                   MR. WINDHAM:

4                   Seconded by Mr. Slone.

5                   SECRETARY PIERSON:

6                   And all in favor, say "aye."

7                   (Several members respond "aye.")

8                   SECRETARY PIERSON:

9                   Thank you for helping us dispatch that  
10 important housekeeping feature.

11                  MR. WINDHAM:

12                  I get a raise; right? I get double my  
13 salary.

14                  MR. ADLEY:

15                  Don, before you begin, I just want the  
16 record to reflect the Governor's office didn't keep us  
17 past the noon hour today. Y'all did very good work on  
18 your own, so it was enough that kept you here.

19                  SECRETARY PIERSON:

20                  I'll proceed with some comments and  
21 remarks, and recognizing that the hour grows late, just  
22 for your overall information, we've been tracking very  
23 well here in the first part of 2018, certainly with DXE  
24 Technology that announced in New Orleans in November.  
25 We've been very active in moving them forward with



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 meeting throughout the community and various education  
2 institutions, continuing to make progress against that.

3 I hope you had a chance to see that we  
4 released an economic impact statement relative to what  
5 the Department of Defense allocations mean to our state,  
6 Barksdale, Fort Polk, Belle Chasse, our National Guard  
7 component and others, with a 7.7-billion annual impact.  
8 Quite impressive. And those statistics help us continue  
9 to lobby and work on their behalf in Washington DC.

10 Pleased to see Entergy break ground on  
11 an \$872-million power plant in Calcasieu Parish. As you  
12 know, we have \$110-billion of construction either  
13 completed or underway there, so to have the power  
14 capacity to continue to serve those plants is very  
15 important and a great opportunity to move forward.

16 BASF announced for Ascension Parish an  
17 additional investment of \$150-million, CenturyLink  
18 adding 150 jobs in Monroe. Excited about that.

19 Some great news yesterday. Up in  
20 Shreveport, you'll recall that you provided some support  
21 to Metro Aviation, but they announced they're purchasing  
22 25 Airbus helicopters, and they do a conversion there in  
23 Shreveport. So that's a lot of work moving forward with  
24 some really advanced manufacturing. It's a very  
25 impressive facility to tour, and they employ more than



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



1 150 people in Shreveport.

2 I would also point out that at 8 o'clock  
3 this morning, we announced that Hunt Forest Products  
4 will construct a state-of-the-art lumber production  
5 facility, and that will be a \$115-million investment.  
6 It will be a sawmill that will create 110 new direct  
7 jobs and 307 new indirect jobs for a total of 417.  
8 That's random that that happened at 8 o'clock this  
9 morning.

10 But I have heard clearly from some Board  
11 and from someone in the audience that they'd like a  
12 better understanding of how we calculate return on  
13 investment. So I'm going to take this as a case study  
14 and formulate a document that walks you through a return  
15 on investment analysis of this particular project, and  
16 that information will be provided to the Board and made  
17 available to Together Louisiana and others with an  
18 interest on just how you calculate return on investment.  
19 And as had previously been stated, depending on  
20 assumptions made and many factors that go into a model,  
21 you will never find two that have the same outcomes. I  
22 find that economists don't always agree on things, but  
23 hopefully we are going to demonstrate that there's no  
24 reason to have concern, that this is a  
25 mathematically-supported analysis and does provide a



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1 great return on investment for this state.

2 With that, I'll conclude my  
3 remarks.

4 MR. WINDHAM:

5 Thank you, Mr. Secretary.

6 Is there any further business?

7 (No response.)

8 MR. WINDHAM:

9 Motion to adjourn?

10 Made by Mayor Brasseaux; seconded by  
11 Major Coleman.

12 All in favor, indicate with an "aye."  
13 (Several members respond "aye.")

14 MR. WINDHAM:

15 Motion carries.

16 (Meeting concludes at 12:11 p.m.)

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

1     **REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE:**

2                     I, ELICIA H. WOODWORTH, Certified Court  
3 Reporter in and for the State of Louisiana, as the  
4 officer before whom this meeting for the Board of  
5 Commerce and Industry of the Louisiana Economic  
6 Development Corporation, do hereby certify that this  
7 meeting was reported by me in the stenotype reporting  
8 method, was prepared and transcribed by me or under my  
9 personal direction and supervision, and is a true and  
10 correct transcript to the best of my ability and  
11 understanding;

12                     That the transcript has been prepared in  
13 compliance with transcript format required by statute or  
14 by rules of the board, that I have acted in compliance  
15 with the prohibition on contractual relationships, as  
16 defined by Louisiana Code of Civil Procedure Article  
17 1434 and in rules and advisory opinions of the board;

18                     That I am not related to counsel or to the  
19 parties herein, nor am I otherwise interested in the  
20 outcome of this matter.

21     Dated this 18th day of March, 2018.

22  
23  
24  
25

\_\_\_\_\_  
ELICIA H. WOODWORTH, CCR  
CERTIFIED COURT REPORTER



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
www.torresreporting.com  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

	<b>1/27</b> 16:24	<b>150</b> 168:18	<b>20101093A</b> 133:13
<b>\$</b>	<b>1/28/2013</b> 16:24	<b>15s</b> 110:7,19 111:3	<b>20110079</b> 80:5
<b>\$1,067,311</b> 131:13	<b>1/3</b> 122:19	<b>15th</b> 13:18,24 38:4 86:8	<b>20110167</b> 131:6 133:7
<b>\$1,075,740</b> 131:11	<b>1/4/2018</b> 80:10	<b>16</b> 85:14 111:8 112:2 113:22 118:24 119:2,4 136:4,8 149:6	<b>20110331</b> 114:3
<b>\$1,215,614</b> 131:14	<b>1/9</b> 114:1,3 119:2,6,8,9	<b>16s</b> 111:3	<b>20110332</b> 114:5
<b>\$1,335,202</b> 131:17	<b>1/9/2018</b> 114:5,6 119:4	<b>17th</b> 13:16	<b>20110341</b> 130:1
<b>\$1,454,407</b> 131:15	<b>10</b> 15:8 41:4 50:12	<b>18</b> 111:6	<b>20110439</b> 125:9
<b>\$1,794,987</b> 131:6	<b>10-year</b> 36:19 50:12	<b>1st</b> 75:14 76:5 80:4,6,8 86:25	<b>20110442</b> 125:11
<b>\$1.8-million</b> 99:24 101:9	<b>100</b> 53:9 58:13 63:22		<b>20110863</b> 17:5
<b>\$110-billion</b> 168:12	<b>101</b> 64:20		<b>20120205</b> 119:8
<b>\$150-million</b> 168:17	<b>102</b> 48:6	<b>2</b>	<b>20120206</b> 16:22
<b>\$19,933,758</b> 12:13	<b>103</b> 47:24		<b>20120228</b> 131:9 133:7
<b>\$2,077,435</b> 130:25	<b>11</b> 56:12	<b>20</b> 75:11 77:5 78:23 82:18 90:13,17,25 98:21,25 100:11,13 101:3,14 109:1 110:18, 23 114:25 115:2,15,21, 24 120:17	<b>20120245</b> 9:15
<b>\$2,296,942</b> 131:18	<b>11-year</b> 41:6		<b>20120368</b> 130:1
<b>\$2,481,247</b> 131:8	<b>12/28/2017</b> 125:11,13		<b>20120433</b> 91:18 119:14
<b>\$2,513,919</b> 131:10	<b>12/31</b> 17:4,12 80:7 119:2,4 122:19,21 125:10,13		<b>20120436</b> 133:2
<b>\$2,690,493</b> 131:20	<b>12/31/15</b> 113:25 114:4	<b>20071374</b> 17:1	<b>20120437</b> 132:23
<b>\$3,909,958</b> 131:3	<b>12/31/16</b> 119:5	<b>2008-0162A</b> 119:3	<b>20120506</b> 80:6
<b>\$500</b> 99:23	<b>12/31/17</b> 75:14 80:4,5	<b>20080162</b> 113:24	<b>20121249</b> 9:13 10:20
<b>\$80,000</b> 69:24	<b>12/31/2015</b> 114:2,6 121:16	<b>20080373</b> 132:22	<b>2013</b> 17:3,12 36:13 123:8
<b>\$856,872</b> 131:4	<b>12/31/2016</b> 80:10,12 91:20 119:9,15	<b>20080941</b> 114:1	<b>20130440</b> 133:13
<b>\$872-million</b> 168:11	<b>12/31/2018</b> 119:7	<b>20080941A</b> 119:4	<b>20130446</b> 132:23
<b>\$9-billion</b> 42:20	<b>120</b> 163:1	<b>20090375</b> 130:24 133:7	<b>20130447</b> 132:24
<b>\$9-billion-plus</b> 36:13	<b>127</b> 61:12	<b>20090678</b> 119:6	<b>20130449</b> 133:2
<b>\$993,455</b> 131:1	<b>13</b> 78:20	<b>20090733</b> 129:25	<b>20130451</b> 133:4
<b>0</b>	<b>14</b> 72:13 78:20 81:24 82:1,3 118:14	<b>20090921</b> 132:22	<b>20130480</b> 75:12 80:2
<b>061914</b> 119:1	<b>144</b> 28:18	<b>20090922</b> 132:23	<b>20130603</b> 131:12 133:8
<b>070758</b> 133:13	<b>148</b> 72:1 73:6	<b>20100323</b> 132:23	<b>20130707</b> 80:8
<b>1</b>	<b>14th</b> 38:3	<b>20100333</b> 132:23	<b>20130708</b> 80:10
<b>1</b> 48:10	<b>15</b> 110:12 111:7 118:13 122:19 125:11,13	<b>20100335</b> 132:19	<b>20130719</b> 130:1
<b>1/1</b> 17:11	<b>15-day</b> 86:9	<b>20100431</b> 133:13	<b>20130803</b> 127:23
<b>1/25</b> 121:16		<b>20100539</b> 131:2 133:7	<b>20130816</b> 121:14
		<b>20100582</b> 129:25	<b>20130873</b> 122:20
		<b>20100919</b> 10:14	<b>20130874</b> 122:17



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>20131101</b> 16:18	<b>20161077</b> 130:2	<b>25</b> 73:19,21 168:22	<b>7/1</b> 17:3
<b>20131123</b> 17:10	<b>20161160</b> 132:24	<b>25th</b> 13:12	<b>7/28</b> 16:25
<b>20131330</b> 15:19	<b>20161163</b> 133:14	<b>26</b> 81:24 82:1,3	<b>7/31</b> 17:7
<b>20131435</b> 15:18	<b>20161499</b> 15:9	<b>28</b> 20:17 21:5	<b>70734</b> 129:1,3
<b>20140470</b> 132:20	<b>20161523</b> 21:15,22	<b>28th</b> 149:2	<b>75</b> 129:1,3
<b>20140547</b> 133:14	<b>20161576</b> 47:13	_____	<b>77</b> 69:11
<b>20140607</b> 131:15 133:8	<b>201615828</b> 12:8	<b>3</b>	_____
<b>20140920</b> 130:1,2	<b>20161637</b> 13:14	<b>30</b> 17:13 132:18	<b>8</b>
<b>20141099</b> 12:9	<b>20161674</b> 47:14	<b>31</b> 17:8	<b>8</b> 165:18
<b>20141318</b> 15:16	<b>20161677</b> 8:6	<b>314</b> 28:17 31:4 42:6	<b>8/1/2012</b> 17:7
<b>2015</b> 16:20,25 17:8 98:24 100:12 112:7,21 113:5,6,19 120:13 122:21 123:8,13	<b>20161821</b> 8:9	<b>31st</b> 76:4,16 118:14 120:8,10	<b>8/22</b> 16:19,20
<b>2015-218</b> 132:24	<b>2017</b> 13:13,16 17:7,13 38:3,4 76:16 82:7 120:8,15 121:16 123:14 125:24	<b>34</b> 74:8,13	<b>8/23/2013</b> 16:19
<b>20150086</b> 21:17	<b>20170016</b> 12:12	<b>36</b> 106:25	<b>801</b> 12:8
<b>20150157</b> 15:10	<b>20170018</b> 12:11	<b>3rd</b> 122:22	_____
<b>20150193</b> 15:13	<b>20170083</b> 138:4 140:22	_____	<b>9</b>
<b>20150448</b> 131:18 133:8	<b>20170137</b> 138:3 140:21	<b>4</b>	<b>9</b> 56:12 165:17,20,23
<b>20150449</b> 133:8	<b>20170165</b> 141:21	<b>40</b> 114:9 115:3,23	<b>90</b> 28:12 32:3,5,7 42:5
<b>20150471</b> 133:14	<b>20170189</b> 141:22	<b>45,000</b> 47:6	<b>90-day</b> 32:2,14
<b>20150703</b> 130:2	<b>20170190</b> 141:24	<b>4th</b> 80:13	<b>9156</b> 129:1
<b>20150719</b> 130:1	<b>20170191</b> 141:24	_____	<b>9190</b> 129:2
<b>20150863</b> 15:11	<b>20170192</b> 141:24	<b>5</b>	<b>9th</b> 91:20 119:16
<b>20150864</b> 15:12	<b>20170233</b> 12:10	<b>5</b> 106:9 107:3,8	_____
<b>20150949</b> 15:17	<b>20170253</b> 8:8	<b>51:926</b> 166:4	<b>A</b>
<b>20151049</b> 8:11	<b>20170398</b> 8:10	<b>523</b> 28:20 31:18	<b>A.S.A.P.</b> 8:6
<b>20151305</b> 127:20	<b>20170493</b> 128:23	<b>53,000</b> 47:7	<b>AB</b> 127:19,21
<b>20151342</b> 38:5	<b>20171647</b> 47:12	_____	<b>abated</b> 69:13
<b>20151375</b> 15:15	<b>2018</b> 13:18,25 16:19,24 17:3 75:14 80:4,6,8,13 91:21 114:1,3 119:3,6, 8,10,16 122:19,22 123:22 167:23	<b>6</b>	<b>abatement</b> 11:22 12:4, 18 49:13 50:13
<b>20151855</b> 18:14	<b>2019</b> 17:12	<b>6/30</b> 17:3	<b>abbreviate</b> 51:2
<b>2015s</b> 113:13 125:25	<b>24</b> 78:19 90:2 106:25	<b>60</b> 115:4,24	<b>ABC</b> 10:20
<b>2016</b> 17:4 20:18 31:3 42:4 46:25 77:21 80:8 98:25 112:5,21 120:10, 14	<b>24th</b> 20:18 46:25	<b>66</b> 72:9,20	<b>abide</b> 105:7
<b>20160741</b> 8:7		_____	<b>abiding</b> 32:5
		<b>7</b>	<b>ability</b> 41:20 84:22 103:8 148:7
		<b>7.7-billion</b> 168:7	<b>aboard</b> 71:23



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES  
www.torresreporting.com  
1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>absolutely</b> 41:8 54:17 70:18 94:15 97:16 139:3	<b>address</b> 37:22 128:23, 25 129:2 145:2	<b>affected</b> 43:14	<b>answers</b> 44:21
<b>academic</b> 56:12	<b>addressed</b> 31:13	<b>affects</b> 70:1	<b>anticipate</b> 50:9
<b>Academy</b> 15:14	<b>adjust</b> 56:14	<b>agencies</b> 50:22 153:20	<b>anticipated</b> 16:22 17:1,5,10,14
<b>accept</b> 129:5 146:11	<b>adjusted</b> 114:24	<b>agenda</b> 10:12 12:6 46:16 47:23 154:4 165:17	<b>anticipation</b> 60:1
<b>accessible</b> 48:24 52:25	<b>Adley</b> 20:20,22 22:6,7, 13 23:3,13,17,23 24:8, 16,24 25:5 26:5,12 27:1,6,10 31:22 33:2,20 34:4,13 35:15,23 44:20, 24 45:20 46:8 48:21 61:5 64:14 72:2,25 73:2,12,20,25 74:20 76:19,23 77:23 78:12, 15 81:21,22 82:15,24 83:6 89:18,19,23 90:15, 16 91:6,24,25 93:24 95:19 98:20 100:18,21, 22 101:2 105:23 106:12 107:19 108:20 109:5, 11,16,17 113:1 115:5, 12 116:3 117:16 145:1, 13,18 146:3,7,13,18,24 154:21 156:12 161:14 167:14	<b>agree</b> 96:17 115:1	<b>anybody's</b> 96:12
<b>accomplish</b> 155:20	<b>Adley's</b> 26:8	<b>agreeing</b> 162:7	<b>anymore</b> 44:2 83:4 90:24 102:3
<b>accordance</b> 31:21 33:4 166:3	<b>administrating</b> 71:19	<b>agreement</b> 49:10 59:23 68:11 73:4	<b>apologize</b> 28:8 88:23 137:6
<b>accounted</b> 66:16	<b>administration</b> 95:23	<b>ahead</b> 24:2 46:2 65:23 153:5	<b>apparently</b> 126:4
<b>accrue</b> 53:20,21 58:17 63:24	<b>adopted</b> 28:11	<b>aid</b> 59:20	<b>appeal</b> 135:16 137:3 138:22,23 139:4 141:19 147:9,11 149:22 150:3, 4 153:9,16,17 154:12 155:23,25 156:1 159:1, 11,19 160:7
<b>accurate</b> 87:3 89:1	<b>advance</b> 38:5 123:6,8 135:25	<b>Air</b> 128:22	<b>appeals</b> 135:13,19,22 158:20 165:18
<b>acknowledges</b> 59:21	<b>advanced</b> 59:23 75:12, 16,21 80:2 114:24 163:11 168:24	<b>Airbus</b> 168:22	<b>appears</b> 35:24 39:12
<b>Acquisition</b> 12:10	<b>advances</b> 20:17 44:12 46:20 145:10	<b>all-renewal</b> 111:4	<b>applicants</b> 135:23
<b>act</b> 143:24 147:8 152:11 153:11,16	<b>advantage</b> 77:17	<b>allocations</b> 168:5	<b>application</b> 24:3 28:21,23 30:9 33:22 36:12 38:2,6 39:20 41:9,12,13,17 42:1,5,8, 13,18,24 43:1 48:24 49:4 50:3 60:17,25 77:3 89:6 101:16 102:13 115:22 122:9 123:7 124:3,22 138:3,4 140:21,22 141:21,22 143:15 144:5,7,8 152:7, 11,25 162:23 165:16
<b>acted</b> 110:9	<b>Advantous</b> 23:1 36:9 40:9	<b>allowed</b> 53:13 59:25 74:2 96:16	<b>applications</b> 8:6,15,19 12:3,14,17 15:8,24 16:3 20:17 23:25 26:17 27:14 28:1,10 32:9 33:17 35:25 39:18 44:12,22 46:19 52:3,7 70:25 73:6,16 74:8 77:1,5 96:14 109:19 125:21 126:22 135:24 137:25 141:24 143:3, 17,18 145:10 147:25 149:17 163:23 164:1
<b>acting</b> 153:17	<b>advice</b> 165:4	<b>allowing</b> 98:16 100:14 135:23	
<b>action</b> 35:4 82:10 94:2 101:16 107:18,22,24 108:10 137:13 138:18 142:18 146:25 151:11 155:25 160:7	<b>advocating</b> 154:8,9	<b>altogether</b> 25:12 78:1 116:21	
<b>active</b> 167:25	<b>affect</b> 40:1 44:1 70:2 86:21	<b>amend</b> 160:16,18	
<b>activity</b> 36:18		<b>amended</b> 154:16,17	
<b>actual</b> 26:9 106:22		<b>amending</b> 120:19	
<b>ad</b> 56:13 107:9		<b>amendment</b> 127:19	
<b>add</b> 24:21 25:21 35:17 83:13,14 100:2 154:25		<b>America</b> 96:21	
<b>added</b> 23:8 24:10 26:6, 16 27:15 84:19		<b>America's</b> 9:13 10:20	
<b>adding</b> 22:16 168:18		<b>amount</b> 50:15	
<b>addition</b> 22:14 23:7,10 24:9,19,21 27:16 41:12		<b>analogy</b> 114:21	
<b>additional</b> 16:21 17:1, 5,9,14 40:11 41:9 60:9 98:25 100:8,13 168:17		<b>analyses</b> 59:1	



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>applied</b> 90:18 97:4	<b>aspects</b> 69:22	<b>attributable</b> 53:10 56:14 58:14	59:19 63:18 120:2,3
<b>applies</b> 103:5 116:5	<b>assess</b> 35:11 84:14 104:5	<b>attributed</b> 63:23	<b>Bagert's</b> 35:5
<b>apply</b> 57:23 89:24 91:23 103:25 106:14 109:2 146:4	<b>assessment</b> 58:19	<b>Auction</b> 9:14 10:21	<b>ball</b> 139:20
<b>applying</b> 90:17 91:4 99:16 103:15	<b>assessments</b> 86:4	<b>audience</b> 9:23 37:13 81:8	<b>Barham</b> 14:13 128:3
<b>appreciates</b> 45:23	<b>assessor</b> 29:25 43:17 65:22 66:4,13 82:25 83:7 86:1 88:6 94:9 102:12 103:20 106:4 133:9,20	<b>August</b> 86:8	<b>Barksdale</b> 168:6
<b>approach</b> 115:15,16	<b>assessor's</b> 69:5 83:7	<b>authorities</b> 95:9 97:14 143:23 156:20	<b>Barriere</b> 47:5,12 48:13
<b>appropriately</b> 103:11	<b>assessors</b> 107:4 133:21	<b>authority</b> 97:17 144:12	<b>based</b> 46:1 59:24 68:1, 4,18,19
<b>approval</b> 12:5 13:22 76:7 82:17 138:20 143:5,7 145:3,25 146:7	<b>asset</b> 50:10 87:22	<b>Auto</b> 9:14 10:20	<b>BASF</b> 9:15 168:16
<b>approvals</b> 138:2,9 141:20	<b>assets</b> 29:25 30:1 36:14,18 41:15 43:16 86:24 130:25 131:1,3,5, 6,8,10,18	<b>automatically</b> 31:17	<b>basically</b> 14:6 77:5
<b>approve</b> 8:22 10:1 11:7 12:24 14:12 16:7 19:18 33:11 35:18 44:21 46:5 71:5 73:3 74:21 77:2 78:1,10,13,17 130:5 131:22 134:1	<b>assigning</b> 41:14	<b>average</b> 106:5,7	<b>basis</b> 35:5
<b>approved</b> 13:12,15,21 31:4 33:6 34:18 36:12, 13 42:13 43:12,13 52:13 137:22 149:11 154:12	<b>assistance</b> 165:3	<b>Aviation</b> 168:21	<b>Baton</b> 9:14 10:17,20,21 15:16 16:23 18:15 47:15 125:10 132:22
<b>approval</b> 62:23	<b>Assistant</b> 83:6 86:1 88:6 94:9 106:4	<b>aware</b> 136:24	<b>battle</b> 145:22
<b>approving</b> 12:7 38:2 43:25 63:1	<b>assume</b> 53:9	<b>aye</b> 9:4,5 10:4,5 11:10, 11 13:2,3 14:14,15 16:9,10 18:5,6 19:21,22 46:9,10 71:9,10 75:2,3 80:24,25 92:4,5 108:13, 14 118:2,3 121:5,6 122:9,10 126:22,23 128:13,14 129:15,16 130:15,16 132:10,11 135:6,7 139:13,14 141:8,9 159:7,8,22,23 162:13,14 164:12,13 167:6,7	<b>BBQ</b> 8:7
<b>April</b> 135:16 163:12,14, 16	<b>assumption</b> 53:11,16 56:8 58:15,20 63:22		<b>beard</b> 37:23
<b>area</b> 23:12 43:18 85:17, 20	<b>assumptions</b> 57:20, 22,25 58:10,11,23 59:6 64:7 68:4	<b>B</b>	<b>Beauregard</b> 129:25
<b>argue</b> 163:10	<b>assure</b> 50:17	<b>back</b> 28:15 32:21 34:18 37:5 54:11 100:2 101:9 102:19,22 121:19 126:1 127:8 138:13 139:21 155:24 160:17	<b>Becky</b> 11:21
<b>argument</b> 109:6	<b>Atkins</b> 18:4 132:3	<b>backup</b> 49:8,16 60:20, 25	<b>begin</b> 149:6 167:15
<b>argument's</b> 144:17	<b>attempted</b> 149:6	<b>backwards</b> 116:4	<b>beginning</b> 28:12 151:6
<b>arrive</b> 51:6	<b>attention</b> 105:5	<b>Bagert</b> 30:21,22 31:25 32:22 39:9,10 41:22 42:15,22 52:9,10 54:4, 9,15,21,25 55:4,16,20 56:3,20 57:2,9 58:4	<b>behalf</b> 23:1 93:17 155:21 168:9
<b>arriving</b> 59:6	<b>attestation</b> 61:16 63:20		<b>behavior</b> 44:1
<b>Ascension</b> 9:15 65:22 66:24 67:6 88:6 94:10 102:12 103:20 105:3 129:2,3 132:19 168:16	<b>attested</b> 61:13		<b>believer</b> 99:3
	<b>attesting</b> 49:12 60:13		<b>Belle</b> 168:6
	<b>attorney</b> 103:17,19 106:4		<b>benefit</b> 42:3 52:23 53:23 56:6,7 57:14 60:4 65:8 77:4
			<b>benefits</b> 19:1,5 53:10, 20,21 58:13,16 69:25
			<b>big</b> 41:2
			<b>bigger</b> 40:16
			<b>bill</b> 84:17
			<b>bing</b> 40:23
			<b>Bingo</b> 106:17
			<b>bit</b> 39:14 75:25 144:15



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>board</b> 8:15 9:19 10:25 12:17 13:12,22 15:24 17:18,24 19:11 28:1 29:6,18 30:14 34:17 35:4 36:24 37:17,25 38:23 40:6 45:19 47:18 50:17 52:1,25 54:3 59:4,17 61:11 66:5 70:21 73:14 77:4,7,24 78:3 83:20 87:18 90:8 94:1 95:17,22 96:15 97:8 99:23 101:15,18 103:9 107:2,22 108:9, 25 114:12 116:19,20, 21,24 117:4,9,22 119:22 120:20 122:2 126:14 128:6 129:12 130:12 132:4 135:16, 19,23 137:1 139:7 141:1 143:16,19 146:10 148:7,22 150:7 151:10 163:7,14,16 164:5 165:2,3,4 166:20	<b>breaches</b> 34:22 <b>breaching</b> 34:23 <b>break</b> 168:10 <b>breaks</b> 31:8 <b>Brent</b> 18:16 <b>Brentwood</b> 12:10 <b>Brewing</b> 47:15 <b>bring</b> 51:18 81:14 82:9 138:15 162:10 <b>broad</b> 50:5 <b>broadcast</b> 94:13 <b>broader</b> 30:25 <b>Broderick</b> 30:22 39:10 40:6 41:21 52:10 65:5 120:3 <b>Bros</b> 132:19,21,25 133:3 <b>brought</b> 25:25 <b>Bruce</b> 125:17 <b>Bryant</b> 151:18 <b>bucket</b> 145:12 <b>budget</b> 100:7 <b>Buffington</b> 151:23 <b>building</b> 8:9 40:17 <b>Burton</b> 8:2,3,4,13 9:11 10:11,23 11:17,20 <b>business</b> 89:20 <b>businesses</b> 106:7	115:8 116:1,10 118:9, 17 <b>Calcasieu</b> 15:17 80:9 127:23 168:11 <b>calculate</b> 50:22 <b>calculated</b> 49:20,22 <b>calendar</b> 43:17 98:19 101:7 <b>call</b> 85:11,23 105:4 164:24 <b>called</b> 31:6 45:14 55:5 <b>calls</b> 59:19 142:7 <b>Calumet</b> 141:21,23 143:15 145:10 149:25 150:1,13 153:18 155:21,25 156:8,11 157:8 158:24,25 160:7, 22 163:20,21 <b>Calumets</b> 160:20 <b>Cameron</b> 28:16 36:11 39:14 41:10 <b>cancel</b> 133:19 <b>cancelation</b> 132:21,25 133:3,5,11,16 134:24 <b>cancelations</b> 132:18 134:2 <b>canceled</b> 133:21 134:11 <b>capacity</b> 168:14 <b>capital</b> 53:14,17 56:13 60:8 <b>CARBO</b> 135:15 137:11, 15 <b>CARBO's</b> 137:3 <b>care</b> 76:6 <b>Carmody</b> 37:13,14 74:22 129:8 131:24 132:2 <b>Carondelet</b> 17:10 <b>carried</b> 120:18	<b>carries</b> 8:1 9:10 10:10 11:16 13:8 14:20 16:15 18:11 20:2 46:15 71:15 75:8 81:5 92:10 118:8 121:11 122:15 127:3 128:19 129:21 130:21 132:16 135:12 139:16 141:14 159:17 160:3 162:19 164:18 <b>case</b> 85:14 <b>caught</b> 74:14 <b>causality</b> 31:9 <b>causally</b> 63:23 <b>caused</b> 56:9 <b>causing</b> 37:9 <b>CB&amp;I</b> 28:17 38:21,24 39:12 <b>CDG</b> 15:9 <b>CEA</b> 47:6 <b>Cellxion</b> 8:8,9 <b>center</b> 15:18 52:21 <b>Centurylink</b> 168:17 <b>Ceramics</b> 135:15 <b>Certainteed</b> 80:9,11 <b>certification</b> 48:20 49:5 <b>chairman</b> 35:24 36:8 37:25 44:6 62:21 64:25 81:12 108:21 116:13 142:23 150:22 154:21 166:6,7,11,19 <b>challenge</b> 127:16 <b>Champlin</b> 65:20,21 66:2 67:13,18,22 68:7, 12,16 69:3,17 83:11 84:1,5,18,24 85:4,8,18 86:6,15,23 87:4,15,23 88:2,9 102:20 103:2 <b>chance</b> 28:9 47:25 78:11 79:16 168:3 <b>change</b> 10:13,18,25 11:1 43:14 68:21 69:10
<b>Board's</b> 154:23 <b>boat</b> 161:8 <b>Boatner</b> 123:3,4,18,23 124:7,12,14 125:3 <b>bodies</b> 63:15 69:20 <b>body</b> 69:12 <b>Boe</b> 18:17 <b>bonus</b> 91:7 99:23 <b>books</b> 94:24 <b>Bossier</b> 15:14 141:21, 22 150:15 151:20,23 158:2,6,7 <b>bottom</b> 144:10 <b>bought</b> 69:1 <b>Bourgeois</b> 112:14,18, 19 147:20 148:8,15 149:1,8 <b>BRAC</b> 50:23 <b>Bradken</b> 80:5,6 <b>Bradshaw</b> 12:9 <b>Brasseaux</b> 8:23	<b>C</b> <b>cables</b> 26:24 <b>Cactus</b> 141:20 157:20, 25 158:9 159:19 <b>Caddo</b> 12:11 80:11 141:24 143:21 150:15 151:2,20,22 158:17 <b>Cage</b> 105:19,20 106:16 107:13,16 114:16,18,19		



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



84:11 98:23 127:18 128:10,21,24 129:5 152:24	<b>citizen</b> 93:17 98:14 106:5	17:17,22 19:15 36:10 39:6 52:6 65:23 66:11 70:19,24 71:3 74:23 80:20 92:15,21 94:8 97:24,25 98:1 102:4 105:15 108:6,9 114:11, 15 117:15,19 119:25 121:1 122:5 126:14,18 128:5,9 129:9 130:9 132:7 134:6 135:3 136:21 139:10 141:5 150:10 152:18 164:9 167:20	<b>company's</b> 13:24 14:7 39:22 77:16
<b>changed</b> 95:22 96:22	<b>citizens</b> 95:8		<b>comparative</b> 58:16
<b>changing</b> 127:21,24	<b>City</b> 143:20		<b>compare</b> 53:20
<b>characteristic</b> 53:12	<b>civilized</b> 105:23		<b>compared</b> 63:24
<b>Charles</b> 21:17 47:13 130:24 131:2,3,5,7,8,9, 11,13,14,16,17,19,20 133:6	<b>Clapinski</b> 34:21 164:21,22,23		<b>compelling</b> 152:9
<b>Chasse</b> 168:6	<b>clarified</b> 21:6 140:1		<b>compensation</b> 166:9
<b>check</b> 32:21 126:3	<b>clarify</b> 36:1,3 90:20 115:13		<b>complete</b> 36:16,21 44:1 135:25 155:13
<b>checked</b> 28:16	<b>Classical</b> 15:14	<b>Commerce</b> 83:20 107:2 166:20	<b>completed</b> 31:2,10 41:2 58:7 144:16 163:11 168:13
<b>checks</b> 33:3	<b>clean</b> 88:25	<b>commission</b> 103:4 143:21	<b>completely</b> 145:11
<b>chemical</b> 8:10 22:17 24:5,15 99:12 127:24 131:1,4,7,10,13,16,19	<b>clear</b> 22:9 32:9 33:14 36:23 41:24 43:20 58:5 60:24 89:25 90:23 96:3 114:21	<b>commitment</b> 95:25 106:18,20 107:8 108:23,24	<b>completing</b> 44:14
<b>Chemicals</b> 128:22	<b>clearer</b> 45:25	<b>commitments</b> 96:2,4 105:24,25	<b>completion</b> 32:4 41:16 123:11
<b>Cheng</b> 20:10,11,12,16 21:8,14,21 22:11 26:21 27:4,8 28:19,25 29:10, 22 30:6 32:17,18 33:16 38:1 44:10 46:18,24 47:3,10 48:16 51:20 59:22 71:16,17 76:14 82:22 91:10 113:14 127:17 128:20 129:22 130:22 132:17 133:22 134:14,18 135:14,21 136:6,12,16 137:2,7,24 138:8 140:2,7 141:17 142:2,10,14 143:2,6 145:8,16 149:10 156:24 157:1,5,10,14	<b>clerk</b> 126:2	<b>communicate</b> 103:8	<b>complex</b> 50:15
<b>Chief</b> 65:21 103:19	<b>cleric</b> 105:10	<b>committee</b> 20:24 62:22 143:18,22	<b>complexity</b> 57:11
<b>choices</b> 77:1,24	<b>client</b> 38:15,19,24 89:4 116:18,23 117:1 123:6, 11,25	<b>committees</b> 55:6	<b>compliance</b> 35:8
<b>choose</b> 51:2	<b>clients</b> 117:8,9 162:10	<b>communities</b> 50:18 53:1	<b>complied</b> 33:10,23 154:13
<b>chooses</b> 94:2	<b>clock</b> 42:9	<b>community</b> 51:8 168:1	<b>comply</b> 42:25 82:10 147:4
<b>chronology</b> 31:9	<b>close</b> 43:11 53:15 166:24	<b>companies</b> 21:15 32:1 96:5 136:8 139:18 141:18 142:5 147:23 148:2 149:16 154:12 161:19	<b>component</b> 168:7
<b>circumstance</b> 85:22 125:23	<b>closed</b> 132:20,25 133:2,5,10 167:1	<b>company</b> 13:18 15:17 21:17 31:15 42:3 43:21 44:13 47:12,15 49:11 74:7 82:7 83:14 84:21 88:7 89:13,20 95:2,3,4 106:19,20 108:24 113:24 114:1,3,5 119:1, 3,5,7,8 125:9,12 126:2 132:20,21,25 133:1,3,5, 10,15 141:22 145:21 154:18 156:4,13,19 159:11,19 162:6	<b>compromise</b> 144:19 145:4,20
<b>circumstances</b> 35:3 40:12 154:19	<b>closer</b> 9:3 75:25 81:14 94:12 157:23		<b>concept</b> 37:18
	<b>clue</b> 94:18,19		<b>concern</b> 31:12 39:11
	<b>codes</b> 49:24,25		<b>concerned</b> 43:15 99:4, 8 106:5
	<b>Coleman</b> 27:22,23 124:21 140:25		<b>concerns</b> 42:23 43:22
	<b>comment</b> 30:17 36:11 44:11 63:10 93:3,5,23 139:7		<b>concludes</b> 9:16 11:18 12:14 14:22 20:4 127:7
	<b>commentary</b> 41:9		<b>conclusion</b> 63:21 101:12
	<b>comments</b> 8:18 9:22 10:24 11:4 12:21 16:2		<b>concrete</b> 99:18,19
			<b>conduct</b> 64:19
			<b>conducted</b> 53:6 59:2



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>conflict</b> 107:3	133:1,7,13,19 134:11 149:25 163:20	<b>costs</b> 30:7	<b>deadline</b> 31:16,19 32:2,14 147:17 148:6, 13 161:1
<b>consideration</b> 98:1 120:23 136:2 138:14 147:24,25 148:10,14 161:12	<b>contradiction</b> 43:12	<b>council</b> 153:25	<b>deadlines</b> 147:23 148:3,11 161:5
<b>considered</b> 33:17,19 50:8 62:24 139:24 148:22	<b>contrary</b> 138:18	<b>counsel</b> 35:22 112:12	<b>deal</b> 33:21 49:23 70:11 104:15 108:25 109:23
<b>consistent</b> 97:9 120:16,20	<b>contribute</b> 64:12	<b>count</b> 87:22	<b>dealing</b> 45:24 46:3
<b>Constitution</b> 63:14	<b>contributing</b> 51:10	<b>counted</b> 149:13	<b>dealt</b> 53:18 165:24
<b>construct</b> 32:14	<b>contribution</b> 43:7	<b>country</b> 39:16	<b>December</b> 31:3 42:4 52:13 76:16 86:13,21 118:13 120:8,10 135:23 150:17 151:10 154:11 160:17
<b>constructing</b> 41:10	<b>convene</b> 143:19	<b>couple</b> 21:3 53:8 54:12 115:18	<b>decide</b> 107:22 108:24
<b>construction</b> 13:11, 16,17,23 28:13 36:20 37:8 39:23 40:23 47:5, 12 48:14 50:8 51:5,9 168:12	<b>convenes</b> 143:22	<b>court</b> 103:22	<b>decided</b> 77:5 151:9
<b>consultant</b> 102:16	<b>conversation</b> 85:1,3	<b>cover</b> 50:5	<b>deciders</b> 69:2
<b>Consultants</b> 123:4	<b>conversations</b> 142:3	<b>covered</b> 123:12	<b>decision</b> 64:22 67:7 87:18 95:25 97:21 98:2
<b>Consulting</b> 23:1 36:9 40:9	<b>conversion</b> 168:22	<b>cracks</b> 126:4	<b>decisionmaking</b> 67:3
<b>contacted</b> 151:18	<b>copies</b> 84:11	<b>created</b> 50:2	<b>decisions</b> 68:18
<b>contacts</b> 133:21	<b>copy</b> 38:1 73:15 83:22	<b>Credits</b> 16:18	<b>deck</b> 11:21 22:22
<b>context</b> 58:8	<b>Corp</b> 15:18	<b>criticizing</b> 116:23	<b>declined</b> 136:8,17
<b>contiguous</b> 106:23,25	<b>Corporation</b> 9:15 80:9, 11	<b>curious</b> 24:10	<b>deeper</b> 77:14
<b>continue</b> 69:7 70:14 83:16 168:8,14	<b>corporations</b> 105:25	<b>current</b> 58:12 67:24 68:1 76:8 166:19	<b>Defense</b> 168:5
<b>continuing</b> 168:2	<b>correct</b> 13:10,17,24 26:4 41:8 44:23 49:18 61:19,23 62:7,24 63:3 67:14 68:8 90:15 92:21, 23 103:3 113:6 123:19, 24 124:15 133:23 134:19 140:18 142:11, 21 146:14 147:1	<hr/> <b>D</b> <hr/>	<b>defer</b> 21:9 87:18 124:8, 22 135:16 153:16,17 155:8,10,25 160:6,11
<b>contract</b> 10:14,19 13:11,15,19,21,22 16:19,23 17:7,11 18:14 34:11,24 37:1,5 61:4 75:13 86:17 91:19 98:18 114:2 119:15 123:12 127:18,20,23 128:23 129:1,23 130:23,24 131:2,5,9,15, 17 132:18 133:4	<b>corrected</b> 43:18	<b>data</b> 87:9	<b>deferral</b> 22:1 72:5,7,20, 21 136:23 137:14,15, 19,22
<b>Contractors</b> 15:13 18:15	<b>correction</b> 13:20	<b>date</b> 13:11,16,17,23,24 16:20,24 17:4,8,12 28:17,21 39:19,20,23 42:9 59:2 75:14 76:4,13 80:3,4,7,10,12 91:20 112:5,7 113:25 114:1,2, 4 119:6 122:19 123:14 125:11,12,13 147:21 148:1,19,23,25 163:7	<b>deferred</b> 21:17,18 72:24 103:12 125:1
<b>contracts</b> 17:23 34:23 129:25 130:6 132:19,22	<b>correctly</b> 31:24 40:22 104:3 115:21	<b>dates</b> 86:17 111:4,7,8 123:12 154:6	<b>deferring</b> 62:22
	<b>corres-</b> 76:6	<b>day</b> 51:4 58:6 64:7 120:9	<b>degree</b> 77:2
	<b>correspondence</b> 76:7	<b>days</b> 28:12,17,18 31:4 32:3,5,7 40:22 42:5,6 101:4 110:21 115:18 154:10 163:1	<b>delay</b> 95:7 96:24,25 99:18
	<b>Cos-mar</b> 78:18,22 79:8 81:8,18 82:7 88:15 90:8 99:10 110:1 111:2,17 113:21,24 114:1,3,5 119:1,3,5,6,8	<b>dba</b> 8:8 10:15,16 15:12	<b>delayed</b> 99:16
	<b>Cos-mar's</b> 125:24	<b>DC</b> 168:9	<b>delete</b> 18:13
	<b>cost</b> 64:20		<b>deleted</b> 18:16



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>Delta</b> 22:16,19 23:1,22	31:9 50:22 64:20 67:2	<b>Don</b> 64:15 167:15	<b>educators</b> 100:7
<b>demonstrate</b> 63:15	70:8 164:24	<b>door</b> 156:15	<b>effect</b> 18:20 31:10
<b>demonstration</b> 63:20,	<b>Didier</b> 123:4	<b>double</b> 28:15 167:12	<b>effectively</b> 84:13
21 64:16	<b>differ</b> 67:17	<b>doubt</b> 21:2	<b>effort</b> 50:16
<b>denial</b> 106:23 143:8	<b>difference</b> 53:22 55:24	<b>Doug</b> 37:23 38:4	<b>efforts</b> 104:20
<b>denied</b> 106:3 116:21	<b>differently</b> 33:22 49:22	<b>DOW</b> 22:17,21 24:5,15	<b>eight-year</b> 50:13 51:3
136:2 138:12 139:23	<b>differing</b> 111:3	26:15	<b>elapsed</b> 32:3
143:3 147:6 150:1	<b>difficult</b> 36:4 57:23	<b>downstream</b> 24:21	<b>elapsing</b> 32:14
161:16	96:18	25:3,9,12,14	<b>election</b> 164:20
<b>deny</b> 107:6 121:23	<b>direct</b> 59:19 60:8	<b>dramatic</b> 96:16	165:22,25 166:6
122:1 150:3,4 152:22,	<b>directed</b> 142:4	<b>dropped</b> 101:13	<b>elements</b> 50:7 51:9
23 153:8 155:22,23	<b>direction</b> 33:9 66:10	<b>Dryers</b> 21:16,22 22:1	<b>eligible</b> 30:1
158:20 159:1,10,18	153:3	<b>Ducharme</b> 125:18	<b>eliminate</b> 41:3 103:10
<b>denying</b> 107:8 122:8	<b>disclosure</b> 86:9	<b>Dudley</b> 151:5	<b>else's</b> 35:6
153:9	<b>discovered</b> 82:8,9	<b>due</b> 28:21 36:19 118:13	<b>employ</b> 168:25
<b>department</b> 58:25 96:3	89:8	<b>DXE</b> 167:23	<b>employees</b> 99:23
143:20 164:25 168:5	<b>discreet</b> 39:17,18,21		<b>enabling</b> 166:3
<b>depending</b> 114:22	40:11,15 41:25 42:7	<hr/> <b>E</b> <hr/>	<b>end</b> 28:13,17 39:19,20,
<b>depends</b> 84:6	<b>discretion</b> 154:15,23		22 41:5 42:13 86:10,17
<b>deprecate</b> 68:20	<b>discussion</b> 43:7 52:22	<b>e-mail</b> 38:1 57:1 85:11	123:17 126:4 154:10
<b>depreciation</b> 68:1	59:6 62:20 65:12 66:17,	142:5 156:24	<b>ending</b> 13:11,16
<b>depression</b> 68:20	20 108:22 157:21 158:1	<b>e-mailing</b> 157:8	<b>endorse</b> 42:1
<b>Deputy</b> 65:21 102:12	162:1	<b>eager</b> 57:24	<b>ends</b> 70:11
103:20	<b>discussions</b> 66:18	<b>earlier</b> 99:21 105:1	<b>Energy</b> 15:9
<b>derivative</b> 24:22	<b>dispatch</b> 167:9	142:18	<b>engaged</b> 54:5 56:21
<b>describe</b> 34:22	<b>dispensation</b> 117:11	<b>easily</b> 48:24 52:24	82:6 124:1
<b>describing</b> 25:10	<b>distance</b> 142:5	<b>East</b> 9:14 10:16,21	<b>engagement</b> 89:3
<b>description</b> 22:9 23:5	<b>docking</b> 23:12	15:16 16:23 18:15	<b>enjoy</b> 50:14
24:18,19 27:14	<b>document</b> 36:17 40:14	47:15 132:21 133:1	<b>entered</b> 133:14
<b>desire</b> 61:13 162:5	48:25 49:4 61:9 138:16	<b>eat</b> 70:3	<b>Entergy</b> 127:19,21
<b>detail</b> 147:16	<b>documentation</b> 34:12,	<b>economic</b> 31:8 50:22	168:10
<b>detailed</b> 38:7	18 40:13 61:3 148:4	60:4 64:20 67:2 70:7,8	<b>Enterprise</b> 15:1,24
<b>determination</b> 65:14	<b>documents</b> 14:8 34:8	150:17 164:23 168:4	16:3 17:23 20:4
<b>determine</b> 51:7 53:5	51:17 52:14,20 59:15	<b>economist</b> 54:5 56:11	<b>entire</b> 52:21
56:6,7 57:13 65:8	60:3 84:12 138:1	<b>economists</b> 65:14	<b>entirety</b> 35:3
<b>determined</b> 65:7 77:16	139:19 142:6	<b>economy</b> 60:14	<b>entities</b> 58:18 59:4
<b>determining</b> 53:1	<b>Dolese</b> 132:18,21,25	<b>Edgar</b> 105:20 114:19	64:8 66:23 67:5 156:11
<b>developed</b> 58:1,2,6	133:3	<b>education</b> 99:3,22	160:7
<b>development</b> 12:12	<b>dollars</b> 63:25 65:9	100:3 168:1	



## TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>entitled</b> 59:13	145:11 161:6	<b>expressed</b> 162:5	<b>fast</b> 83:18
<b>entity</b> 41:6	<b>exempt</b> 26:20 27:18 40:19 83:3	<b>extend</b> 142:8 148:7,10, 11 161:24 163:6	<b>faster</b> 84:8
<b>equation</b> 64:4	<b>exempting</b> 26:19	<b>extended</b> 40:24	<b>Fatheree</b> 125:16,17,22 127:4
<b>equipment</b> 24:25 25:7 26:9,16,20 27:3,17 36:15 40:18 43:2	<b>exemption</b> 20:11 36:19 40:14 41:6,15 43:24 53:11,16 56:13 71:19 106:15 107:7 110:17 118:2 129:23 138:25 140:10 154:13	<b>extension</b> 28:21 29:15 32:2,4,6,7,12,13 33:24 38:2,4,8 39:13 90:19 101:13 161:17,20 162:7,19	<b>fault</b> 153:21
<b>equivalent</b> 101:14	<b>exemptions</b> 40:2 43:9 106:24	<b>extensions</b> 28:24 29:8, 20 31:17 32:11 41:3 162:11	<b>favor</b> 9:4 10:4 11:10 13:2 14:14 16:9 18:5 19:21 45:8 46:9 71:9 75:2 80:24 92:4 108:5, 13 117:25 121:5 122:8 126:21 128:13 129:15 130:15 132:10 134:5 135:6 139:13 141:8 159:7,22 162:13 164:12 167:6
<b>Eric</b> 8:2	<b>exhibit</b> 47:24 49:7,10, 11 52:13	<b>extreme</b> 58:22	<b>feature</b> 167:10
<b>Erica</b> 151:18	<b>exhibits</b> 48:1 62:23 63:1	<b>extremely</b> 65:15	<b>February</b> 75:14 76:4 80:4,6,8 149:2 151:6 152:11
<b>error</b> 13:19 14:7	<b>exist</b> 54:14 56:25 57:8 58:1	<b>eye</b> 74:14	<b>Fedex'd</b> 76:3
<b>essentially</b> 49:3	<b>existence</b> 99:6	<b>eyes</b> 161:7	<b>feel</b> 59:7
<b>establish</b> 43:22	<b>existing</b> 16:19,23 17:2, 7,11 18:14 41:12 43:1 165:4	<b>F</b>	
<b>established</b> 49:24 99:1	<b>exists</b> 54:17 66:19	<b>faced</b> 69:21 162:9	<b>Feliciana</b> 133:1
<b>estimated</b> 13:15,17,23	<b>expect</b> 61:21 68:22 105:23	<b>facility</b> 23:12 25:11,15, 25 26:1,25 41:11,12 53:17 133:9 168:25	<b>fell</b> 126:4
<b>estimating</b> 55:6	<b>expectation</b> 123:22	<b>fact</b> 31:14 32:12 39:24 44:14,15 58:9 63:14 137:12 139:18	<b>felt</b> 96:4,6
<b>ethylene</b> 24:22	<b>expects</b> 62:11	<b>factors</b> 60:7 64:22	<b>figure</b> 104:17
<b>evaluate</b> 59:16 64:5	<b>expenditure</b> 53:14 60:8	<b>facts</b> 40:12	<b>figured</b> 65:14
<b>evaluated</b> 52:25 53:1, 24	<b>expiration</b> 75:13 80:3, 7,9,12 91:19 111:4,7,8 112:5,7 113:25 114:2,4 119:2,4,6,7,9,15 121:15 122:18,21 123:14 125:10,12	<b>fair</b> 67:12 70:12 77:10 95:20	<b>figures</b> 51:6
<b>evaluating</b> 50:24	<b>expire</b> 84:10 118:23	<b>fairness</b> 94:1	<b>file</b> 26:14 32:12 85:10 103:21 117:3 144:17 145:20
<b>Everybody's</b> 77:10	<b>expired</b> 123:8	<b>faith</b> 82:10	<b>filed</b> 28:12,14 41:14 44:13 46:20 77:20 103:21 123:7,9,13,16 124:4 135:24 147:18
<b>everything's</b> 86:11	<b>explain</b> 81:25 94:24 117:1,4 123:13	<b>Fajardo</b> 8:24,25 9:1,3 19:20 126:13	<b>filing</b> 31:16,19 83:17 104:14
<b>evidentiary</b> 137:11	<b>explained</b> 77:25 154:19	<b>fall</b> 145:11	<b>final</b> 81:19 126:3
<b>exact</b> 97:2,3	<b>explanation</b> 95:12	<b>fallen</b> 154:6	<b>finalized</b> 86:5
<b>examples</b> 77:9		<b>familiar</b> 55:9 65:6	<b>find</b> 33:4 48:14,23 52:11 62:10 78:1 83:20 95:21 109:23
<b>exceed</b> 60:5		<b>family</b> 12:9 93:17	
<b>exception</b> 156:21		<b>fashion</b> 39:13 97:2 99:16	
<b>excess</b> 50:11			
<b>exchangers</b> 26:10			
<b>Excited</b> 168:18			
<b>excluded</b> 51:4			
<b>excuse</b> 118:17 150:22			
<b>executed</b> 13:19			
<b>Executive</b> 20:18 46:20 68:25 74:6 97:1 99:5 135:24 136:1 144:16,18			



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>fine</b> 21:12 35:9	<b>fully</b> 13:19 66:13	<b>Glycol</b> 24:22 25:21 26:25	168:10
<b>finish</b> 66:14	<b>fun</b> 165:7	<b>goal</b> 59:8 100:8	<b>group</b> 22:8 80:11 88:24 145:15
<b>finished</b> 23:11	<b>funds</b> 100:8	<b>good</b> 8:5 11:24 12:1 15:4,6 20:13,15 23:5 24:1,18 37:15 38:13 53:3 66:8 70:11,12 74:7 82:10 88:1 100:24 109:6 116:2,11 141:16 167:17	<b>grow</b> 60:14
<b>firm</b> 99:2	<b>furnished</b> 59:20	<b>governing</b> 143:23 144:12	<b>grows</b> 167:21
<b>fit</b> 117:1	<b>future</b> 19:1 27:13 43:23 44:15 58:12 64:12 69:13 120:19	<b>government</b> 59:20,25 65:10 143:3 144:25 146:15,21 153:20 155:13 162:4,7,11	<b>Guard</b> 168:6
<b>fits</b> 109:19		<b>governments</b> 49:12 162:24	<b>guess</b> 33:8,13 34:14,15 64:15 81:23 100:2 120:23 154:18 164:24
<b>fitting</b> 40:12		<b>governor</b> 66:5 73:4 95:25 96:5 97:9 105:24 106:19	<b>guideline</b> 77:8
<b>five-year</b> 90:18 96:5 101:13 123:17 140:10	<b>G</b>	<b>Graham</b> 79:8 121:14, 19,21	<b>guidelines</b> 29:16
<b>fixed</b> 43:23	<b>Galvanizing</b> 10:14,15, 16	<b>grant</b> 62:12 86:13 122:20 138:3,22 139:4 140:5,21 153:9,17 155:24 156:21 161:20	<b>guy</b> 33:13
<b>floor</b> 119:18 155:23 158:20 166:10	<b>GASB</b> 69:11	<b>granted</b> 31:17 32:6 38:5 43:9 86:20 94:25 138:23	<b>guys</b> 8:7 83:8 142:4 148:18 150:16
<b>fly</b> 35:5	<b>gather</b> 137:14 142:6	<b>granting</b> 31:5 106:24 161:17	<b>H</b>
<b>follow</b> 34:19,23 49:23 98:18 103:16,24 104:3	<b>gathered</b> 82:12	<b>gray</b> 43:18	<b>hand</b> 142:8
<b>footnote</b> 144:11	<b>gathering</b> 137:13	<b>great</b> 10:14,15,16 29:13 69:25 73:21 74:1 94:25 95:1 168:15,19	<b>handle</b> 78:18 83:9 87:19
<b>Forest</b> 79:9 122:17,20, 25 124:13 138:2 140:20	<b>gave</b> 82:17 106:19 118:10 120:13,15	<b>greater</b> 64:21	<b>handled</b> 83:9,10 113:8
<b>form</b> 106:9	<b>Geismar</b> 129:1,3	<b>greatly</b> 103:9	<b>hands</b> 53:24
<b>formal</b> 60:17 146:7	<b>general</b> 51:1 57:4,6 65:9 83:8 89:3	<b>Grocers</b> 16:22	<b>handshake</b> 70:12
<b>formalized</b> 146:11,12	<b>Generally</b> 86:10	<b>grocery</b> 70:5	<b>happen</b> 88:1 102:13 154:5
<b>formally</b> 36:12,21	<b>generated</b> 50:9 51:5	<b>ground</b> 42:21 78:2	<b>happened</b> 40:16 43:13 82:1,3 83:21 84:8 86:22 96:9,13,23 161:19
<b>Fort</b> 168:6	<b>generic</b> 53:3		<b>happening</b> 64:5 155:4
<b>forward</b> 22:21 30:19 39:7 43:14,19 46:3 59:14,24 65:18 75:18 81:9 82:21 90:1,3 93:13 96:8 99:7 102:3 104:15 105:9,17 114:16 120:18 123:1 142:9 144:20 147:18 150:11 158:21 162:9 166:22 167:25 168:15,23	<b>gentleman</b> 70:21 85:16 91:14 93:2,6 95:17 97:24 98:6 121:19		<b>happy</b> 34:9 38:6 64:19
<b>fought</b> 145:22	<b>Georgia</b> 12:11		<b>hard</b> 68:19
<b>found</b> 52:20 95:23 102:16,17 104:11	<b>Georgia-pacific</b> 129:24 130:3		<b>hard-pressed</b> 57:21
<b>Fourteen</b> 72:15,17	<b>give</b> 18:19 22:9 26:17, 18 32:19,20 33:9 54:3,8 78:11 79:15 94:3 95:11 99:23 100:4 105:4 120:14 139:21 142:6 147:18 150:16 162:23		<b>Harris</b> 81:11,16,17 82:5 88:20,21,23 89:2,10,15, 21 91:15 116:18,23 118:16
<b>front</b> 42:13 123:17	<b>glad</b> 116:19		<b>harsher</b> 155:3
<b>full</b> 43:17 69:12 110:21	<b>globo</b> 21:7 44:22 48:19 73:4 74:21 78:11,14 96:9 112:22		<b>Health</b> 15:19



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>heard</b> 31:23 46:1 98:20 99:17,18 109:15 151:22	<b>House</b> 34:21 35:1,16 48:9 136:20,22 137:5 138:21 142:17,20 144:2,3 146:1 148:24 153:10 154:7 156:2,18 158:22 159:9 160:13,14 161:2,11 163:13,17	<b>impressed</b> 94:7	<b>initial</b> 75:13 80:3,7,12 91:19 113:25 119:5 121:15 122:18,21 125:10,12
<b>hearing</b> 58:2	<b>housekeeping</b> 167:10	<b>impressive</b> 168:8,25	<b>initially</b> 152:6
<b>heart</b> 108:23	<b>Hud</b> 71:18 91:11	<b>improve</b> 66:16,18 69:6, 7 103:7 104:17,19	<b>initiated</b> 133:20
<b>heat</b> 26:10	<b>huge</b> 39:15	<b>improvement</b> 69:8	<b>input</b> 66:9 88:13 95:10
<b>Heather</b> 13:1 134:4,9 162:20	<b>Hunt</b> 75:20,21 76:2 77:18 79:9 110:6,9 122:17,20,24 124:12 138:2 140:12,20	<b>in-house</b> 48:25	<b>inside</b> 40:16 73:6
<b>heavily</b> 67:3	<hr/> <b>I</b> <hr/>	<b>inaudible</b> 150:18	<b>institutions</b> 168:2
<b>helicopters</b> 168:22	<b>Iberville</b> 91:19 93:17 94:10,16,22 95:9 98:14 99:12 101:9 107:9 113:24 114:2,4,5 119:1, 3,5,7,9,15 133:4	<b>incentive</b> 43:11,25 59:21,24 62:11 63:23	<b>intended</b> 96:6
<b>hell</b> 109:12,13	<b>idea</b> 25:6 26:19	<b>incentives</b> 31:6	<b>intent</b> 68:24 120:11
<b>helpful</b> 56:22 94:3	<b>identify</b> 22:23 24:12 30:19 34:11 36:6 39:7 40:7 52:8 65:18 72:11 75:18 81:9 93:13 98:10 105:17 112:17 114:16 120:1 123:1 125:15 150:11	<b>inclined</b> 155:19	<b>interest</b> 18:22
<b>helping</b> 167:9	<b>II</b> 24:22 25:22 26:25 55:19	<b>include</b> 48:7,20 49:7 61:14 64:20 157:20,25	<b>interested</b> 43:4 58:3 65:8,11,15
<b>helps</b> 162:11	<b>image</b> 123:8	<b>included</b> 49:15 52:16, 19 60:17	<b>interment</b> 41:1
<b>hero</b> 100:3	<b>impact</b> 58:18 66:25 67:1 168:4,7	<b>including</b> 59:5 60:7	<b>internal</b> 147:23 148:6
<b>Hexion</b> 130:24 131:2,5, 8,12,15,17 133:6 134:12	<b>impacts</b> 70:5	<b>income</b> 70:1,2	<b>internally</b> 148:3
<b>Hey</b> 70:13 104:16	<b>IMPLAN</b> 49:24 51:1 62:1	<b>Incorporated</b> 15:14,20 16:22 18:15	<b>interpretation</b> 35:6
<b>high-level</b> 135:20	<b>important</b> 58:11 96:1,8 117:3,4 162:3 167:10 168:15	<b>increase</b> 101:16	<b>intimately</b> 155:1
<b>Highway</b> 129:1,2	<b>imported</b> 25:25	<b>incredibly</b> 57:20	<b>Intralox</b> 133:12,14
<b>hired</b> 88:25	<b>imposed</b> 109:2	<b>indicating</b> 27:9	<b>invest</b> 68:19
<b>history</b> 39:16	<b>impossible</b> 64:1 161:7	<b>indirect</b> 50:2 60:9,10	<b>invested</b> 69:9
<b>hit</b> 110:20		<b>industrial</b> 20:11 49:25 50:5 59:20 71:19 85:20 102:14	<b>investment</b> 12:13 31:2 36:13 37:7 39:15,21,25 42:14,20 48:20 50:4,19 51:8,10 52:14,18,22 53:2,5,9,10,19,21 54:16 55:25 56:5,7,9,10 58:12,14,15 59:1 60:15 62:25 63:23 64:2 70:6, 13 168:17
<b>hits</b> 90:24		<b>Industries</b> 8:7,9	<b>investments</b> 48:7 50:17 53:17
<b>hold</b> 87:21 95:13		<b>industry</b> 83:20 99:12 103:18 107:2 166:20	<b>involved</b> 66:13,22,23 67:3 69:7 85:12
<b>holding</b> 65:22		<b>information</b> 28:8 41:16 47:24 51:18,19 52:15 57:1 64:10 67:8, 24 68:18 82:12 87:5 94:9 101:6 103:10 124:10 137:11 147:22 150:14,19 151:1 152:22 167:22	<b>Isaac</b> 93:16
<b>home</b> 164:24,25		<b>informingly</b> 87:14	<b>issue</b> 23:4 73:5 88:25 89:8 104:11 105:1 147:22 162:5
<b>honest</b> 94:17		<b>inherent</b> 57:20	<b>issues</b> 14:5 21:4 83:15 87:17 103:14 158:1
<b>honor</b> 97:10		<b>inherently</b> 57:19	
<b>honored</b> 106:19			
<b>honoring</b> 96:2 105:24			
<b>hope</b> 47:25 78:3 104:19 168:3			
<b>Hotel</b> 15:10,11,12 17:6			
<b>hour</b> 167:17,21			
<b>hours</b> 78:19			



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



<b>locals</b> 62:23,24 69:1 96:19 138:17	134:3 137:17 139:5,18 140:25 144:17 145:20 150:4 159:20 160:10 161:23 166:18	<b>material</b> 25:11,24 99:15	
<b>location</b> 26:1 128:21 129:6 132:20,24 133:2, 4	<b>Madhav</b> 15:16	<b>math</b> 61:17,25	<b>met all</b> 33:23
<b>Lodging</b> 15:15	<b>Magazine</b> 12:8	<b>mathematically</b> 63:25	<b>Metairie</b> 15:10
<b>long</b> 31:10 45:16 96:9	<b>mail</b> 76:12	<b>matrix</b> 152:7	<b>method</b> 50:21
<b>long-term</b> 50:18 70:13, 15	<b>Major</b> 27:23 124:21 140:25	<b>matter</b> 108:23 161:15	<b>Metoyer</b> 15:1,2,3,7,22 16:16 17:16 18:12,21 19:2,7 20:3,6,7
<b>longer</b> 18:22 96:15	<b>majority</b> 62:3	<b>Mayor</b> 8:23	<b>Metro</b> 168:21
<b>looked</b> 48:12	<b>make</b> 20:20,23 26:23, 24 27:24 36:9,18 40:25 43:20 44:11 45:25 47:4 53:17 55:21 65:4,13 66:15 67:7 68:18 89:25 90:23 93:2 94:1 95:20 96:1 97:10 100:12,24 103:11 104:24 106:6 107:20 109:22 111:12 112:20 126:9 140:5 142:6 143:22 145:6 149:25 156:15 159:3 160:13 168:2	<b>MCAS</b> 74:2 139:24	<b>MFP</b> 100:5
<b>lose</b> 90:19	<b>makes</b> 27:9 36:3 59:23 70:16 81:23 108:23,24 110:24	<b>Mcmillen</b> 125:18	<b>mic</b> 75:24 81:14 93:14 94:12 143:12 157:23
<b>lost</b> 123:10	<b>making</b> 64:12 109:18	<b>meaning</b> 41:23	<b>microphone</b> 109:21
<b>lot</b> 26:16 52:15 65:12 69:9,14 74:9 96:23 97:5 168:23	<b>MALONE</b> 134:10,16,20 162:21 163:2	<b>means</b> 116:9 158:12	<b>middle</b> 78:2 92:18
<b>lots</b> 43:5 52:14	<b>man</b> 99:17 106:7	<b>Medical</b> 15:18	<b>Mill</b> 8:10
<b>Lotte</b> 8:10	<b>Management</b> 15:18	<b>meet all</b> 152:7	<b>Miller</b> 16:8 26:7 29:7,12 63:8,9 71:8 79:2 102:6, 9 105:11 109:25 110:3, 10,16 111:9,13,20,24 112:4 113:10 119:19 120:11,21 126:7,8 136:25 139:5,20,22 140:4,9,13,17 145:2,5 147:14 148:5 149:3,12, 18,23 152:19,20 153:12,23 154:3,24 156:7 159:6 160:25 163:5,8,15,19,24 166:12
<b>Louisiana</b> 8:11 30:23 36:14 39:11 45:22 47:13 52:10 58:8 95:24 103:1,3 105:21 106:1 114:19 120:4 129:1,3 164:25	<b>managers</b> 51:21	<b>meeting</b> 14:23 28:8 31:2 33:1 40:2 60:16 83:20 86:14 124:9 125:2 135:16 148:22 150:17 153:11,16 155:12 156:1 158:4 160:8,20,24 163:7,12, 14,16 168:1	<b>Miller's</b> 138:13 144:19 160:16
<b>Louisiana's</b> 68:6	<b>manner</b> 146:15	<b>meetings</b> 117:10	<b>miscellaneous</b> 96:14
<b>love</b> 105:22	<b>Manny</b> 9:3	<b>Melissa</b> 27:22	<b>model</b> 51:1 54:3,8,16, 20 55:1 57:8,12,21,25 58:5,6,7 62:1 64:1,8,21 65:5
<b>LP</b> 127:24 131:1,7,10, 13,19 141:22	<b>manufacturer</b> 139:25	<b>members</b> 8:15 9:5,19, 22 10:5,25 11:11 12:17 13:3 14:15 15:24 16:10 17:19,24 18:6 19:12,22 28:1 29:6,18 30:14 36:24 37:18,25 38:24 40:6 45:19 46:10 47:18 52:2,25 71:10 75:3 80:25 90:8 92:5 95:17 108:14 118:3 121:6 122:10 126:15,23 128:14 129:12,16 130:12,16 132:4,11 135:7,19 139:14 141:2, 9 159:8,23 162:14 164:6,13 165:4 166:8 167:7	<b>models</b> 49:24
<b>Lubricant</b> 156:8	<b>manufacturers</b> 53:14, 16 105:25	<b>Mert</b> 66:4	<b>Moller</b> 28:2,5,6,22 29:2, 19 30:3,10 47:19 48:4, 5,11 49:6,14,19 50:20 51:11 60:19,23 61:15, 20,24 62:4,8,15 79:7,12 90:9 91:1 101:24 137:18
<b>Lubricants</b> 141:22,23	<b>manufacturing</b> 8:7,8 22:15 23:6 41:11 50:7 56:13 133:9 168:24	<b>mess</b> 120:24	
<b>M</b>	<b>March</b> 38:3	<b>met</b> 12:4 16:21,25 17:5, 9,13 21:1 96:2 97:11	
<b>made</b> 8:23 10:2 11:8 12:25 14:12 16:7 18:3 19:19 34:16,17 35:20 38:3 44:20 58:10,12 59:6 63:8,22 64:23 71:7 74:20 95:24,25 96:3,4, 16 97:9 98:2 104:20 109:6 113:4 116:24 121:25 124:19,20 128:3 129:7 130:7 132:2	<b>Market</b> 13:14		



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



<b>moment</b> 164:21	163:6,9 164:18 166:18 167:2	<b>needed</b> 76:15 154:13	<b>objection</b> 72:24 93:7 124:23
<b>monetary</b> 37:4 59:19		<b>negative</b> 64:3	<b>objections</b> 22:2 72:21
<b>money</b> 87:21 99:24 100:1	<b>Motion's</b> 14:12 16:7 124:19	<b>news</b> 168:19	<b>obligated</b> 66:15
<b>moneys</b> 100:5	<b>move</b> 23:11 43:25 44:6 46:2,3 59:24 71:5 73:3 77:11 78:21 89:24 93:2, 5 97:2 99:6 101:15 102:2 104:15 105:9 124:17 142:9 144:20 147:18 155:24 158:21 159:3 160:6 166:21 168:15	<b>night</b> 99:22	<b>obligations</b> 60:6
<b>Monroe</b> 12:12 168:18		<b>nit-pick</b> 43:21	<b>observations</b> 136:20
<b>Monsanto</b> 21:17 22:1		<b>nit-picking</b> 43:5	<b>obtuse</b> 57:11
<b>Monteleone</b> 15:11,12		<b>nominate</b> 166:13	<b>occur</b> 84:12 103:11 147:25 148:1
<b>month</b> 46:4 86:4 95:7, 10,13 96:24,25 98:19 101:8 120:8 143:16		<b>nominations</b> 166:11 167:1	<b>occurred</b> 56:2 95:12
<b>months</b> 29:24 36:17 78:20 81:24 82:1,4 85:14 90:2 106:25 107:1 115:1,18	<b>moved</b> 96:8 131:25 159:5	<b>noon</b> 167:17	<b>occurring</b> 44:17 56:19
<b>Morehouse</b> 21:16,23	<b>moves</b> 97:2	<b>norm</b> 31:7	<b>October</b> 13:12,16,18, 24
<b>morning</b> 8:5 11:24 12:1 15:4,6 20:13,15 37:15 81:12	<b>moving</b> 66:10 128:25 162:9 167:25 168:23	<b>normal</b> 31:8 109:1 123:22	<b>offer</b> 114:21 155:7
<b>motion</b> 8:1,22,23 9:10 10:1,10 11:7,16 12:24 13:8 14:20 16:6,15 18:2,11 19:18 20:2 35:20 44:20 46:7,15 71:7,15 74:20 75:8 78:10,12 81:5 91:4,23 92:10 97:8 101:1,22 107:5,17,20 108:1,3,19 109:4,10 111:12 112:12,22 113:4 114:8, 10 115:20 118:8 119:18 120:13 121:11,23,25 122:15 124:20 126:9 127:3 128:1,19 129:5, 21 130:5,7,21 131:22 132:16 134:1 135:12,22 136:24 137:15 138:13, 24 139:1,4,5,16 140:5 141:14 142:17,19 144:19 145:6,19,23 147:13,15,21 148:13,21 149:21,25 150:3 152:22 153:9 154:16 155:7,16, 22 158:19,21,23,24,25 159:1,3,10,17,18,20 160:3,10,16,17,18 161:13,16,23 162:1,19	<b>multi-billion-dollar</b> 41:11	<b>Northern</b> 150:17	<b>offered</b> 136:25
	<b>multiple</b> 111:3	<b>note</b> 47:4	<b>office</b> 21:1 45:22 83:21 103:8 128:24 167:16
	<b>multipliers</b> 50:2	<b>noted</b> 72:24 136:15	<b>officers</b> 164:20 165:22 166:1,4,7,14
	<b>multitude</b> 60:7	<b>notice</b> 44:16	<b>officials</b> 94:17
	<b>Myles</b> 24:14,15,20 25:2,13,18 26:3	<b>noticed</b> 125:25	<b>one-year</b> 78:14 112:3,6 120:14,15
		<b>notification</b> 59:23 83:13,17 104:10,12 163:11	<b>ongoing</b> 39:25 45:24 66:12,18
	<b>N</b>	<b>notified</b> 13:19 83:1 133:9,10	<b>online</b> 41:1
	<b>Nalco</b> 110:6 125:9,11, 18	<b>notifies</b> 133:20	<b>OPCO</b> 127:24
	<b>narrowly</b> 31:13	<b>notify</b> 44:13 83:3	<b>open</b> 138:13 154:17,18 156:15 160:19 163:6 166:10
	<b>national</b> 49:24,25 168:6	<b>November</b> 76:7 77:22 167:24	<b>opened</b> 51:4 163:9
	<b>nature</b> 41:24	<b>number</b> 35:7 36:17 37:5 38:5 40:17 72:11 116:17,22 123:6,7 165:17,18,20,23	<b>operate</b> 146:15
	<b>nay</b> 9:7 10:7 11:13 13:5 14:17 16:12 18:8 19:24 46:12 71:12 75:5 81:2 92:7 108:16 118:5 121:8 122:12 126:25 128:16 129:18 130:18 132:13 135:9 141:11 159:25 162:16 164:15	<b>numbers</b> 34:11 39:18 68:19 72:15,17	<b>operated</b> 31:12
	<b>necessarily</b> 116:23 149:5		<b>operation</b> 41:25
		<b>O</b>	<b>operational</b> 137:12
		<b>oars</b> 161:9	<b>operations</b> 25:4,12,15 28:13 42:4,9 43:3,16
		<b>objectified</b> 65:11	<b>opinion</b> 35:12 59:13 106:3
		<b>objectify</b> 57:22 65:15	



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>opportunities</b> 50:6	<b>package</b> 47:23	<b>participate</b> 63:16	<b>period</b> 16:19,23 17:3, 11 40:24 50:11,13 82:2 86:9,10 109:20 123:17 160:19 161:24 166:5
<b>opportunity</b> 97:13 142:6 156:14 168:15	<b>Packaging</b> 8:11 79:9 121:15,19	<b>parties</b> 51:2 70:16	<b>person</b> 69:24 70:2
<b>opposed</b> 9:7 10:7 11:13 13:5 14:17 16:12 18:8 19:24 46:12 71:12 75:5 81:2 92:7 108:16 118:5 121:8 122:12 126:25 128:16 129:18 130:18 132:13 135:9 137:19 141:11 159:14, 25 162:16 164:15	<b>packet</b> 48:18 61:12	<b>Partners</b> 17:6,10	<b>personal</b> 69:21 164:21
<b>opposition</b> 138:15	<b>Packing</b> 121:21	<b>partnership</b> 70:15	<b>personally</b> 66:21,22 69:9 96:17 98:17 104:22 117:5 165:1
<b>option</b> 107:6	<b>paddle</b> 161:10	<b>pass</b> 146:19	<b>perspective</b> 30:25 31:1 69:5,21 79:17 83:8 96:7
<b>order</b> 20:18 23:11 31:2 46:21 52:2,7 62:21 63:16 64:5 68:25 70:25 74:6 84:13 97:1 99:5 135:24 136:1 144:16,18 145:11 154:20 155:20 161:6	<b>pages</b> 47:24 48:6 61:12 165:24	<b>passed</b> 82:20 97:21 135:23 136:25 161:15	<b>Petrochem</b> 91:5
<b>ordinary</b> 53:12 85:10	<b>paid</b> 87:12,14,16,22 158:15	<b>passes</b> 108:19 160:16	<b>Petrochemical</b> 82:7 110:1 111:19 113:22 127:23
<b>organization</b> 49:25	<b>painful</b> 127:10	<b>passion</b> 99:3,21	<b>Petrochemicals</b> 81:18 91:18 119:12,14
<b>original</b> 47:23 124:3	<b>Palmisano</b> 15:13	<b>past</b> 19:5 29:23,24 43:9 50:12 64:6 69:10 77:3 78:2 82:12 98:22 102:22 167:17	<b>Phillips</b> 72:9,20
<b>originally</b> 138:12	<b>paperwork</b> 126:1	<b>Patterson</b> 127:20,22	<b>phone</b> 85:11,22 105:4
<b>Orleans</b> 12:9,10 15:11, 12,13,19 17:6,11 127:19,20,21 167:24	<b>par</b> 85:23	<b>pay</b> 70:3 84:22 91:7 116:6	<b>phrase</b> 111:5
<b>Ouachita</b> 12:11,12 15:15,20 138:4 140:22	<b>parcel</b> 83:14	<b>payroll</b> 60:8,9,11 69:24	<b>pick</b> 116:5,7
<b>Outlet</b> 70:4	<b>parent</b> 120:24	<b>pays</b> 84:21	<b>picture</b> 41:2
<b>outstanding</b> 136:5	<b>parish</b> 9:14,15 10:17, 21 15:10,11,12,13,15, 16,17,19,20 16:18,23 17:2,6,11 18:16 21:16, 18,23 47:13,14,15 65:22 66:24 75:13 80:3, 5,7,9,12 88:6 91:19 93:18 94:10,16,23 98:14 99:11,12,13,22 101:10 103:20 105:3 107:9 113:25 114:2,4,5 119:2,3,5,7,9,15 121:15 122:18,20 125:10,12 127:21,24 129:2,3,25 130:25 131:2,4,5,8,9, 11,13,14,16,17,20 132:19,22 133:1,4,6,12, 15 138:3,4 140:21,23 141:21,23,25 151:2 158:6,17 168:11,16	<b>PCR</b> 123:5,10,25	<b>piece</b> 26:19 27:2 43:2 55:6
<b>overcomplicating</b> 161:18	<b>parish</b> 9:14,15 10:17, 21 15:10,11,12,13,15, 16,17,19,20 16:18,23 17:2,6,11 18:16 21:16, 18,23 47:13,14,15 65:22 66:24 75:13 80:3, 5,7,9,12 88:6 91:19 93:18 94:10,16,23 98:14 99:11,12,13,22 101:10 103:20 105:3 107:9 113:25 114:2,4,5 119:2,3,5,7,9,15 121:15 122:18,20 125:10,12 127:21,24 129:2,3,25 130:25 131:2,4,5,8,9, 11,13,14,16,17,20 132:19,22 133:1,4,6,12, 15 138:3,4 140:21,23 141:21,23,25 151:2 158:6,17 168:11,16	<b>penalized</b> 96:12 101:3	<b>pieces</b> 36:15 40:18
<b>overview</b> 18:19	<b>parse</b> 111:6	<b>penalties</b> 105:7	<b>Pierson</b> 34:5 48:17 49:2,9,17,21 50:25 59:12 61:2,7,18,22 62:2,6,13 63:13,19 64:18 66:5 165:13 166:1,2,17,25 167:5,8, 19
<b>owner</b> 18:14,16,23	<b>part</b> 14:7 25:3 39:18,21 40:1 41:19 42:8 48:8,23 49:4 55:17,21 70:6,9,10 96:20 106:20 155:2 167:23	<b>penalty</b> 33:19 89:25 90:25 97:3 101:16 104:1,4,5 107:23 109:1 112:6,8 114:25	<b>PILOT</b> 133:15
<b>ownership</b> 10:19 11:1	<b>partial</b> 130:23 131:22	<b>people</b> 35:25 67:5 70:8 74:3,7 94:22,23 101:3 106:1 107:9 117:7 154:11 158:14 161:8 162:10	<b>pipng</b> 23:11,14,16 26:9,10
<b>oxide</b> 24:22		<b>percent</b> 53:9 56:12 58:13 63:22 77:6 78:23 82:18 90:13,17,25 98:21,22,25 99:1 100:11,13 101:3,14 109:1 110:18,23 114:9, 25 115:3,4,15,21,23,24, 25 120:17	<b>place</b> 31:3,5,19,20 32:15 64:6 103:24 104:6 106:6,22 158:2
<b>P</b>		<b>percentage</b> 95:1	<b>places</b> 31:7 43:10
<b>Pack</b> 138:3 140:16,22		<b>perfectly</b> 29:16 100:24	<b>placing</b> 107:8
		<b>Performance</b> 18:15	



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>Plan</b> 15:19	<b>preceded</b> 58:15	<b>problems</b> 14:3 58:20	111:5 158:20
<b>plant</b> 24:18,23 25:22 51:4 82:13 127:20,22 168:11	<b>precedence</b> 76:12	<b>proceed</b> 22:5 47:2 71:16 75:9 121:12 125:7 137:23 158:25 167:20	<b>properly</b> 36:17 40:14 41:14 84:13 104:1,4
<b>plants</b> 85:21 168:14	<b>precedent</b> 43:10 120:5		<b>properties</b> 17:2 43:16
<b>plausible</b> 33:12	<b>precisely</b> 56:21 58:10	<b>process</b> 23:5,10 26:2 45:24 66:12,14 69:7 74:4 96:20 103:13 104:17 106:18 136:9,11 143:24 149:7 155:2,4 156:19 161:6 166:5	<b>property</b> 43:23 60:10 66:25 67:25 82:2 84:14 106:8 107:4,8 116:6
<b>play</b> 82:25 103:23 107:1	<b>prefer</b> 59:21	<b>processes</b> 66:23 67:3	<b>propose</b> 120:19
<b>Pleased</b> 168:10	<b>preliminary</b> 86:7	<b>produce</b> 64:1 86:7 87:6	<b>proposed</b> 50:10
<b>plight</b> 153:7	<b>prepare</b> 126:3	<b>produced</b> 26:1 95:3	<b>protects</b> 63:14
<b>point</b> 26:18 35:10 42:5, 12 45:21 59:25 60:2 63:8 68:11 73:14 85:16 86:18,20 87:3 97:6 106:18 116:24 138:24 148:9 149:17 153:10	<b>preparing</b> 125:24 161:9	<b>producer</b> 25:10	<b>protest</b> 87:12,14,16
<b>pointing</b> 146:6	<b>prescriptive</b> 102:25	<b>product</b> 23:11 26:2	<b>proven</b> 64:10
<b>points</b> 116:17	<b>present</b> 70:8	<b>production</b> 25:15	<b>provide</b> 30:4 32:4 34:9 35:12 49:11 50:1 60:15 61:9 65:16 69:12
<b>Polk</b> 168:6	<b>presented</b> 15:2	<b>Products</b> 75:12,17,22 79:9 80:2,11 114:25 122:18,20,25 124:13 128:22 129:24 130:3 138:2 140:12,21	<b>provided</b> 32:1 43:2 48:19 52:15 139:19 165:3 168:20
<b>portion</b> 134:12,17	<b>presenting</b> 71:20	<b>professional</b> 165:9	<b>Providence</b> 15:14
<b>posed</b> 104:8	<b>preservation</b> 25:21	<b>program</b> 8:3 11:22 15:1 16:20,25 17:4,8 20:11 31:11 66:7 71:19	<b>providing</b> 42:3 148:4
<b>positive</b> 50:18 51:10 64:2 66:8 96:13,23	<b>President</b> 16:8 63:8 71:8 102:6 139:5	<b>programs</b> 63:17	<b>provisionally</b> 35:18
<b>possibility</b> 41:3	<b>pressure</b> 26:22	<b>progress</b> 168:2	<b>public</b> 8:19 11:4 12:21 16:2 17:22 19:15 30:18 31:3 37:22 41:19 48:25 52:6,12,23 53:15,22 54:11 55:25 56:7,9 58:17 59:4 60:14 62:10 63:15,25 64:8 71:3 74:23 80:20 86:9 92:14, 21 93:2,5,23 97:24 102:3 105:16 108:6 114:15 117:15,19 119:25 121:2 122:5 126:18 128:9 129:9 130:9 132:7 134:6 135:3 139:10 141:5 150:10 164:9
<b>post</b> 128:24	<b>pretty</b> 20:25 23:4 33:14 43:11 65:6 96:8,16 145:7	<b>prohibition</b> 166:7	<b>public's</b> 79:16 98:1
<b>Post-ceo/cea</b> 165:16	<b>previous</b> 26:9 107:18 108:10 116:20 128:25 142:19 163:6 165:3	<b>project</b> 28:17 32:3,14 36:12,16,19,21 37:2 39:19,20,24 40:11,15, 16,23,24 41:2,4,13,16 43:25 44:14,16 50:24 51:21 59:18 60:5,12 70:7 123:11 135:25 138:17 144:23	<b>publicly</b> 165:5
<b>post-eos</b> 47:18	<b>previously</b> 136:2	<b>projects</b> 39:17 40:25 46:2 57:3 59:2 62:3,5 65:7 74:3,10 76:9 144:15 163:10	<b>pull</b> 75:24 87:7,8
<b>post-executive</b> 52:2,7 62:21 70:25	<b>principal</b> 103:25	<b>proper</b> 104:24 105:8	<b>pumps</b> 26:10
<b>postpone</b> 148:2	<b>prior</b> 12:5 20:18 32:2,5, 13 41:15 74:6 92:13,20 93:19,21 97:1,6 135:25 139:1		<b>punish</b> 114:23
<b>potential</b> 67:25	<b>Priscilla</b> 75:21		
<b>power</b> 168:11,13	<b>private</b> 53:21 55:25 56:5,9 59:20 93:17 95:8		
<b>practice</b> 31:11	<b>privilege</b> 164:21		
<b>practiced</b> 31:7 103:18, 20	<b>proactive</b> 103:6 104:18		
<b>practices</b> 53:12	<b>probable</b> 85:15		
<b>pre-application</b> 74:4	<b>problem</b> 33:24 35:11 57:18 98:21		
<b>pre-approved</b> 37:2			



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>punishing</b> 112:9 114:22	<b>quick</b> 29:8 67:11 156:23	<b>receives</b> 83:21	<b>rejection</b> 109:16
<b>purchasing</b> 168:21	<b>quickly</b> 20:25	<b>receiving</b> 12:5 59:14 83:16 84:11 131:1,4,7, 11,14,16,19	<b>related</b> 37:18 70:24 78:13 87:17 88:7 92:11 135:19,22 137:4,10
<b>purpose</b> 41:14 60:14, 16	<b>R</b>	<b>recognize</b> 45:24 165:5	<b>relative</b> 168:4
<b>push</b> 148:20	<b>radiations</b> 120:12	<b>recognized</b> 13:18 14:8	<b>released</b> 49:4 168:4
<b>pushing</b> 110:22	<b>raise</b> 100:4 167:12	<b>recognizing</b> 167:21	<b>relinquish</b> 109:21
<b>put</b> 24:2,25 26:16 44:16 65:5 70:10 101:1 102:18 104:13,14 105:4 107:4 145:22	<b>raising</b> 43:7	<b>recommend</b> 117:9 138:22 156:4	<b>relying</b> 154:20
<b>putting</b> 152:8	<b>Ram</b> 15:15	<b>recommendation</b> 35:21 143:23	<b>remain</b> 50:10
<b>puzzle</b> 70:9,10	<b>range</b> 50:5	<b>recommendations</b> 56:18	<b>remaining</b> 82:19 90:22
<b>Q</b>	<b>Rapides</b> 15:10	<b>reconsider</b> 94:2 101:15 107:6,17,21,24 108:3,10,19 110:5,6 138:19,24 139:17	<b>remarks</b> 167:21
<b>qualify</b> 95:4	<b>ratify</b> 60:18	<b>reconsidering</b> 110:2 112:22	<b>remember</b> 37:5 40:22 102:11 138:11 145:20 147:16
<b>quality</b> 8:3,6 9:12 11:18 99:3	<b>raw</b> 25:11,24	<b>record</b> 36:10 40:10 43:4 74:11 167:16	<b>REMI</b> 55:5,9,19
<b>question</b> 26:8 27:12 28:7 30:24 32:10 33:10 34:4,14,16 35:15,17 36:14 38:6 48:22 53:18 54:2 81:23 88:15 100:23 102:7 104:8 106:11 133:18 139:23 143:10 147:15 152:21 156:23	<b>reach</b> 142:4	<b>records</b> 41:19 52:12	<b>remind</b> 135:18
<b>questions</b> 8:14,18 9:18 10:24 12:16 14:11 15:23 17:17 19:11 21:2, 4,6,10 22:6 23:22,24 24:4 27:25 29:5,17 30:13 37:17 38:23 40:5 44:9 45:18 47:17 48:1 52:1 53:8 70:20 72:25 74:16,18 77:13 78:6,11, 13,21 79:16 80:16 81:10 85:25 88:5 90:7 95:11,16 98:6 100:17 103:14 107:13 108:9 114:12 115:8 117:22 119:22 121:1 122:2 126:14 128:5 129:12 130:12 132:4 134:6,9, 25 139:7 141:1 150:7 152:15 164:5	<b>read</b> 38:6,9 47:9 48:6 79:21 80:21 91:13 113:13,22 118:1,23 145:6	<b>reduced</b> 82:18 94:25 98:19	<b>remove</b> 153:13
	<b>reading</b> 65:16 113:19	<b>reducing</b> 90:10	<b>render</b> 49:5
	<b>real</b> 65:10 67:11 98:21	<b>reduction</b> 78:14,23 110:20 118:1 126:21	<b>renewal</b> 74:5,9 76:7 80:4,6,8,10,12 86:13,20 87:2 91:20 96:25 98:18 102:14 106:24 113:25 117:3 118:2 119:2,16, 20 121:16 122:19,21 123:21 125:11,13 126:9 140:6
	<b>realized</b> 76:9 77:20	<b>referring</b> 32:20 145:9	<b>renewals</b> 9:13,16,19 33:18 46:17 71:20 72:1 74:13,19,21,24 75:11 81:19 82:8 95:23 96:5 116:25 125:24 127:7
	<b>reason</b> 30:4 64:15 77:10 85:7 99:2,18,19 120:6 152:6,9 156:13, 21 161:10	<b>Refining</b> 47:14	<b>renewed</b> 74:5 82:11,14 143:25
	<b>reasonable</b> 59:5,7	<b>reflect</b> 13:24 167:16	<b>reopen</b> 98:2 101:23 138:19
	<b>reasons</b> 43:8	<b>registered</b> 27:24	<b>rep</b> 85:1,19 105:3
	<b>recall</b> 168:20	<b>regular</b> 162:23	<b>repeat</b> 21:20
	<b>receive</b> 18:25 31:15,18 32:10 36:18 59:15 62:11 63:16 80:4 83:12 92:14,21 104:10 112:6, 7	<b>Regulations</b> 103:4	<b>reply</b> 162:24
	<b>received</b> 12:6 19:5 28:23 38:1 47:23 76:6, 10,13,16 77:21 80:6,8, 10,13 93:22 104:12 114:3,4,6 119:2,4,6,8,9 121:16 122:21 138:1 141:19 143:14 144:11	<b>reissued</b> 13:23	<b>report</b> 123:11
		<b>reject</b> 77:2 78:1 107:23 158:21	<b>reported</b> 43:17 106:8
		<b>rejected</b> 109:8	



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>reports</b> 87:7	166:6	<b>responsive</b> 52:20	<b>Robby's</b> 109:18 115:13
<b>represent</b> 24:13 65:19 98:11 105:18 117:7 125:18	<b>rescinded</b> 93:21	<b>restaurant</b> 70:3	<b>Robert's</b> 154:20
<b>representative</b> 11:8 22:19 37:13 45:7 73:11 74:22 75:16 81:7 121:21 122:24 129:8 131:24 132:2	<b>resolution</b> 141:20 144:21 146:8,12 150:16	<b>Restoration</b> 11:22 12:4,18	<b>ROI</b> 48:23 49:15 50:22 51:3,17 64:23 65:6 66:20 67:12,16
<b>represented</b> 85:20	<b>resolutions</b> 12:7 146:19	<b>restrict</b> 114:9 119:20	<b>ROIS</b> 52:11
<b>representing</b> 81:17 98:15 158:9	<b>resolve</b> 64:16 104:24	<b>result</b> 152:24	<b>role</b> 66:8 82:25
<b>represents</b> 91:5,15	<b>resolved</b> 21:4 103:15	<b>resulting</b> 60:4	<b>roles</b> 43:24
<b>reps</b> 102:15	<b>resource</b> 69:9	<b>results</b> 62:1	<b>roll</b> 66:16 82:2 83:15 84:4,16 86:7 102:22
<b>reputation</b> 96:1	<b>resources</b> 52:23	<b>retail</b> 50:6	<b>rolled</b> 74:8
<b>request</b> 10:13,18 11:1 13:10,20 18:13 25:20 31:15,18 32:1,4,6,13 34:7,10,16,17 38:2,4,7 39:13 52:12,20 61:10 64:9 65:4 75:14 91:20 93:10 95:7 111:5 114:1 119:16 122:19 125:11, 13 128:22 136:23 139:18 144:12 149:22 150:4 151:1	<b>respect</b> 59:14 95:1 97:20 144:4,6	<b>retain</b> 166:19	<b>rolls</b> 40:19 50:10 86:21 102:18 106:10,13 107:4 109:7 116:6
<b>requested</b> 16:20,24 17:3,8,12 21:15 72:20 135:15 138:1 141:18 150:16	<b>respond</b> 9:5 10:5 11:11 13:3 14:15 16:10 18:6 19:22 34:6 46:10 71:10 75:3 80:25 92:5 108:14 118:3 121:6 122:10 126:23 128:14 129:16 130:16 132:11 135:7 139:14 141:9 157:8 159:8,23 162:14 164:13 167:7	<b>retained</b> 134:13	<b>Roof</b> 47:15
<b>requesting</b> 22:1 32:13 34:12 100:10 130:2 150:15	<b>response</b> 8:16,20 9:8, 20,24 10:8 11:2,5,14 12:19,22 13:6 14:18 15:25 16:4,13 17:20,25 18:9 19:13,16,25 22:3 30:15 37:19 38:3,25 46:13 48:2 52:4,19 70:22 71:1,13 72:22 74:25 75:6 78:8 80:18, 22 81:3 92:8 93:8 95:18 98:7 107:14 108:7,11, 17 114:13 115:9 117:20,23 118:6 119:23 121:3,9 122:3,6,13 124:24 126:16,19 127:1 128:7,11,17 129:10,13, 19 130:10,13,19 132:5, 8,14 134:7 135:1,4,10 137:20 139:8,11 141:3, 6,12 150:8 152:16 158:10 159:15 160:1 162:17 164:7,10,16	<b>retaining</b> 130:25 131:3, 6,10,12,15,18	<b>Roofing</b> 80:11
<b>requests</b> 14:23 16:17 17:18,23 103:7 127:19 132:20,21,25 133:3,5, 11,15	<b>revenues</b> 50:9	<b>return</b> 48:7,20 50:18 51:10 52:14,18,22 53:2, 5,9,19 54:16 56:1 58:12 59:1 62:25 64:2,3 70:6 164:24	<b>room</b> 158:15
<b>require</b> 107:3	<b>revenue</b> 55:6 58:17 60:9,10 62:11 67:25 164:25	<b>review</b> 35:21 47:25 48:18 124:9 143:18	<b>Rouge</b> 9:14 10:17,20, 21 15:16 16:23 18:15 47:15 125:10 132:22
<b>required</b> 13:20 51:17 63:7 83:10 106:9 145:3, 23,24 148:4	<b>revisions</b> 14:2 138:6,9	<b>reviewed</b> 14:2 138:6,9	<b>Royal</b> 17:6
<b>requirements</b> 12:5 16:21,25 17:4,9,13 33:24	<b>revised</b> 13:23 166:4	<b>revision</b> 152:10	<b>RTA</b> 13:14 14:22
<b>requires</b> 69:12 137:1	<b>rewards</b> 106:21	<b>reward</b> 106:21	<b>rule</b> 31:24 33:4,6,11,23 34:8 69:11 83:19
	<b>Rhonda</b> 123:4	<b>Rhonda</b> 123:4	<b>rule's</b> 30:25
	<b>Rice</b> 21:16,22,25	<b>Rice</b> 21:16,22,25	<b>rules</b> 28:11,20 31:8,9, 13,21 32:5,8,9 34:19,24 35:6,9 43:1,5,6 45:25 46:4 48:8 62:22 103:4, 15,16,23,24 104:1,4,5 105:6,7,22 106:21 107:1,2,3 154:20 162:23
	<b>Richard</b> 33:13 155:18	<b>Richard</b> 33:13 155:18	<b>run</b> 56:4,5,6 57:12 58:7, 23 115:14,19
	<b>riders</b> 26:24	<b>riders</b> 26:24	<b>running</b> 58:16
	<b>rise</b> 120:6	<b>rise</b> 120:6	<b>rush</b> 94:21
	<b>rising</b> 121:19	<b>rising</b> 121:19	<b>Ryan</b> 81:17 82:6
	<b>Robby</b> 109:22 113:6 145:22	<b>Robby</b> 109:22 113:6 145:22	



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>S</b>	148:19 150:14 152:10	<b>sign</b> 148:20	<b>something's</b> 43:12 83:17
<b>Sabre</b> 8:8	<b>sense</b> 51:1 70:16 100:24	<b>signatures</b> 126:3	<b>sooner</b> 84:7 96:18
<b>Sadler</b> 150:12,13 151:3,12,16,21	<b>sensors</b> 26:23	<b>significant</b> 162:6	<b>Sorrell</b> 37:12
<b>Safed</b> 91:9	<b>separate</b> 39:18 40:15 41:13 42:24 74:3,10 111:7	<b>signing</b> 14:8	<b>sort</b> 64:16 87:9 114:20
<b>Sai</b> 15:15	<b>separately</b> 41:25 78:18 113:8	<b>similar</b> 82:17 125:23	<b>sought</b> 40:2
<b>salary</b> 47:4 167:13	<b>separation</b> 106:25	<b>simple</b> 23:4	<b>sounds</b> 153:18
<b>sales</b> 50:8 51:5 60:11 70:3	<b>September</b> 17:13 86:8	<b>simplest</b> 115:15	<b>South</b> 129:24
<b>Salle</b> 122:18	<b>serve</b> 50:17 166:4,8 168:14	<b>simply</b> 22:14 23:6 78:18 153:19	<b>Southern</b> 10:14,15
<b>save</b> 141:16	<b>service</b> 36:15 40:18,20 41:15 50:6 144:17 165:2	<b>sincere</b> 103:7	<b>speak</b> 79:17 81:7 83:7 93:14 94:12 98:16 100:15 143:12
<b>saving</b> 66:11	<b>Services</b> 22:17,20 23:2	<b>single</b> 57:23 68:10 69:12 83:19,25 84:2	<b>speaking</b> 34:15 41:24 93:16 158:17
<b>scenario</b> 37:22 39:15 53:13	<b>set</b> 34:7 120:5 148:3	<b>sir</b> 23:10,16 36:8 37:15 65:18 92:11,13 93:25 95:21 98:9 105:14 111:10 133:23 140:3,14 143:14 144:5 145:17 148:16 152:5 158:6	<b>special</b> 13:10 18:13 85:21 117:10
<b>scenarios</b> 50:4 56:4	<b>sets</b> 42:9	<b>sitting</b> 109:12	<b>specials</b> 10:12 127:8
<b>school</b> 99:23 143:19	<b>shake</b> 158:12	<b>sit</b> 83:19	<b>specific</b> 31:15,18 34:7, 11 43:8 50:1 53:2 57:3 58:8 88:7 148:23,25 149:5
<b>seconded</b> 8:23 10:2 11:8 12:25 16:8 18:3 45:6 71:8 74:21 79:5 92:3 93:6 119:20 122:1 124:19,21 128:3 129:7 130:7 132:2 134:3 137:17 139:6 150:6 159:5,21 160:11 161:24 166:18 167:4	<b>Shawn</b> 81:17 88:21	<b>site</b> 128:25	<b>specifically</b> 56:18 81:7 109:25 140:20 142:3
<b>Secretary</b> 14:13 34:5 48:17 49:2,9,17,21 50:25 59:11,12 60:22 61:2,7,18,22 62:2,6,13 63:13,19 64:18 66:5 128:3 165:13 166:1,2, 17,25 167:5,8,19	<b>sheet</b> 47:5	<b>situation</b> 34:1 35:11 57:24 87:24 103:23 104:19	<b>speed</b> 65:23 83:16 84:9,11
<b>Section</b> 28:20	<b>Shell</b> 130:25 131:4,7, 10,13,16,19 134:17	<b>size</b> 37:7 42:14	<b>spoke</b> 137:10 156:24
<b>sector</b> 53:22 55:25 63:25	<b>sheriff</b> 143:20	<b>Slone</b> 10:2 16:7 19:19 51:14,15,22,25 62:18, 19 63:4 93:6 119:21 124:21 128:4 130:8 167:4	<b>spoken</b> 85:15
<b>seeking</b> 59:18 95:5	<b>Shield</b> 138:3 140:16,22	<b>small</b> 43:5 145:21 163:10	<b>St</b> 17:2 21:17 47:13,14 130:24 131:2,3,5,6,8,9, 11,13,14,16,17,18,20 133:6
<b>seminar</b> 64:19	<b>shop</b> 70:4	<b>smaller</b> 40:15	<b>staff</b> 13:20 14:3 23:25 26:13 29:15 32:10 33:8 66:6 82:16 133:10 137:10 138:7 142:3
<b>Senator</b> 45:10,12 46:8 76:24 105:23	<b>shortened</b> 123:17,19	<b>Smiley</b> 66:4	<b>stand</b> 81:24
<b>send</b> 23:25 52:18 56:25 84:17 123:25 142:5	<b>show</b> 61:17 123:11 137:12 138:17 142:7 146:21	<b>software</b> 55:6	<b>standard</b> 31:11 120:16
	<b>Shree</b> 15:16	<b>Solar</b> 127:20,22	<b>standpoint</b> 67:1 69:19 103:7
	<b>Shreveport</b> 12:10 13:14 141:23 143:20 150:1 156:9,20 168:20, 23	<b>sold</b> 18:22	<b>start</b> 66:14 108:22
	<b>shut</b> 86:11	<b>sole</b> 41:14	
	<b>sic</b> 91:9 118:19	<b>solely</b> 156:4,13	
	<b>side</b> 57:12 58:23 64:3 70:7		



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>started</b> 41:5 42:20 145:21	<b>subjective</b> 57:19,20,22 58:9,19	<hr/> <b>T</b> <hr/>	<b>telling</b> 24:1 56:1 165:11
<b>starts</b> 42:9	<b>submit</b> 34:10 39:17 42:5 60:25 102:21		<b>temperature</b> 26:22
<b>state</b> 36:14 44:13 47:6 60:4,6,15 68:5 69:22 70:1 87:17 95:24 96:1, 21 99:14 103:5,12 106:1,6 108:23 109:10 168:5	<b>submitted</b> 39:19 41:17 42:6,13,19,21,24 53:14 77:21 120:8,10 166:21		<b>term</b> 16:20,24 17:4,8,12 36:19 41:15 50:9 51:2 166:14
<b>state's</b> 67:17 68:5 96:7	<b>subsidies</b> 31:6		<b>Terminal</b> 22:17,20 23:2
<b>statement</b> 29:24 48:7 49:15 52:14 53:3 60:3 61:16 63:20 94:1,3 95:21 142:18 168:4	<b>subsidy</b> 31:4 53:15 56:14 58:14,15 59:19		<b>termination</b> 16:17 17:18,23
<b>statements</b> 61:13	<b>substantive</b> 43:6		<b>terms</b> 35:8,9 43:12 98:18 99:15 120:12 139:1
<b>states</b> 10:15,16 50:23	<b>substitute</b> 117:17 155:7,24 158:23		<b>testifying</b> 59:9
<b>statistics</b> 168:8	<b>subtract</b> 56:5 57:12		<b>Thibodeaux</b> 52:17
<b>status</b> 43:15	<b>succeeding</b> 166:8		<b>thing</b> 43:13 53:24 92:1 146:6 154:8,9 158:7 162:3,22 164:19 165:12
<b>Statute</b> 166:4	<b>succinctly</b> 34:10		<b>things</b> 26:23 40:25 55:12 66:9,15,21 69:18 78:12 84:9,10,12 96:9, 23 99:6 104:23 105:2 138:25 146:20 154:4
<b>stay</b> 160:19 166:13	<b>Sugar</b> 47:13		<b>think's</b> 162:3
<b>steel</b> 26:23	<b>suggest</b> 77:7 78:16 93:25 117:8 155:18		<b>thinks</b> 124:3
<b>step</b> 22:21 30:19 39:7 65:18 75:18 81:9 93:13 105:17 114:16 123:1 150:11 164:22	<b>suggestion</b> 20:21,23 109:18,22 114:21		<b>Thirty-four</b> 73:24 74:1
<b>steps</b> 104:21 143:4	<b>suggestions</b> 115:11		<b>thought</b> 76:5 77:19 92:13,17,20 93:19 98:17 99:4,8 145:3
<b>Stirling</b> 17:1	<b>summary</b> 47:5 165:16, 24		<b>thoughts</b> 165:4
<b>stop</b> 97:17	<b>Summit</b> 16:18		<b>Thursday</b> 143:17
<b>stores</b> 70:5	<b>supplemental</b> 102:21		<b>till</b> 65:23 125:1
<b>straight</b> 67:23 86:17	<b>supply</b> 56:17		<b>Timber</b> 8:10
<b>streamed</b> 94:13	<b>support</b> 49:12 63:10 138:16,17 144:11,21,23 168:20		<b>time</b> 28:15 29:21 30:8 35:5,11 40:24 42:2 45:16,25 50:11 69:9,14 70:14 74:9 83:21 85:16 86:9 87:8 89:14 96:12 97:8,17 103:10 105:6 116:4 117:6 120:24 138:24 151:4,9 154:2 155:13 156:16 160:18, 19 161:21
<b>streams</b> 60:10	<b>supported</b> 146:10		<b>timeframe</b> 65:24 86:16 147:19 154:14 162:24
<b>Street</b> 12:9 13:14	<b>supporting</b> 60:12 61:3		
<b>strike</b> 117:2 158:24	<b>supposed</b> 48:8 83:9 92:14,21 93:22 104:3 106:2 111:7 120:7,10		
<b>strongly</b> 117:8	<b>surprise</b> 20:24		
<b>stubborn</b> 155:3	<b>sympathetic</b> 153:7		
<b>stuff</b> 148:19	<b>Systems</b> 8:9 75:12,17 80:2		
<b>subject</b> 33:11 35:21 47:23 144:18		<b>table</b> 36:1 46:7 99:17 112:13 146:9 164:22	
		<b>tables</b> 68:1,21	
		<b>takes</b> 69:14 90:25 154:2	
		<b>taking</b> 55:24 64:6 92:14,20 93:20,22 97:8 104:21	
		<b>talk</b> 28:11 104:15	
		<b>talked</b> 59:22 62:22	
		<b>talking</b> 70:6 97:20 110:1 113:5	
		<b>Tam</b> 112:19	
		<b>Tammany</b> 17:2	
		<b>Tanger</b> 70:4	
		<b>Tangipahoa</b> 80:5,7 121:15 133:12,15	
		<b>tax</b> 11:22 12:4,18 20:11 26:19,20 27:18 40:19 49:12 50:8,10 51:5 58:17 60:8,9,10,11 62:11 63:24 65:9 66:25 67:25 69:13 70:1,2,3 71:19 82:2 83:14 85:1, 19 86:21 102:14,18,22 103:4 105:3 106:10,13 107:9 109:7 116:6 129:23	
		<b>taxable</b> 42:2	
		<b>Taxation</b> 164:25	
		<b>taxed</b> 29:25 30:1	
		<b>taxes</b> 53:22 60:11	
		<b>taxing</b> 69:12 95:9 97:14,17	
		<b>TCI</b> 8:11	
		<b>teach</b> 104:2	
		<b>teachers</b> 100:4 101:10	
		<b>Technology</b> 167:24	



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX

<b>timeline</b> 37:8 151:8	<b>two-year</b> 41:4 109:20 110:19 112:7 117:25 118:1,10 120:14 126:21	122:16 125:7,8 127:6, 11	<b>watch</b> 83:19 100:6
<b>timely</b> 39:13 66:15 72:1 99:16 103:22 104:12	<b>tying</b> 69:4		<b>Waxes</b> 141:23
<b>times</b> 62:21 116:18,24	<b>typically</b> 50:11 86:8 98:20	<b>V</b>	<b>ways</b> 53:4
<b>timing</b> 28:10 30:25 37:8 43:8	<b>typographical</b> 14:7		<b>web</b> 94:13
<b>Tin</b> 47:14		<b>valid</b> 34:24	<b>weeks</b> 54:12 115:18
<b>title</b> 103:18	<b>U</b>	<b>valorem</b> 56:13 107:9	<b>Wellhead</b> 141:20 149:25 157:20,25 159:19
<b>today</b> 20:25 22:20 35:19 37:9 46:1,5 50:13 54:14 56:24,25 59:9 60:16 64:11 66:11 68:20 83:15 87:18 94:7 104:7 138:14,25 142:19 147:5,24,25 148:1 167:17	<b>Uh-huh</b> 157:2	<b>valves</b> 26:23	<b>West</b> 125:10
<b>today's</b> 61:11	<b>ultimate</b> 67:16,17	<b>Vantage</b> 15:19	<b>Westlake</b> 127:22,24
<b>told</b> 99:21,22 146:9	<b>unanimously</b> 136:25	<b>varies</b> 30:8	<b>Westrock</b> 73:6,11,17
<b>top</b> 101:6	<b>unaware</b> 89:13	<b>Ventures</b> 15:10	<b>Williams</b> 18:3 130:7
<b>total</b> 12:12 48:18 81:18 82:7 91:5,15,17,18 110:1 111:19 113:21 119:12,14	<b>understand</b> 33:21 59:8 79:8 95:21 110:4,5 120:22 142:17 151:8 152:23 153:24	<b>verification</b> 33:12	<b>Wilson</b> 10:3 12:25 79:5 122:1 129:7 134:3 137:17 143:9,12,13 144:9,14,24 145:9 151:25 152:3,4 154:25 155:6,11,20 157:19,24 158:5,16 159:2,5,21 161:25 162:4 164:4 166:15,23 167:2
<b>totality</b> 39:25	<b>understanding</b> 59:3 64:22 88:24	<b>verified</b> 138:7 140:1	<b>Windham</b> 8:12,17,21 9:2,6,9,17,21,25 10:6,9, 22 11:3,6,12,15,19,25 12:15,20,23 13:4,7 14:1,9,16,19,24 15:5,21 16:1,5,11,14 17:15,21 18:1,7,10,18,24 19:4,9, 14,17,23 20:1,5,9,14,19 21:11,19,24 22:4,18 23:21 24:6,11 25:8,16, 23 27:20 28:4 29:4,14 30:12,16 32:16,24 34:2, 20 35:13 36:5,22 37:3, 10,16,20 38:10,22 39:1, 5 40:3,21 41:18 42:11, 17 44:3,7,18 45:1,5,11, 15 46:6,11,14,22 47:1, 8,16,21 48:3,15 51:13, 24 52:5 54:1,7,18,23 55:2,8,13,18,23 56:16, 23 57:5,10,15 59:10 60:21 62:17 63:2,6,11 65:1,17,25 67:10,15,20 68:3,9,14,23 69:15 70:17,23 71:2,6,11,14, 22 72:6,10,14,18,23
<b>totally</b> 77:2 101:17 109:8	<b>undertaken</b> 60:6	<b>version</b> 58:22	
<b>tour</b> 168:25	<b>undertaking</b> 59:21	<b>versus</b> 76:13 112:21	
<b>town</b> 94:24	<b>underway</b> 168:13	<b>vice</b> 166:6,19	
<b>tracking</b> 167:22	<b>unformalized</b> 146:15	<b>view</b> 33:5 51:7 154:22	
<b>transfer</b> 130:3,6 134:23	<b>unit</b> 25:17 26:23,25 41:1,6	<b>violating</b> 106:21	
<b>transfers</b> 129:24 130:23 131:23	<b>units</b> 25:20,24	<b>violation</b> 31:24 32:8 148:3	
<b>transparent</b> 52:24	<b>University</b> 15:18	<b>visit</b> 94:22 95:8 97:13, 16	
<b>treated</b> 120:9	<b>unlike</b> 78:19	<b>volume</b> 37:4	
<b>true</b> 165:9	<b>update</b> 157:9	<b>vote</b> 92:14,20 93:10,20, 22 98:2 102:2 108:10 152:23,24 158:20	
<b>truth</b> 96:24	<b>updated</b> 143:17		
<b>Tucker</b> 12:11	<b>USA</b> 91:18 111:23 119:14	<b>W</b>	
<b>turn</b> 153:8 155:22	<b>Usef</b> 118:19	<b>wage</b> 50:4	
<b>turnover</b> 82:13	<b>Usie</b> 71:18,24 72:4,8, 12,16 73:8,23 75:10 79:18,19,21,22 80:1 91:11,13,16 113:15,17, 18,23 118:20,21,23,25 119:13 121:12,13	<b>wait</b> 41:5 90:10 153:15 160:13	
		<b>waiting</b> 123:5,10,24	
		<b>Walker</b> 28:17 38:21	
		<b>wanted</b> 31:14 82:9 96:22 112:20 162:22 165:1,5,23	
		<b>Washington</b> 168:9	



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

**Baton Rouge, LA**  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

**New Orleans, LA**  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX



73:10,18 74:17 75:1,4, 7,15,23 76:11,17,21 78:5,9,25 79:4,10,14, 20,24 80:15,19,23 81:1, 4,13,20 83:5,24 84:3, 15,20 85:2,6,13,24 87:11,20,25 88:4,11,16 89:17 90:6,12 91:3,8, 12,22 92:2,6,9,16,22 93:4,12 94:11 95:15 97:15,22 98:5,8 100:16, 20 101:11,21 102:1,24 105:13 107:12,15 108:2,8,12,15,18 109:3, 9,14,24 110:14 111:1, 11,18,22 112:1,11,16, 23 113:3,12,16,20 114:7,14 115:7,10 116:14 117:13,18,21,24 118:4,7,12,18,22 119:11,17,24 120:25 121:4,7,10,17,24 122:4, 7,11,14,23 123:15,20 124:5,18,25 125:5,14, 19 126:6,11,17,20,24 127:2,9,15,25 128:8,12, 15,18 129:4,11,14,17, 20 130:4,11,14,17,20 131:21 132:1,6,9,12,15 133:17,24 134:8,22 135:2,5,8,11,17 136:3, 10,14,18 137:9,21 138:5,10 139:2,9,12,15 140:11,15,19 141:4,7, 10,13 142:1,12,16,24 143:11 144:1,13 146:5, 16,22 147:2,10 148:12, 17 149:15,20 150:2,9, 23 152:2,13,17 153:4 155:9,14 156:22 157:3, 7,12,17,22 158:3,11,18 159:4,12,16,24 160:2,9, 23 161:4,22 162:12,15, 18,25 163:4,22 164:2,8, 11,14,17 165:10,15,21 167:3,11	<b>worded</b> 120:13 <b>words</b> 35:20 77:6 83:18 90:1 <b>work</b> 45:23 83:4,16 125:18 155:13 167:17 168:9,23 <b>worked</b> 144:19 <b>working</b> 36:16 69:4 76:8 89:4 151:17 157:15 <b>worse</b> 45:14 <b>worth</b> 53:2 77:15 <b>worthy</b> 161:12 <b>wow</b> 37:23 101:8 <b>writing</b> 160:18 <b>written</b> 160:17	<b>young</b> 99:17
		<hr/> <b>Z</b> <hr/>
		<b>Zell</b> 151:4,5 <b>Zone</b> 15:1,24 16:3 17:23 20:4
	<hr/> <b>Y</b> <hr/>	
	<b>y'all</b> 24:2 26:13 59:7 94:25 113:11 136:1 138:1 156:24 165:11 167:17 <b>year</b> 40:19 41:4 43:17 65:13 68:21 69:10 78:24 83:2,23,25 84:2 86:22 90:19 98:19 100:5 101:7,14 104:11 110:18,21,23,24 112:2 115:1,2,3,15,21,23 116:8 119:20 120:17 124:2 125:24 140:6 166:5 <b>years</b> 37:5 40:1 41:4 50:13 77:6 82:17,19,20, 21 90:2,3,11,21,22,25 95:13 101:17 102:17, 18,22,23 103:19 109:16 110:22 111:3 114:9 115:4,19,22,24 116:5,7 120:17 126:10 165:1 <b>yesterday</b> 168:19 <b>you-all</b> 71:21 98:15 100:14	
<b>wishes</b> 97:11 147:4 <b>withdraw</b> 39:11 <b>Wood</b> 129:24 130:3 <b>word</b> 96:7		



**TORRES REPORTING & ASSOCIATES, INC.**

COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION SERVICES

[www.torresreporting.com](http://www.torresreporting.com)

1.866.982.6878 Toll Free

Baton Rouge, LA  
225.751.0732  
225.752.7308 FAX

New Orleans, LA  
504.392.4791  
504.392.4852 FAX